

Stéphanie Chuffart-Finsterwald

Optimizing Environmental
Technology Diffusion under
Intellectual Property
Constraints: a Legal Analysis

with a foreword from Professor
Philippe Ducor

Table of Contents

| | |
|-----------------------------|----|
| List of Abbreviations | 13 |
| Introduction | 19 |

I The Conceptual Foundations

| | | |
|------------------|--|-----------|
| Chapter 1 | Framing the Issue | 29 |
| 1.1 | <i>The Interests at Stake</i> | 29 |
| 1.2 | <i>Environmental Technology as a Legal Object</i> | 40 |
| 1.3 | <i>Environmental Technology Diffusion</i> | 46 |
| 1.3.1 | Historical Background and Current Definitions | 48 |
| 1.3.2 | Levels of Environmental Technology Diffusion | 51 |
| Chapter 2 | Intellectual Property Rights and Environmental Technologies | 55 |
| 2.1 | <i>The Dual Role of Intellectual Property Rights</i> | 56 |
| 2.1.1 | Intellectual Property Rights as Incentives to Innovation and Diffusion | 57 |
| 2.1.2 | Intellectual Property Rights as Legal and Financial Barriers to the Diffusion of Environmental Technology..... | 62 |
| 2.2 | <i>Identifying Relevant Intellectual Property Rights</i> | 66 |
| 2.2.1 | Patents | 67 |
| 2.2.2 | Protection against Unfair Competition and the Case of Trade Secrets | 69 |
| 2.2.3 | The Specific Intellectual Property Regime Applicable to Genetic Resources and Plant Varieties | 72 |
| 2.2.3.1 | Patents and Trade Secrets | 73 |
| 2.2.3.2 | Plant Variety Protection under the UPOV Regime | 74 |
| 2.2.3.3 | Other <i>Sui Generis</i> Systems | 77 |

| | | |
|------------------|---|------------|
| 2.3 | <i>A Brief Presentation of Selected Intellectual Property Rights Agreements</i> | 78 |
| 2.3.1 | The Paris Convention for the Protection of Industrial Property | 78 |
| 2.3.2 | The Patent Cooperation and Patent Law Treaties | 80 |
| 2.3.3 | The TRIPS Agreement | 83 |
| Chapter 3 | The Argument: An Overview | 87 |
| 3.1 | <i>A Focus on Intellectual Property-Specific Approaches</i> | 89 |
| 3.2 | <i>Trade-Related Incentives for Environmental Technology Diffusion</i> | 91 |
| 3.2.1 | Diffusion through Patent Licensing and Opportunities under Emerging Patent Markets | 92 |
| 3.2.2 | Environmental Goods and Services Negotiations at the WTO | 95 |
| 3.3 | <i>Incentive Mechanisms in Multilateral Environmental Agreements</i> | 97 |
| 3.3.1 | Five MEA Approaches to Enhance Environmental Technology Diffusion | 98 |
| 3.3.1.1 | Funds Incentives | 99 |
| 3.3.1.2 | The Clean Development Mechanism | 101 |
| 3.3.1.3 | The Technology Mechanism | 102 |
| 3.3.1.4 | Incentives by PPPs | 102 |
| 3.3.1.5 | The Convention on Biological Diversity's Hybrid Approach | 103 |
| 3.3.2 | Thinking Forward: Patent Pooling and Patent Commons under MEAs | 105 |
| 3.4 | <i>Diffusion Incentive by Means of Exceptional Regimes and Limitations of Intellectual Property Regimes</i> | 107 |
| 3.4.1 | Fast-Tracking of Environmental Patent Applications | 108 |
| 3.4.2 | Compulsory Licensing | 109 |
| 3.4.3 | Human Rights-Related Exceptions | 112 |
| | Assessment | 115 |

II Trade-related Incentives for Environmental Technology Diffusion

| | | |
|------------------|--|------------|
| Chapter 4 | The TRIPS Agreement and Diffusion through Patent Licensing | 119 |
| 4.1 | <i>How Patent Licensing Enhances Environmental Technology Diffusion</i> | 120 |
| 4.1.1 | The Theory | 120 |
| 4.1.2 | Case Studies | 124 |
| 4.2 | <i>The TRIPS Agreement as an Incentive to Innovation and Diffusion of Environmental Technology</i> | 127 |
| 4.2.1 | Objectives and Principles of the TRIPS Agreement | 127 |
| 4.2.1.1 | Article 7: Promotion of Technological Innovation, Transfer, and Dissemination of Technology | 128 |
| 4.2.1.2 | Article 8(1): Principles | 130 |
| 4.2.1.3 | Article 8(2): Abuse of Intellectual Property Rights and Practices which Unreasonably Restrain Trade and the International Transfer of Technology | 133 |
| 4.2.2 | Control of Anti-Competitive Practices in Contractual Licenses | 134 |
| 4.2.3 | Transfer of Technology to LDCs | 139 |
| 4.3 | <i>The Creation of a Patent Market</i> | 143 |
| 4.3.1 | The Emergence of a Patent Market: Patent Pools and Auctions | 144 |
| 4.3.2 | Two Illustrations | 146 |
| 4.3.2.1 | The GreenXchange | 146 |
| 4.3.2.2 | Unit License Rights: The Case of the IPXI | 147 |
| 4.3.3 | Legal Opportunities for Technology Diffusion Presented by a Patent Market: Non-Discriminatory Access to the Technologies and Market Pricing | 149 |
| Chapter 5 | Environmental Goods and Services Negotiations at the WTO | 155 |
| 5.1 | <i>Negotiation History: The Difficulty of Agreeing on Definitions ..</i> | 156 |

