

Disappearing Island States in International Law

By

Jenny Grote Stoutenburg



BRILL
NIJHOFF

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Contents

Acknowledgements IX

List of Abbreviations X

Table of Treaties XIV

Introduction 1

PART I

Fathoming the Waters

1 Small Island States and the Threat of Anthropogenic Climate Change 11

1.1 Introduction 11

1.2 Historical Overview: The Changing Tides of Small Island States Discourse 11

1.2.1 *1972–1982: Developing Island Countries and the Overcoming of Structural Barriers to Socioeconomic Development* 12

1.2.2 *1983–1992: Island Developing Countries and the Flagging Momentum for Support to Development* 17

1.2.3 *Since 1992: Small Island Developing States and Sustainable Development in the Face of Climate Change* 19

1.2.4 *Conclusion* 29

1.3 The Impacts of Climate Change and Sea Level Rise on Small Island States 30

1.3.1 *Predictions of Sea Level Rise by the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change* 30

1.3.2 *The Vulnerability of Small Island States to the Effects of Climate Change* 33

1.3.3 *Adaptation Strategies* 43

1.3.4 *The Risk of Island Abandonment* 50

1.4 The Climate Change Regime—An Inadequate Response to the Concerns of Small Island States 52

1.4.1 *The UNFCCC* 53

1.4.2 *The Kyoto Protocol and Beyond* 60

1.4.3 *Conclusion* 70

PART 2

Maritime Entitlements

- 2 The Effect of Sea Level Rise on the Maritime Entitlements of Small Island States 73
 - 2.1 Introduction 73
 - 2.2 Island States in the International Law of the Sea 76
 - 2.2.1 *The Silence of the Law of the Sea Regarding Island States* 76
 - 2.2.2 *Archipelagic States* 79
 - 2.2.3 *The Regime of Islands* 82
 - 2.2.4 *Low-Tide Elevations* 90
 - 2.3 The Maritime Zones of Islands 91
 - 2.3.1 *The Territorial Sea* 91
 - 2.3.2 *Archipelagic Waters* 93
 - 2.3.3 *The Continental Shelf* 94
 - 2.3.4 *The EEZ* 122
 - 2.4 The Shrinking of Maritime Zones Due to Sea Level Rise 126
 - 2.4.1 *The Law of Baselines* 127
 - 2.4.2 *The Ambulatory Nature of Baselines* 130
 - 2.4.3 *The Stabilizing Effect of Maritime Delimitation Agreements or Judicial Dispute Settlements* 135
 - 2.4.4 *The Shrinking of Undelimited Maritime Zones* 143
 - 2.4.5 *From Island to Rock or Low-Tide Elevation?* 151
 - 2.5 The Loss of Maritime Zones Due to State Extinction 160
 - 2.5.1 *The Loss of Maritime Zones through the Loss of International Legal Personality* 161
 - 2.5.2 *Possible Strategies to Preserve International Legal Personality* 161
 - 2.6 Conclusion 185
- 3 A New Regime of Stable Maritime Zones 186
 - 3.1 Introduction 186
 - 3.2 Desirability and Challenges of a New Regime of Stable Maritime Zones 186
 - 3.2.1 *'The Land Dominates the Sea': The Entitlement to Maritime Zones Depends on Title to Territory* 187
 - 3.2.2 *The Challenge of Adequate Management* 195
 - 3.2.3 *The Spatial and Temporal Scope of Stabilization* 198

- 3.3 Unilateral Strategies Providing for Stable Maritime Zones 199
 - 3.3.1 *Physical: Artificial Protection of the Coastline* 200
 - 3.3.2 *Factual: 'Masterly Inactivity'* 201
 - 3.3.3 *Contractual: Maritime Boundary Delimitation Agreements* 203
 - 3.3.4 *Historical: Invocation of the Historic Waters Doctrine* 204
 - 3.3.5 *Progressive: Working Towards a New Rule of Customary International Law* 207
- 3.4 Collective Implementation Mechanisms of a New Regime of Stable Maritime Zones 210
 - 3.4.1 *Implementation Agreement on Sea Level Rise* 212
 - 3.4.2 *UN General Assembly Resolution on Stable Maritime Zones* 225
- 3.5 Stable Maritime Zones and 'Deterritorialized' States 232
- 3.6 Conclusion 235

PART 3

State Extinction and Continuity

- 4 When Do States Disappear? Thresholds of Effective Statehood 239
 - 4.1 States in International Law 239
 - 4.2 The Loss of Effective Statehood through Sea Level Rise 249
 - 4.2.1 *Defined Territory* 251
 - 4.2.2 *Permanent Population* 266
 - 4.2.3 *Government* 275
 - 4.2.4 *Independence* 291
 - 4.3 Conclusion 296
- 5 Who Determines Whether an Island State Has Disappeared? 298
 - 5.1 The Competence to Determine State Extinction 298
 - 5.2 Individual States 298
 - 5.3 The Community of States 301
 - 5.4 The Organized International Community: The United Nations 304
 - 5.5 Conclusion 314

6	The Continued Recognition of ‘Deterritorialized’ Island States	315
6.1	Introduction	315
6.2	A Duty of Continued Recognition of ‘Deterritorialized’ Island States Based on Considerations of Legality?	315
6.2.1	<i>The Influence of Considerations of Legality on the Recognition of States</i>	315
6.2.2	<i>Fundamental Norms Possibly Affected by the Disappearance of Small Island States</i>	333
6.2.3	<i>Serious Breach of a Peremptory Norm?</i>	362
6.2.4	<i>Conclusion</i>	374
6.3	Continued Recognition of ‘Deterritorialized’ Island States Based on Considerations of International Justice and Solidarity	375
6.3.1	<i>The Contents of ‘Deterritorialized’ Statehood</i>	375
6.3.2	<i>The Maintenance of International Legal Personality</i>	379
6.3.3	<i>‘Deterritorialized’ Statehood under International Oversight?</i>	382
6.3.4	<i>Implementing ‘Deterritorialized’ Statehood</i>	384
6.3.5	<i>The Lifespan of ‘Deterritorialized’ States</i>	385
6.3.6	<i>Conclusion</i>	387
7	The Consequences of State Extinction versus Continued Existence as a ‘Deterritorialized’ State or Legal Entity Sui Generis	388
7.1	Three Possible Scenarios	388
7.2	The Fate of the People	389
7.2.1	<i>Histories of Forced Relocation in the Pacific and Indian Ocean Regions</i>	389
7.2.2	<i>The Legal Status of Environmentally Displaced Persons</i>	396
7.2.3	<i>The Island State Ceases to Exist</i>	404
7.2.4	<i>The ‘Deterritorialized’ Island State Enjoys Continued Recognition</i>	423
7.2.5	<i>The Island State Survives as a Legal Entity Sui Generis</i>	430
7.3	Membership in International Organizations	434
7.4	The Fate of Treaty Obligations	438
7.5	The Fate of State Assets and Debts	442
7.6	Conclusion	445

Summary and Conclusion: The Limits of *Ex Post* Solidarity in the Context of Climate Change 447

Bibliography 451

Index 477