

The Law and Politics of International Regime Conflict

DIRK PULKOWSKI

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

I. DIMENSIONS OF REGIME CONFLICT

1. Culture is One Thing and Varnish is Another	3
I. Introduction	3
II. Regulating Trade in Cultural Products	6
A. A definition of culture	6
B. International legal rules	8
III. Regime Conflict and the Fragmentation of International Law	15
IV. The Plan of this Book	19
2. Regime Conflict as Goal Conflict	21
I. Introduction	21
II. Toward a Hierarchy of Goal-specific Regimes	22
A. Anthropological approaches to legal plurality	22
B. Paradigms of international organization	27
1. The 'Westphalian' paradigm of coexistence	27
2. The hierarchical paradigm	31
3. The heterarchical paradigm	35
4. Regime conflict as legal pluralism	40
III. Goal Conflicts Arising from Trade in Cultural Products	42
A. Commodity flows: the case for free trade	47
1. Cultural products as marketable commodities	47
2. The challenge of market failures	48
3. Avoiding unnecessary social costs of cultural regulation	53
4. Trade in cultural products in the WTO system	57
B. Communication flows: the case for cultural identity politics	59
1. Identity construction as a starting point	60
2. The emancipatory cultural identity justification	62
3. The conservationist cultural identity justification	68
4. Development and the north-south divide	70
5. Cultural identity politics in the CDC	75
IV. Conclusion	76
3. Regime Conflict as Institutional Conflict and Power Struggle	79
I. Introduction	79
II. The Politics of Regime Formation and Regime Interaction	81

A. Theory of international regimes	81
B. Strategic action and communicative action in international relations	90
1. Strategic action and regime formation	93
2. Communicative action and regime operation	99
III. Regime Shifting and Regime Conflict: Trade and Culture	106
A. Regime shifting	106
1. Culture in the trade forum: 1920–1962	106
2. Towards the ‘New World Information and Communication Order’: 1958–1987	111
3. Back to the trade forum: 1986–1994	116
4. The countermovement in the UNESCO: 1995–2005	122
B. Regime overlap and regime conflict	132
1. From regime formation to regime interaction	133
2. Compatibility of principles	136
3. Compatibility of norms	138
4. Compatibility of rules	141
IV. Conclusion	142
4. Regime Conflict as Conflict among Legal Rules	144
I. Introduction	144
II. A Theory of Conflict of Rules	145
A. Definition of rule conflict	145
B. Conflict of rules in the practice of international adjudication	153
C. Categories of rules: Hohfeldian opposites and correlatives	159
III. Conflict Scenarios Relating to Trade in Cultural Products	161
A. Financial support of cultural industries	162
1. State aid for cultural goods under the CDC	162
2. State aid for cultural goods under the WTO law	166
3. State aid for cultural goods from a human rights perspective	172
B. Other conflict scenarios	176
IV. Conclusion	186
 II. MANAGEMENT OF REGIME CONFLICT 	
5. The (Ir)relevance of International Law for Conflict Management	191
I. Introduction	191
II. Pluralist Challenges to the Relevance of International Law	192
A. Pluralist concepts of international law	192
B. Variations within legal pluralism	195
1. George Scelle’s <i>communautés internationales particulières</i>	195
2. Willem Riphagen’s <i>notion of regime multiplicity</i>	197
3. Gunther Teubner’s <i>concept of competing rationality systems</i>	199
4. Nico Krisch’s <i>postnational pluralism</i>	202
III. Legal Conflict Management within a Unitary International Legal Order	203
A. Unity of international law as a matter of degree	204
1. ‘Minimal systematicity’ versus ‘unity of the international legal order’	204

2. Unity of the legal order as a validity condition for norms	207
3. Unity as a substantive principle of law	212
4. Unity as an epistemological postulate	213
B. Variations within the unitary approach	220
1. Joost Pauwelyn's 'Conflict of Norms in Public International Law'	220
2. The perspective of the International Law Commission (ILC)	223
3. Pierre-Marie Dupuy's <i>unité de l'ordre juridique international</i>	228
4. Bruno Simma's analysis of community interest in international law	230
IV. Conclusion	234
6. From Legal Unity to Communicative Compatibility	238
I. Introduction	238
II. International Law as a Regime-transcendent Grammar	240
A. Law as a 'special case' of communicative action	240
1. Doctrinal borrowing in the event of comparable legal concepts	244
2. Recourse to general international law	246
3. Common rules of treaty interpretation	248
B. The 'special weight' of arguments from coherence	250
III. Shared Background Assumptions of International Relations	255
A. The common lifeworld as a precondition of communicative action	258
1. The 'international society' as a lifeworld substitute?	260
2. Human rights as a lifeworld substitute?	262
B. Basic legal concepts as shared pre-understandings of the international system	264
IV. Conclusion	270
7. Conflict Management through Legal Interpretation	272
I. Introduction	272
II. A Theory of Harmonizing Interpretation	273
A. Understanding versus justification	275
1. Interpretation as understanding of meaning	276
2. Interpretation as justification of claims to rightness	281
B. Interpretation of one rule 'in light of' another rule	283
1. Article 31(1) of the Vienna Convention	284
2. Article 31(3)(c) of the Vienna Convention	287
3. General principle of harmonizing interpretation	293
4. Principle of default deference	294
III. Accommodating the Trade Regime, the Culture Regime, and Human Rights	298
A. The scope for manoeuvre under the different regimes	298
1. WTO rules amenable to a culture-conscious interpretation	298
2. CDC rules amenable to a trade-conscious interpretation	303
B. Advancing concurrently the goals of the different regimes	304
1. Cultural liberty as the key goal of the CDC	305
2. Cultural liberty as a goal of the human rights regime	312
3. Cultural liberty as a goal that is consistent with free trade principles	315

IV. Conclusion	316
8. Conflict Management through Priority Rules	318
I. Introduction	318
II. A Typology of Priority Rules	319
A. Express conflict clauses	319
1. Priority of the treaty	319
2. Priority of the other treaty	319
3. Priority of the treaty that grants greater protection	321
4. Non-subordination clauses	321
B. The <i>lex specialis</i> and <i>lex posterior maxims</i>	322
1. <i>Lex posterior</i>	323
2. <i>Lex specialis</i>	324
3. Significance of the 'same subject matter test'	326
C. Conflict of laws analogies	329
1. Regime conflict as 'horizontal jurisdictional conflict'	329
2. The principle of comparative impairment	331
3. A comparative impairment test for adjudicating regime conflict	334
III. Conflicts between the Trade Regime, the Culture Regime, and Human Rights	335
A. Conflict clauses of the CDC	335
1. Article 2(1) of the CDC	335
2. Article 20 of the CDC	336
B. Remaining conflict situations	341
IV. Conclusion	343
<i>German Summary</i>	346
<i>Bibliography</i>	349
<i>Index</i>	373