

# Arbitrators as Lawmakers

Dolores Bentolila



# Table of Contents

About the Author	vii
Foreword	xv
Preface	xix
List of Abbreviations	xxi
Introduction	1
PART I	
The Actors of Arbitral Lawmaking	5
CHAPTER 1	
The Autonomy of International Commercial Arbitration	7
§1.01 The Autonomy of International Commercial Arbitration from the Law of the Seat	9
[A] The Supposed Necessary Application of the Law of the Seat to the Arbitral Procedure	10
[B] The Right to Arbitrate	14
[1] The Law Applicable to Arbitrability	14
[2] The Law Governing the Arbitration Agreement	16
[C] The Binding Effect of the Arbitral Award	18
[1] Enforceability of Stateless Awards	19
[2] The Delocalization of the Validity Requirements of the Arbitral Award	21
§1.02 The Autonomy of International Commercial Arbitration from the Courts of the Seat	23
[A] Control of Arbitral Jurisdiction	23
[1] Competence-Competence	24

Table of Contents

	[2] Declaratory Relief and Injunctions	27
[B]	Assistance with the Arbitral Process	32
	[1] Jurisdiction to Assist with the Arbitral Process	33
	[2] Arbitral Institutionalization and the Constitution of the Arbitral Tribunal	35
[C]	Control of the Arbitral Award	37
	[1] The Limited Review of the Arbitral Award in Set-Aside Proceedings	37
	[2] The Relative Effect of the Decision Setting Aside an Arbitral Award	41
CHAPTER 2		
	The Autonomy of International Investment Arbitration	51
§2.01	The Autonomy of International Investment Arbitration from International Law	53
	[A] The Source of Investment Arbitral Tribunals	54
	[1] Arbitration Based on State Contracts	54
	[2] Arbitration Based on Investment Laws and Treaties	58
	[B] The Law Applicable to the Arbitral Procedure	60
	[1] The <i>Lex Arbitri</i> in Non-ICSID Investment Arbitration	60
	[2] The <i>Lex Arbitri</i> in ICSID Arbitration	62
	[C] The Law Applicable to and the Nature of Investment Disputes	65
	[1] The Diversity of Investment Law Disputes	66
	[2] The Relationship Between International and Domestic Law	69
	[D] The Legal Effects of Investment Arbitral Awards	71
	[1] The Binding Effect of Investment Arbitral Awards	72
	[2] The Enforcement of Investment Arbitral Awards by Domestic Courts	74
§2.02	The Autonomy of International Investment Arbitration from Inter-State Tribunals	74
	[A] The Enforcement of Investment Arbitration by Inter-State Tribunals	76
	[B] The Control of Investment Arbitration by Inter-State Tribunals	79
PART II		
	The Process of Arbitral Lawmaking	81
CHAPTER 3		
	Arbitrators' Freedom in Arbitral Decision-Making	83
§3.01	Arbitral Jurisdiction	83
	[A] Characterization and Choice of Law in Jurisdictional Matters	83
	[1] Commercial Arbitration	83
	[2] Investment Arbitration	85

	[B] Interpretation of Rules of Law Applicable to Jurisdictional Matters	88
	[1] National Law	88
	[2] International Law	89
	[3] Transnational Principles	94
	[C] Interpretation of Consent to Arbitrate	95
§3.02	The Arbitral Procedure	97
	[A] Procedural Powers of International Arbitrators	97
	[B] Interpretation of Procedural Rules	102
	[1] Arbitration Laws	102
	[2] Arbitration Rules	104
	[3] The ICSID Convention and Rules	106
§3.03	The Law Applicable to the Merits	109
	[A] Interpretation of Choice-of-Law Agreements	109
	[1] The Law Applicable to the Choice-of-Law Agreement	111
	[2] The Rules Selected by the Choice-of-Law Agreement	112
	[3] Splitting the Rules Selected by the Choice-of-Law Agreement	115
	[B] Arbitrators' Power to Apply Public Policy and Mandatory Rules	116
	[C] Arbitrators' Power to Select the Applicable Law in the Absence of a Choice by the Parties	122
	[1] Diversity of Rules	122
	[2] Characterization	127
§3.04	Interpretation of Substantive Rules and Instruments	130
	[A] Interpretation of the Law Applicable to the Merits	130
	[1] Interpretation of National Law	130
	[2] Interpretation of International Conventions on Private Law	134
	[3] Interpretation of Rules of Law	136
	[4] Interpretation of International Law	137
	[B] Interpretation of the Contract	141
CHAPTER 4		
	Arbitrators' Constraints in Arbitral Decision-Making	145
§4.01	Social Constraints	145
	[A] The Arbitral Community	146
	[1] The Culture of International Arbitration	146
	[2] The Market of International Arbitrators	150
	[B] Deference to Past Arbitral Decisions	154
	[1] International Arbitration is Capable of Paying Deference to Past Arbitral Decisions	155
	[a] Like Proceedings and Like Disputes	156
	[b] Accessibility of Arbitral Awards	158

