

# Drafting Legislation

Art and Technology of Rules  
for Regulation

Helen Xanthaki



• H A R T •  
PUBLISHING

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON

2014

# Table of Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i> .....	xiii
<i>Table of Legislation</i> .....	xxi

1. Legislation as a Means of Regulation: Effectiveness in Legislative Drafting.....	1
Introduction .....	1
The Nature of Rules for Regulation: Art or Technology?.....	10
The Universality of Rules for Regulation .....	16
Compilations of Rules for Regulation: Homogeneity versus Rigidity? .....	19
Conclusions.....	20
2. Drafting Instructions .....	21
What are Drafting Instructions? .....	22
Purposes of Drafting Instructions .....	24
The Four Principles of Drafting Instructions .....	27
What is the Content of Drafting Instructions? .....	29
Quality of Legislative Instructions.....	32
Style of Drafting Instructions .....	34
Conclusions: a Checklist for Quality Drafting Instructions .....	35
To Sum Up: Checklist for Legislative Instructions .....	36
3. The Legislative Plan: Designing a Legislative Solution .....	38
Designing a Legislative Solution: What is it? .....	39
The Advantages of Compiling a Legislative Plan.....	41
The Elements of Analysis in the Legislative Plan.....	44
Analysis of the Existing Law .....	44
Analysis of the Necessity of Legislation as a Solution to the Identified Social Need.....	46
Analysis of Potential Danger Areas.....	48
Analysis of the Policy Options and the Preferred Legislative Solution.....	51
Analysis of the Projected Interpretation of the Legislation.....	57
Initial Considerations of Structure: Thring's Five 'Golden Rules' ..	59
Conclusions .....	60
4. Structure of a Bill.....	61
The Theory: Lord Thring's Five Rules of Drafting Revisited .....	62
More Doctrine: Bergeron's Rules.....	65
The Practice: Thornton's Approach.....	66
Structure in Brief: the Traditional Style .....	67

Structure in Brief: Innovation .....	68
Arrangements in Parts .....	71
Headings .....	73
Sections .....	74
Marginal Notes .....	74
Marginal References.....	76
Table of Arrangements or Arrangement of Sections .....	76
Real Innovation: the Layered Approach.....	76
An Example of the Layered Approach in Action: The Succession to Crown Act 2013 (UK).....	79
5. Clarity, Precision, Unambiguity and the Legislative Sentence .....	85
The Basics .....	85
Ambiguity and Vagueness.....	88
Semantic Ambiguity .....	92
Common Problems with Small Words: May, Shall, And/Or .....	92
Unless—Except .....	94
Scale Indicators.....	95
Terms Conveying Ranges of Numbers, Days, Dates and Ages... ..	95
That and Which.....	96
Serial Commas and Ambiguity .....	98
Syntactic Ambiguity or Ambiguity at the Sentence Level.....	98
The Placement Problem .....	99
Modifiers of Nouns .....	100
Punctuation: Thornton’s Four Rules of Punctuation .....	102
Gender-Neutral Drafting (gnd).....	103
6. Plain Language .....	108
What is Plain Language? .....	108
Plain Language Aspect 1: Knowing your Audience .....	113
Plain Language Aspect 2: Easy Communication.....	116
Common Problems of Legislative Texts.....	117
Best Practices for an Easy Communication: Plain Language Innovations.....	123
The Debate: Concerns with Plain Language.....	125
Concern 1: Plain Language Lowers the Standards of Good Writing .....	125
Concern 2: Intelligibility .....	126
Concern 3: Plain Language Can only be Achieved if Certainty is Sacrificed.....	127
Concern 4: Plain Language Leads to a Loss of Established Meanings of Words Settled over Centuries of Judicial Interpretation.....	129
The Way Forward .....	130

