

Security Detention in International Territorial Administrations: Kosovo, East Timor, and Iraq

By

Omer Faruk Direk



BRILL
NIJHOFF

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Contents

Preface IX

List of Abbreviations XI

Table of Treaties and Other Major International Instruments XIII

Table of Case Law XVI

1 Introduction 1

- 1 Why Examine the Applicability of International Law to Security Detention Issues in the Internationally-administered Territories of Kosovo, East Timor and Iraq? 1
- 2 The Central Argument of the Book 3
- 3 The Relevant Complex Legal Questions 4
- 4 Methodology 12
- 5 The Structure of the Book 14

2 Responsibility in Peace Support Operations: Revisiting the Proper Test for Attribution of Conduct and the Meaning of the Effective Control Standard 16

- 1 Introduction 16
- 2 The Current Legal Framework for Attribution of Conduct in Peace Support Operations 17
- 3 Revisiting the Proper Test for Attribution of Conduct in Peace Support Operations 22
- 4 Dual Attribution of Conduct and Plurality of Responsibility in Peace Support Operations 24
- 5 Conclusion 39

3 Norm Conflict under Security Council Decisions and Human Rights Law 41

- 1 Introduction 41
- 2 Internal and External Reviews of Security Council Resolutions 42
- 3 The *Kadi* and *Yusuf* Judgments of the European Court of Justice and the Idea of a Separate Legal Order 43
- 4 The *Al-Jedda* Judgment of the UK House of Lords 45
- 5 Interpretation of the Applicable Security Council Resolutions 47
- 6 The ECtHR's Response to Norm Conflict Issues in *Al-Jedda* 48
- 7 The Stipulation that Clear Language be Used 50
- 8 Discretion as to the Means of Choice 52
- 9 Conclusion 55

- 4 Appraising Extraterritorial Human Rights Obligations in a Post-conflict Environment: Security Detainee Cases in the Context of UN-authorized Military Missions 58**
- 1 Introduction 58
 - 2 The Relationship between Jurisdiction and State Responsibility 59
 - 3 Extraterritorial Jurisdiction in Human Rights Law 65
 - 4 The Relationship between the Concept of Jurisdiction in Human Rights Law and Public International Law 69
 - 5 The ECtHR's Approach to Extraterritorial Jurisdiction after *Bankovic* 74
 - 6 The ECtHR's Judgment in *Al-Skeini* 82
 - 7 Identifying the Proper Methodology 91
 - 8 Conclusion 95
- 5 The Complex Relationship between International Humanitarian Law and International Human Rights Law and Its Implications for Security Detention Cases in UN-authorized Security Missions 97**
- 1 Introduction 97
 - 2 The Historical Background of the Relationship between IHL and IHRL 97
 - 3 Developments in the Jurisprudence of International Judicial Bodies 99
 - 4 Positions Adopted in Legal Literature 101
 - 5 A Reflection on the Relationship between IHL and IHRL 106
 - 6 The Interplay between IHL and IHRL in the Context of UN-authorized Missions 107
 - 7 Conclusion 117
- 6 Security Detention Practices during the International Territorial Administration of Kosovo 119**
- 1 Introduction 119
 - 2 The Background to the Kosovan Case 120
 - 3 Transitional Territorial Administration in International Law 121
 - 4 UNMIK and the Detention of Civilians in Kosovo 132
 - 5 The Compatibility of Security Detention by KFOR with Human Rights Law 136
 - 6 Lessons Learned from Detention Practices in Kosovo 139
 - 7 Conclusion 144

7 Security Detention Practices during the International Territorial Administration of East Timor	146
1 Introduction	146
2 The Background to the East Timorese Case	147
3 The Security Detention Practices of INTERFET and the Law of Occupation	150
4 UNTAET's Security Detention Practices and Human Rights Law	162
5 Conclusion	170
8 Security Detention Practices during the International Territorial Administration of Iraq	172
1 Introduction	172
2 The Background to the Iraqi Case	174
3 The Coalition Provisional Authority and Its Security Detention Policies	179
4 MNF and Its Policy and Practices of Security Detention	198
5 Conclusion: Lessons Learned from Iraq	214
9 Conclusion	217
1 Overview	217
2 Apportionment of Responsibility in UN Peace-Support Operations	217
3 Norm Conflict Issues	220
4 Extraterritorial Application of Human Rights Treaties	221
5 The Relationship between International Humanitarian Law (IHL) and International Human Rights Law (IHRL)	223
6 Lessons Learned from Security Detention Practices on the Ground	225
7 The Future of International Territorial Administration	228
Bibliography	231
Index	247