



EuropaInstitut

AN DER UNIVERSITÄT ZÜRICH

Herausgeber:

Rolf H. Weber, Andreas Heinemann

Stefan Tsakanakis

# Efficient Antitrust Enforcement in Developed and Emerging Jurisdictions

# Table of Contents

<b>PREFACE .....</b>	<b>V</b>
<b>TABLE OF CONTENTS.....</b>	<b>VII</b>
<b>TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS .....</b>	<b>XV</b>
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY.....</b>	<b>XIX</b>
I. ARTICLES/BOOKS/REPORTS.....	XIX
II. CASE LAW .....	XLV
1. <i>United States</i> .....	XLV
2. <i>European Union</i> .....	XLV
3. <i>Switzerland</i> .....	XLVI
4. <i>Others</i> .....	XLVI
III. LEGISLATION .....	XLVI
1. <i>United States</i> .....	XLVI
2. <i>European Union</i> .....	XLVII
3. <i>Switzerland</i> .....	XLVIII
4. <i>China</i> .....	XLIX
5. <i>Brazil</i> .....	L
6. <i>Others</i> .....	L
IV. OTHER CITED SOURCES .....	LI
<b>A. INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>1</b>
I. OVERVIEW.....	1
II. OUTLINE AND PURPOSE.....	3
<b>B. STATUS QUO OF PUBLIC ANTITRUST ENFORCEMENT .....</b>	<b>6</b>
I. UNITED STATES .....	6
1. <i>Institutional Structure</i> .....	6
a) Department of Justice.....	7
b) Federal Trade Commission .....	7
c) State Attorneys General.....	8
2. <i>Procedure</i> .....	9
a) DOJ Antitrust Enforcement Procedure .....	9
i) Civil Enforcement.....	9
ii) Criminal Enforcement.....	10
iii) Business Review Letters .....	11
b) FTC Antitrust Enforcement Procedure .....	11

c) Judicial Review .....	12
3. <i>Leniency</i> .....	13
a) Corporate Leniency .....	13
b) Individual Leniency .....	14
II. EUROPEAN UNION .....	15
1. <i>Introduction</i> .....	15
2. <i>Institutional Structure</i> .....	16
a) Directorate General for Competition .....	17
b) European Courts .....	18
i) European Court of Justice .....	18
ii) General Court .....	18
iii) Independence and Expertise .....	19
3. <i>Procedure</i> .....	20
a) Overview .....	20
b) Criminal Enforcement .....	20
c) Commitments and Settlements .....	21
i) Commitments under Regulation 1/2003 .....	21
ii) Special Settlement Procedure for Cartel Cases .....	22
4. <i>Leniency</i> .....	24
5. <i>Interaction between EU and National Antitrust Enforcement</i> .....	25
a) Decentralization of European Antitrust Law Decision-Making .....	26
b) Interaction Between EU and National Antitrust Authorities .....	26
c) Member State Authority to Displace Treaty Antitrust Norms .....	27
III. SWITZERLAND .....	28
1. <i>Institutional Structure</i> .....	28
a) Competition Commission .....	28
b) Secretariat of the Competition Commission .....	28
2. <i>Procedure</i> .....	29
a) Investigation and Decision-Taking .....	29
b) Judicial Review .....	30
c) Penalties and Sanctions .....	31
3. <i>Leniency</i> .....	31
IV. CHINA .....	32
1. <i>Institutional Structure</i> .....	32
2. <i>Procedure</i> .....	34
a) Penalties and Sanctions .....	34
b) Settlements .....	34
c) Abuse of Power of Government Officials .....	35
d) Transparency of Investigation and Decision-Finding .....	35
e) Independence of Antitrust Enforcement .....	36
3. <i>Leniency</i> .....	37
4. <i>Implementation of the Anti-Monopoly Law</i> .....	37