| | | |
|------------|---|-----|
| 5.2 | <i>Three Possible Ways Forward and their Impact on Environmental Technology Diffusion</i> | 158 |
| 5.2.1 | Going on with Doha | 158 |
| 5.2.1.1 | The List Approach | 159 |
| 5.2.1.2 | Advantages in Favour of Environmental Technology Diffusion | 163 |
| 5.2.1.3 | Difficulties | 164 |
| 5.2.2 | Moving to an Environmental Goods and Services Agreement | 165 |
| 5.2.2.1 | The Information Technology Agreement Model: A Brief Introduction | 165 |
| 5.2.2.2 | Advantages in Favour of Environmental Technology Diffusion | 166 |
| 5.2.2.3 | Difficulties | 168 |
| 5.2.3 | Moving to a Plurilateral Agreement | 168 |
| 5.2.3.1 | The Agreement on Government Procurement Model: A Brief Introduction | 168 |
| 5.2.3.2 | Advantages in Favour of Environmental Technology Diffusion | 169 |
| 5.2.3.3 | Difficulties | 169 |
| 5.3 | <i>The Future of EGS: An Assessment</i> | 169 |
| Assessment | | 171 |

III Diffusion Incentive Mechanisms in Multilateral Environmental Agreements

| | | |
|------------------|--|------------|
| Chapter 6 | Five Approaches to Enhance Technology Diffusion | 177 |
| 6.1 | <i>Funds Incentives</i> | 179 |
| 6.1.1 | The Multilateral Fund | 180 |
| 6.1.1.1 | Features | 180 |
| 6.1.1.2 | Why The Montreal Approach Worked | 181 |
| 6.1.2 | The Global Environment Facility | 183 |
| 6.1.2.1 | Features and Achievements | 183 |

| | | |
|------------------|---|------------|
| 6.1.2.2 | The UNFCCC: The Global Environment Facility and New Opportunities under the Green Climate Fund | 185 |
| 6.1.3 | The World Heritage Fund and the Ramsar Funds | 186 |
| 6.1.3.1 | Features | 187 |
| 6.1.3.2 | Achievements | 189 |
| 6.2 | <i>Market Incentives: The Clean Development Mechanism</i> | 190 |
| 6.3 | <i>The Technology Mechanism</i> | 192 |
| 6.3.1 | Features | 193 |
| 6.3.2 | Achievements | 195 |
| 6.4 | <i>Incentive by PPPs: From the Danone-Evian Fund for Water under The Ramsar Convention to the World Bank's Green Infrastructure Finance Framework</i> | 196 |
| 6.4.1 | Challenges and Benefits of Environmental PPPs | 198 |
| 6.4.2 | The Projects | 200 |
| 6.4.3 | Achievements and Opportunities | 201 |
| 6.5 | <i>The Convention on Biological Diversity's Hybrid Approach: Capacity Building and Ex-Situ Collections</i> | 203 |
| 6.5.1 | Capacity Building | 205 |
| 6.5.2 | <i>Ex-Situ Collections</i> | 206 |
| Chapter 7 | Thinking Forward: Patent Pooling and Patent Commons in the Framework of MEAs | 211 |
| 7.1 | <i>Some Definitions and Illustrations</i> | 214 |
| 7.1.1 | Patent Pools | 214 |
| 7.1.2 | Patent Commons and the Eco-Patent Commons Illustration | 215 |
| 7.2 | <i>Patent Pools, Patent Commons, and Environmental Technology Diffusion</i> | 218 |
| 7.3 | <i>Advantages of Patent Pooling</i> | 220 |

| | | |
|------------|--|-----|
| 7.4 | <i>Competition Issues and the Access-Control Dilemma: Some of the Legal Challenges Caused by Patent Pools and Commons</i> | 221 |
| 7.4.1 | Patent Pooling and Competition Laws: Legally Manageable Frictions | 222 |
| 7.4.2 | The Access-Control Dilemma and the Solution Provided by the ITGRFA's Multilateral System | 224 |
| 7.5 | <i>An Assessment of the Remaining Options: An Environmental Patent Pool Hosted by the WIPO?</i> | 226 |
| Assessment | | 230 |

