

ENFORCEMENT OF LABOUR LAW IN CROSS-BORDER SITUATIONS

A Legal Study of the EU's Influence on the Dutch,
German, and Swedish Enforcement Systems

PROEFSCHRIFT

TER VERKRIJGING VAN DE GRAAD VAN DOCTOR
AAN DE RADBOUD UNIVERSITEIT NIJMEGEN
OP GEZAG VAN DE RECTOR MAGNIFICUS
PROF. DR. TH.L.M. ENGELEN,
VOLGENS HET BESLUIT VAN HET COLLEGE VAN DECANEN
IN HET OPENBAAR TE VERDEDIGEN
OP WOENSDAG 15 APRIL 2015
OM 16.30 UUR PRECIES

DOOR

MIRIAM KULLMANN

GEBOREN OP 16 JULI 1983
TE EMMERICH (DUITSLAND)

WOLTERS KLUWER – DEVENTER – 2015

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE	V
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	XV
Chapter 1 Introduction	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.1.1 The enforcement of labour law at Member State level	1
1.1.2 Challenges to Member State monitoring and enforcement methods	2
1.1.3 EU impact on enforcement of labour law at Member State level	5
1.2 Research question	9
1.3 Methodological framework	10
1.3.1 Relevance of this study and difference from other existing studies	10
1.3.2 Comparative legal method: the Netherlands, Germany and Sweden	11
1.3.3 Case study of minimum wages, holiday pay, and holiday allowances	13
1.3.4 Sectoral approach: construction and temporary agency work sectors	14
1.4 Outline of the book	15
1.5 Limits of the study	16
Chapter 2 EU legal requirements for national enforcement of EU (labour) law	19
2.1 Introduction	19
2.2 Jurisprudential requirements shaping Member State enforcement methods	20
2.2.1 Introduction	20
	VII

2.2.2	National procedural autonomy and the principles of effectiveness and equivalence	20
A.	Introduction	20
B.	National procedural autonomy	20
C.	Role of the principles of equivalence and effectiveness	24
D.	The principles of equivalence and effectiveness as a floor	27
E.	Principle of effective judicial protection	35
F.	Remedies under EU law	37
G.	Actors obliged to comply with the principles of equivalence and effectiveness	38
H.	Member State liability for violating the principles of equivalence and effectiveness	40
2.2.3	Monitoring and enforcing posted workers' rights: ceiling imposed by the ECJ's case law	44
A.	Introduction	44
B.	Judicial enforcement: cross-border claims and subcontractors' liability	45
C.	Industrial relations enforcement: negotiations and collective action	47
D.	Administrative enforcement: notification obligations, translating and keeping documents	48
2.3	Legislative requirements imposed by EU law	52
2.3.1	Introduction	52
2.3.2	EU rules on jurisdiction, legal aid and evidence	53
2.3.3	Free movement of workers provisions and their enforcement	53
2.3.4	Posting of workers provisions and their enforcement	55
A.	Posting of Workers Directive	55
B.	Posted Workers Enforcement Directive	56
2.4	Conclusions	59
Chapter 3 Statutory minimum wages, holiday pay and holiday allowances		63
3.1	Introduction	63
3.2	Different employee definitions at EU and Member State level	63
3.2.1	Introduction	63
3.2.2	EU worker concept: Union workers	64
3.2.3	Member State worker concepts: posted workers and temporary agency workers	66
A.	Provisions in the Posted Workers (Enforcement) Directive	66
B.	Member State worker definitions	68

3.2.4	Legal presumptions on the existence and scope of an employment contract	70
3.3	Statutory minimum wages and ways to establish them	72
3.3.1	Introduction	72
3.3.2	Nationwide and sectoral minimum wages	73
A.	Nationwide statutory minimum wage in the Netherlands	73
B.	Introduction of a nationwide minimum wage in Germany	74
C.	Ways to establish sectoral minimum wages in Germany	76
3.3.3	Statutory minimum wage	78
A.	Wage concepts at EU level	78
B.	National statutory wage concepts	81
3.4	Statutory holiday pay and holiday allowance	84
3.4.1	Introduction	84
3.4.2	Holiday pay at EU level	84
3.4.3	Holiday pay and holiday allowance concepts at Member State level	85
A.	Holiday pay	86
B.	Holiday allowance	88
3.5	Comparative notes and conclusions	90