a)	Provisions on Monopoly Agreements.....	37
b)	Provisions on Abuse of Position .....	38
V.	BRAZIL.....	39
1.	<i>Institutional Structure</i> .....	39
2.	<i>Procedure</i> .....	41
a)	Overview.....	41
b)	Fines.....	41
c)	Criminal Enforcement .....	42
d)	Settlements .....	43
3.	<i>Leniency</i> .....	43
4.	<i>Competition Advocacy</i> .....	45
a)	Promotion of Competition and Illustration of Antitrust Enforcement .....	45
b)	Perception of Antitrust Enforcement .....	46
C.	<b>STATUS QUO OF PRIVATE ANTITRUST ENFORCEMENT .....</b>	<b>47</b>
I.	UNITED STATES .....	47
1.	<i>Overview</i> .....	47
2.	<i>Right of Action</i> .....	48
3.	<i>Class Actions</i> .....	49
4.	<i>Damages</i> .....	50
5.	<i>Contingency Fees</i> .....	51
6.	<i>Discovery</i> .....	52
II.	EUROPEAN UNION.....	53
1.	<i>Overview</i> .....	53
2.	<i>White Paper</i> .....	55
3.	<i>Directive on Private Damages Actions</i> .....	56
4.	<i>Implication of EU Law on National Private Enforcement</i> .....	58
III.	SWITZERLAND.....	59
1.	<i>Overview</i> .....	59
2.	<i>Right of Action</i> .....	60
a)	Legal Basis .....	60
b)	Consumers.....	60
c)	Consumer Associations .....	61
d)	Class Actions.....	62
3.	<i>Damages</i> .....	63
4.	<i>Contingency Fees</i> .....	63
5.	<i>Burden of Proof</i> .....	64
IV.	CHINA .....	64
1.	<i>Overview</i> .....	64
2.	<i>Class Actions</i> .....	65

3.	<i>Damages</i> .....	66
4.	<i>Contingency Fees</i> .....	66
5.	<i>Burden of Proof</i> .....	67
6.	<i>Practical Impact and Obstacles to Private Antitrust Enforcement</i>	67
V.	<b>BRAZIL</b> .....	68
1.	<i>Overview</i> .....	68
2.	<i>Right of Action</i> .....	69
3.	<i>Class Actions</i> .....	70
4.	<i>Damages</i> .....	71
5.	<i>Burden of Proof</i> .....	71
6.	<i>Settlements</i> .....	72
<b>D.</b>	<b>ELEMENTS OF EFFICIENT PUBLIC ANTITRUST ENFORCEMENT</b> .....	<b>76</b>
I.	<b>INSTITUTIONAL STRUCTURE</b> .....	<b>76</b>
1.	<i>Institutional Effectiveness</i> .....	<b>76</b>
a)	Independence and Accountability.....	77
b)	Transparency.....	77
c)	Confidentiality.....	78
d)	Administrative Efficiency.....	78
2.	<i>Multi-Agency Enforcement</i> .....	<b>78</b>
a)	Advantages of Multi-Agency Enforcement.....	79
i)	Independence and Diversification.....	79
ii)	Expertise.....	79
iii)	Inter-Agency Competition.....	80
b)	Drawbacks of Multi-Agency Enforcement.....	80
i)	Duplication of Fixed Costs.....	80
ii)	Coordination and Differential Outcomes.....	80
c)	Overall Assessment of Multi-Agency Enforcement.....	81
3.	<i>Adversarial and Inquisitorial Procedures</i> .....	<b>82</b>
4.	<i>Specialized Antitrust Courts</i> .....	<b>84</b>
II.	<b>QUALIFICATION OF INDIVIDUALS</b> .....	<b>85</b>
1.	<i>Government Officials</i> .....	<b>85</b>
2.	<i>Judiciary</i> .....	<b>88</b>
III.	<b>CORRUPTION AND NEPOTISM</b> .....	<b>89</b>
1.	<i>Grand Corruption</i> .....	<b>89</b>
2.	<i>Petty Corruption</i> .....	<b>90</b>
a)	Corruption of Government Officials.....	91
b)	Corruption of the Judiciary.....	93
3.	<i>Nepotism</i> .....	<b>93</b>
IV.	<b>COMPETITION ADVOCACY</b> .....	<b>94</b>

V.	TOOLS TO DETECT AND ATTACK ANTI-COMPETITIVE CONDUCT.....	97
1.	<i>Settlements of Antitrust Cases</i> .....	98
a)	Perspective of Defendants.....	98
b)	Perspective of Antitrust Agencies.....	98
i)	Speed .....	99
ii)	Cost Saving.....	99
iii)	Settlement Rewards .....	99
c)	Case Selection .....	100
d)	Rights of Defense.....	101
2.	<i>Leniency Agreements</i> .....	102
a)	Incentives for Participation in Leniency Programs.....	102
b)	Function and Outcome of Leniency Agreements .....	103
c)	Limits of Leniency Agreements .....	104
3.	<i>Dawn Raids</i> .....	106
a)	Purpose .....	106
b)	Legal Challenges .....	107
i)	Privilege Against Self-Incrimination .....	107
ii)	Right to Privacy .....	107
iii)	Rights of Defense.....	108
c)	Procedural Requirements .....	108
i)	Search Authorization .....	108
ii)	Conducting the Search.....	109
VI.	PENALTIES AND REMEDIES .....	111
1.	<i>Fines</i> .....	112
2.	<i>Prison Sanctions</i> .....	113
3.	<i>Injunctions</i> .....	115
4.	<i>Probability of Detection and Transparency of Sanctions</i> .....	117
a)	Probability of Detection.....	117
b)	Transparency of Sanctions.....	118
E.	<b>ELEMENTS OF EFFICIENT PRIVATE ANTITRUST ENFORCEMENT .....</b>	<b>120</b>
I.	INTRODUCTION .....	120
II.	CLASS ACTIONS.....	122
1.	<i>Purpose of Class Actions</i> .....	122
a)	Bundling of Claims .....	122
b)	Improving Detection.....	123
c)	Deterrence .....	124
2.	<i>Interaction Between Leniency Programs and Class Actions</i> .....	124
3.	<i>Risks of Class Actions</i> .....	124
a)	Moral Hazard .....	124
b)	Class Actions and State Authority.....	125
c)	Criticism of Class Actions .....	126