IV Diffusion Incentives by Means of Exceptional Legal Treatments and Limitations of Intellectual Property Regimes

| | | |
|------------------|---|------------|
| Chapter 8 | Fast-Tracking of Environmental Patent Applications | 237 |
| 8.1 | <i>Fast-Tracking Programmes: An Incentive to both Innovation and Diffusion</i> | 237 |
| 8.2 | <i>The Rise of Fast-Tracking Programmes for Environmental Patent Applications</i> | 239 |
| 8.2.1 | Overview of the Existing Fast-Tracking Programmes | 240 |
| 8.2.2 | Empirical Results | 245 |
| 8.3 | <i>Mapping an International Regime for the Fast-Tracking of Environmental Patent Applications</i> | 248 |
| 8.3.1 | Eligibility Rules | 250 |
| 8.3.2 | The Application Process | 252 |
| Chapter 9 | Compulsory Licensing | 255 |
| 9.1 | <i>The TRIPS Agreement Regime</i> | 258 |
| 9.1.1 | Conditions for the Granting of Compulsory Licenses | 259 |
| 9.1.2 | Legal Grounds for Compulsory Licensing | 268 |
| 9.1.3 | The Lack of Manufacturing Capacity in Pharmaceuticals Amendment | 272 |

| | | |
|-------------------|--|------------|
| 9.2 | <i>Positive and Negative Effects of Compulsory Licensing and Opportunities for Environmental Technology Diffusion</i> | 273 |
| 9.3 | <i>Criteria for the Successful Application of Compulsory Licensing to Environmental Technologies</i> | 278 |
| 9.3.1 | Incentive for Potential Licensees | 279 |
| 9.3.2 | Technical Features of the Technology: Degree of Complexity and Relevance of Know-How | 279 |
| 9.3.3 | Extent of Invention Disclosure in Patent Application | 281 |
| 9.3.4 | State of the Art and Manufacturing Capacities of the Prospective Licensee | 283 |
| 9.3.5 | Criteria Appraisal | 284 |
| Chapter 10 | Human Rights-related Exceptions | 287 |
| 10.1 | <i>Human Rights Threatened by Climate Change and Environmental Degradation: Implementing Human Rights through Environmental Technology Diffusion</i> | 289 |
| 10.1.1 | The Right to Life | 290 |
| 10.1.2 | The Rights to Adequate Food and Water | 293 |
| 10.1.3 | The Right to Health | 296 |
| 10.1.4 | The Right to Self-Determination | 297 |
| 10.1.5 | The Right to Enjoy the Benefits of Scientific Progress | 299 |
| 10.1.6 | Patent Protection as a Human Right: A Valid Approach? | 301 |
| 10.2 | <i>Human Rights Impacts of TRIPS and TRIPS-Plus Obligations</i> | 304 |
| 10.3 | <i>How to Deal with the Conflicts: The TRIPS Flexibilities and General Public International Law Solutions</i> | 310 |
| 10.3.1 | The TRIPS Limitations and Derogations | 310 |
| 10.3.1.1 | <i>Ordre Public</i> and Morality Exclusion | 311 |
| 10.3.1.2 | Exceptions to Rights Conferred | 315 |
| 10.3.1.3 | Other Exclusions: Plants and Animals Other than Micro-Organisms | 318 |
| 10.3.1.4 | Security Exceptions | 320 |

| | | |
|-------------------|---|-----|
| 10.3.1.5 | The Doha Declaration | 321 |
| 10.3.1.6 | Evaluation of the TRIPS Flexibilities | 323 |
| 10.3.2 | Solutions Provided by General Public International Law | 324 |
| 10.3.2.1 | The Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties | 325 |
| 10.3.2.2 | The Law on State Responsibility: The Necessity Defence | 327 |
| Assessment | | 330 |

V A Concluding Assessment

| | | |
|-------------------------------|--|-----|
| Chapter 11 | Transversal Findings | 339 |
| <i>11.1</i> | <i>Optimization in the Presence of Intellectual Property Constraints</i> | 339 |
| 11.1.1 | A Legal Tool Box | 340 |
| 11.1.2 | Institutional Difficulties | 345 |
| <i>11.2</i> | <i>Four Parameters to Identify Best-Suited Diffusion Approach</i> | 349 |
| 11.2.1 | Relevant Actor(s) | 350 |
| 11.2.2 | Types of Technology and Significance of Know-How | 353 |
| 11.2.3 | Time Dimension | 355 |
| 11.2.4 | Technological Situation of the Receiver | 357 |
| <i>11.3</i> | <i>Observations on Non-Intellectual Property-Related Incentives</i> | 358 |
| Concluding Remarks | | 361 |
| Table of Cases | | 363 |
| Table of Treaties | | 365 |
| National Laws | | 367 |
| Selective Bibliography | | 368 |