Chapter 4	Sectoral minimum wages, holiday pay and holiday allowances	93
4.1	Introduction	93
4.2	Member State systems of collective labour law	93
4.2.1	Introduction	93
4.2.2	Binding by collective agreements	95
4.2.3	Generally binding collective agreements	98
A.	Generally binding collective agreement	99
B.	Conditions for general binding collective agreements	101
4.2.4	Laval's impact on the Swedish industrial relations model	102
A.	General remarks	102
B.	Laval judgement 2007	104
C.	Laval Case Inquiry (2008): assessing the consequences	107
D.	Limited right to take collective action under the 2010 Lex Laval	108
E.	Lex Laval Inquiry 2012	113
4.3	Construction sector	113

4.3.1	Introduction	113
4.3.2	Personal scope	114
4.3.3	Minimum wages	116
4.3.4	Minimum holiday pay and holiday allowances	119
	A. Annual leave	119
	B. Holiday pay and holiday allowance	120
	C. Administration by holiday pay funds	122
4.4	Temporary agency work sector	125
4.4.1	Introduction	125
4.4.2	Statutory regulation of temporary agency work	125
	A. Scope	125
	B. Temporary agency work in a cross-border context	129
4.4.3	Applicable collective agreements	131
	A. Collective agreements	131
	B. Personal scope	133
	C. Minimum wage	135
	D. Minimum holiday pay and holiday allowance	138
4.5	Comparative notes and conclusions	140
Chapter 5 Judicial enforcement method		143
5.1	Introduction	143
5.2	Access to a court	143
5.2.1	Introduction	143
5.2.2	EU rules on jurisdiction: Regulation (EU) 44/2001 and Article 6 PWD	144
5.2.3	Locus standi of employees and social partners	145
	A. Locus standi of Union workers and posted workers	146
	B. Locus standi for social partners	154
5.2.4	Summary proceedings	162
5.2.5	Possibility of collective redress: group litigation	165
	A. European initiatives	165
	B. Group litigation at domestic level	166
5.2.6	Access to legal aid	170
	A. Legal aid in cross-border disputes: Directive 2003/8/EC	171
	B. Legal aid at domestic level	172
5.3	Aspects of judicial procedures: time limits and evidential rules	175
5.3.1	Time limitations and access to judicial protection	175
	A. Law governing time limits	175
	B. Time limitations at Member State level	176
5.3.2	Evidential rules: Directive 91/533/EEC	179

5.4	Liability for the payment of minimum wages and holiday allowance	181
5.4.1	Introduction	181
5.4.2	Liability schemes at Member State level	181
	A. Aims and functions	181
	B. Scope of the liability schemes	183
	C. Restricting liability	185
	D. Swedish equivalent	186
5.4.3	Limited joint and several liability under the 2014 Posted Workers Enforcement Directive	188
5.5	Civil sanctions and remedies	190
5.6	Comparative notes and conclusions	192
Chapter 6 Industrial relations enforcement method		197
6.1	Introduction	197
6.2	The role of the social partners	197
6.2.1	Introduction	197
6.2.2	Role of the social partners in the enforcement of labour law: the EU perspective	198
6.2.3	Role of the social partners in the enforcement of labour law: the Member State perspective	199
6.3	Measures to improve compliance with employees' rights: information and cooperation	201
6.3.1	Introduction	201
6.3.2	Disseminating information on applicable rights and obligations	201
	A. Access to information	201
	B. Contact points	205
6.3.3	Transnational cooperation between social partners: the exchange of information and best practices	207
6.4	Sector-specific enforcement mechanisms	209
6.4.1	Introduction	209
6.4.2	Tools available to ensure compliance in the construction sector	209
	A. Identity verification in the construction sector: best practices from Sweden	209
	B. Social partner (monitoring and enforcement) institutions in the construction sector	211
6.4.3	Self-regulation in the temporary agency work sector	214
	A. Quality standards: improving the quality of agency work	214
	B. Foundation for Compliance with the Dutch ABU CAO	216