7. Preliminary Provisions .....	132
The Structure of an Act.....	133
Preliminary Provisions: A Plain Language Approach.....	133
The Introductory Text (Formerly Known as Long Title) .....	139
Enacting Clause.....	141
Start Date (Formerly Known as Commencement) .....	143
Application Provisions.....	147
Innovations for the Future.....	147
8. Principal Provisions: the National, EU and International Dimension .....	149
Principal Provisions.....	149
Substantive Provisions.....	151
Administrative Agency Provisions .....	152
The EU Dimension: National Implementing Measures.....	152
The Choice of Form.....	154
The Choice of Language, Syntax and Structure.....	164
Summing up.....	168
The International Dimension: Implementing International Agreements.....	169
Innovation.....	174
9. Final Provisions .....	176
Saving Provisions.....	176
Transitional Provisions.....	179
Repeals and Consequential Amendments .....	182
Purpose Clause/Objectives.....	185
Commencement/Duration Provisions or Start/End Date.....	188
Short Title .....	190
Schedules.....	191
Schedule of Definitions.....	194
Other Schedules.....	196
10. Comparative Legislative Drafting .....	199
The Clichés.....	201
Statutory Interpretation.....	202
Rules of Interpretation and Construction in the Common Law: Ilbert's Rules .....	202
Rules of Interpretation and Construction in the Civil Law World.....	204
The End of the Cold War in (Statutory) Interpretation.....	204
Stare Decisis.....	205
Drafting Rules and Conventions .....	207
Conclusions.....	211

11. Time in Legislation .....	213
Prospective Provisions .....	214
Legalising Provisions .....	215
Retrospective Legislation.....	219
Retroactive Provisions .....	220
The Drafter and Legalising Provisions.....	220
12. Amending Provisions .....	223
Initial Considerations .....	224
Express and Implied Amendment .....	225
Direct and Indirect Amendment .....	226
Drafting Techniques for Direct Textual Amendments .....	231
Indirect Amendments.....	235
Amalgamating Indirect Referential Amendment with Direct Textual Amendment.....	238
Consequential Amendments .....	239
Implied Repeals.....	240
13. Penal Provisions.....	242
Drafting Instructions: Initial Considerations .....	243
The Legislative Plan .....	244
The Parts of a Penal Provisions .....	246
Rules of Construction .....	247
General Rules and Innovation .....	247
Expressing the Conduct.....	248
Sanctions .....	249
Special Circumstances .....	250
Defences .....	252
Special Considerations.....	253
14. Delegated Legislation.....	257
What is Delegated Legislation?.....	257
The Role of the Drafter in Delegated Legislation .....	260
Use of Delegated Legislation .....	262
Validity of Delegated Legislation.....	267
Construction .....	269
15. Drafting for Consolidation v Drafting for Codification .....	276
Codification .....	278
Consolidation.....	281
Codification versus Consolidation.....	284
Diverse Models and the EU.....	287
16. Taxation Legislation .....	290
Understanding Drafting Instructions: Initial Considerations for the Drafter.....	290

Analysing the Proposal.....	291
Designing the Law.....	292
Initial Design.....	298
Drafting.....	299
Verification.....	302
Use of Code.....	303
17. Extra-territorial Legislation.....	304
The Theory of Extra-territoriality: Realism, Liberalism and Beyond .....	306
Extra-territoriality in Practice.....	310
Blocking Legislation .....	314
Alternatives to Blocking Legislation .....	316
The Rules on Extra-territorial Legislation .....	317
18. Statutory Interpretation and Legislative Drafting.....	318
Current Techniques of Statutory Interpretation in the UK.....	320
The Drafters' Duty .....	327
Presumptions.....	328
Maxims .....	330
Drafting and Statutory Interpretation.....	330
19. Quality of Legislation Post-Lisbon and the Role of Parliaments .....	333
The EU's Regulatory Framework for Legislative Quality .....	333
The Post-Lisbon Smart Regulation Initiative .....	338
The UK Approach to Regulatory Quality.....	347
Modern Parliaments and Legislative Quality.....	351
20. Legislative Education and Training.....	354
Education and Training.....	354
Training versus Mentoring on the Job.....	358
Clinical Education and Training in Legislative Drafting.....	361
National versus Universal Training for Drafters.....	362
Conclusions.....	364
<i>Index</i> .....	366