## Table of Contents

---

	[c] Reasoned Arbitral Awards	161
	[d] The Power of Arbitral Tribunals to Decide on the Basis of Past Arbitral Decisions	162
	[2] The Authority of Past Arbitral Decisions	163
	[a] The ‘Efficiency’ Rationale for the Authority of Past Arbitral Decisions	166
	[b] The ‘Legitimacy’ Rationale for the Authority of Past Arbitral Decisions	167
	[c] The ‘Communitarian’ Rationale for the Authority of Past Arbitral Decisions	171
	[C] Legitimacy Concerns of a Wider Public	174
	[1] Concerns about the Legitimacy of Investment Arbitration	177
	[2] Transparency, Regulatory Powers of States, and Consistency	178
§4.02	Institutional Constraints	182
	[A] Jurisdictional Control	183
	[1] ICSID Annulment Mechanism	183
	[2] Appeal Mechanisms	187
	[B] Administrative Control	189
	[1] Prima Facie Decisions on the Existence of Jurisdiction	189
	[2] Prospective Scrutiny of the Arbitral Award	190
PART III		
	The Product of Arbitral Lawmaking	195
CHAPTER 5		
	Consistent Arbitral Solutions	197
§5.01	Consistent Arbitral Solutions on Jurisdiction	197
	[A] Canons of Interpretation of the Arbitration Agreement	197
	[B] The Arbitration Provision of an Investment Law	200
§5.02	Consistent Arbitral Solutions on Procedure	203
	[A] Inherent Powers of Arbitrators	203
	[B] Document Production	203
§5.03	Consistent Arbitral Solutions on Applicable Law	206
	[A] Choice-of-Law Methods	206
	[1] Indirect Choice-of-Law Methods	207
	[2] Direct Choice-of-Law Methods	208
	[B] The Interpretation of Article 42(1) of the ICSID Convention	209
§5.04	Consistent Arbitral Solutions on the Merits	210
	[A] Illegality of Contracts of Corruption	210
	[B] The Right to Unilaterally Terminate a Contract	213
	[C] Investment Treaty Protection of Indirect Shareholdings	216
§5.05	Consistent Arbitral Solutions on Remedies	220
	[A] Full Compensation	220

[B]	The Duty to Mitigate Damages	224
[C]	Compound Interest	227
CHAPTER 6		
	The Status of Consistent Arbitral Solutions	231
§6.01	The Normative Effect of Consistent Arbitral Solutions	231
[A]	Norms in the Arbitral Process	231
[1]	Power-Confering Rules That Regulate International Arbitration	231
[2]	Interstitial Norms That Work as Specific <i>Topoi</i> in Legal Reasoning	233
[B]	Content of Law in Academia	234
[C]	Guidance for the Conduct of the Users of International Arbitration	235
[1]	Management of Contractual Relationships	236
[2]	Management of Foreign Investments and States' Regulatory Activities	237
§6.02	Consistent Arbitral Solutions as Persuasive Sources of Law	238
[A]	The Users of Arbitration Are Not Integrated in a Transnational Legal System	240
[B]	The Intrinsic Legality of Consistent Arbitral Solutions	242
§6.03	Consistent Arbitral Solutions on Arbitration Belong to an Arbitral Legal System	246
[A]	The Arbitral Community and Its Self-Regulation	246
[B]	A Procedural Legal System	250
	Conclusion	255
	Bibliography	257
	Table of Cases, Treaties, Legislation, Rules and Guidelines	279
	Index	323