6.5	Collective action and the enforcement of labour rights	219
6.5.1	Introduction	219
6.5.2	Disputes of right and disputes of interest divide	219
6.5.3	Collective action forcing an employer to sign a collective agreement	221
6.6	Comparative notes and conclusions	223
Chapter 7 Administrative enforcement method		227
7.1	Introduction	227
7.2	Information and cooperation on applicable rights	228
7.2.1	Introduction	228
7.2.2	Providing access to information	228
	A. General considerations	228
	B. Information for Union workers	229
	C. Information for posted workers	231
	D. Information on the possibilities of enforcing rights	234
7.2.3	Administrative cooperation	235
	A. Introduction	235
	B. Intra-state cooperation	236
	C. Transnational cooperation: information exchange	239
7.3	Measures to monitor compliance	245
7.3.1	Introduction	245
7.3.2	Registration obligation for economically active Union citizens	245
	A. Mandatory registration of Union citizens in their place of residence and with the host state migration authorities	246
	B. Registration in relation to social security and income tax	250
	C. Reasons why foreign employees do not or cannot register	251
7.3.3	Prior notification, appointing contact persons and keeping documents in the context of the posting of workers	252
	A. Notification of the posting of workers in Germany and Sweden	252
	B. Appointing a contact person in Germany and Sweden	257
	C. Keeping documents	259
7.3.4	Registration and licensing obligations for temporary-work agencies	260
	A. The German licensing system: prior permission	260
	B. The Netherlands registration obligation	263
7.4	Inspection and enforcement	266

7.4.1	Introduction	266
7.4.2	The responsible state authorities	267
	A. Introduction	267
	B. The Netherlands: the ISZW	267
	C. Germany: the Finanzkontrolle Schwarzarbeit	270
	D. Sweden: the Work Environment Authority	272
	E. EU requirements	272
7.4.3	The competences of the authorities	274
	A. General considerations	274
	B. Verifying the identity of employees	275
	C. Entering business premises	275
	D. Access to documents and confiscation of the employer's administrative records	276
7.5	Sanctions	279
7.5.1	Introduction	279
7.5.2	Administrative fines	280
	A. Procedural issues	280
	B. Fines	281
	C. Cross-border enforcement of administrative sanctions	285
7.5.3	Other sanctions	286
	A. Penalty payments	286
	B. Suspending the employer's activities and exclusion from public procurement	287
7.6	Comparative notes and conclusions	287
Chapter 8 Conclusions		291
8.1	Introduction	291
8.2	The ways in which EU rules and case law exert influence	292
8.3	The extent to which EU rules and case law exert influence	294
8.3.1	Substantive employment conditions	294
	A. Statutory minimum wages, holiday pay and holiday allowances	295
	B. Sectoral minimum wages, holiday pay, and holiday allowances in the construction and temporary agency work sectors	296
8.3.2	Judicial enforcement method	298
8.3.3	Industrial relations enforcement method	303
8.3.4	Administrative enforcement method	305
8.4	Final conclusions	308
8.5	Some final thoughts: on law as a system and the theory of reflexive harmonisation	310

Bevindingen	315
1. Inleiding	315
2. De wijzen waarop EU-recht(spraak) invloed uitoefent	316
3. De mate waarin EU-recht(spraak) invloed uitoefent	318
3.1 Materiële arbeidsvoorwaarden	318
A. Wettelijke minimumlonen, vakantiegeld en vakantietoelagen	319
B. Sectorale minimumlonen, vakantiegeld en vakantietoelagen in de bouw- en uitzendsector	321
3.2 Privaatrechtelijke handhavingmethode	323
3.3 Handhavingmethode inzake de arbeidsverhoudingen	328
3.4 Bestuursrechtelijke handhavingmethode	331
4. Slotconclusies	334
5. Een paar afsluitende gedachten: het recht als systeem en de theorie van reflexieve harmonisatie	336
Bibliography	341
Table of cases	371
Table of legislation and policy documents	377
Index	387