III.	DAMAGES.....	127
1.	<i>Calculation</i> .....	128
2.	<i>Deterrence</i> .....	128
3.	<i>Drawbacks and Risks of Treble Damages</i> .....	129
a)	Moral Hazard.....	129
b)	Cases Suitable for Treble Damages.....	130
c)	Treble Damages in Combination with Class Actions.....	131
4.	<i>Conclusion on Treble Damages</i> .....	132
IV.	BURDEN OF PROOF ISSUES AND DISCOVERY.....	132
1.	<i>Social Benefits of Discovery</i> .....	133
a)	Detection and Deterrence.....	133
b)	Settlement Quality.....	134
2.	<i>Social Costs of Discovery</i> .....	135
a)	Costs of Discovery.....	135
b)	Abuse of Discovery.....	135
V.	CONTINGENCY FEES.....	137
1.	<i>Risk Shifting</i> .....	138
2.	<i>Advantages for Plaintiff Lawyers</i> .....	138
a)	Potentially Higher Fees.....	138
b)	The Lawyer as an Entrepreneur.....	139
c)	Agency Problems.....	140
d)	Frequency of Litigation.....	140
VI.	FOLLOW-ON ACTIONS.....	141
1.	<i>Overview</i> .....	141
2.	<i>Interaction between Public Sanctions and Private Damages</i> .....	142
VII.	RISKS AND CHANCES OF PRIVATE ENFORCEMENT.....	143
1.	<i>Why Private Enforcement Should be Limited</i> .....	143
a)	Divergence between Private and Public Objectives.....	143
b)	Avoid Over-Deterrence.....	144
2.	<i>Why Private Enforcement Should be Encouraged</i> .....	145
<b>F.</b>	<b>INTERNATIONALIZATION OF ANTITRUST ENFORCEMENT</b> .....	<b>147</b>
I.	OVERVIEW.....	147
II.	ANTITRUST PROTECTIONISM AND DISCRIMINATION.....	149
1.	<i>Trade-Flow Bias</i> .....	149
2.	<i>Export Cartels</i> .....	150
3.	<i>Import Cartels</i> .....	151
4.	<i>Biased Enforcement</i> .....	151

---

III.	INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION .....	153
1.	<i>Forms of Cooperation</i> .....	153
a)	Networks.....	153
b)	Classical Administrative Cooperation .....	154
2.	<i>Benefits of International Cooperation</i> .....	154
3.	<i>Limits of Cooperation</i> .....	155
a)	Differences in Procedures.....	155
b)	Transparency Requirements.....	156
c)	Lack of a Binding Nature .....	156
IV.	INTERNATIONAL HARMONIZATION .....	157
1.	<i>Harmonization through Networks</i> .....	157
a)	International Competition Network .....	157
b)	World Trade Organization .....	158
c)	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development .....	159
d)	United Nations Conference on Trade and Development .....	159
2.	<i>Harmonization through Cooperation and Mutual Influence</i> .....	160
3.	<i>Benefits of International Harmonization</i> .....	161
a)	Improvement of Antitrust Enforcement.....	161
b)	Avoiding Discrimination of Foreign Companies.....	162
c)	Issues of Heterogeneous Antitrust Norms .....	163
4.	<i>Pre-Conditions for International Harmonization</i> .....	164
5.	<i>Outlook for the Future</i> .....	165
V.	INTERNATIONAL ANTITRUST INSTITUTIONS AND JOINT ENFORCEMENT .....	166
1.	<i>International Antitrust Institutions</i> .....	166
2.	<i>Joint Enforcement</i> .....	169
a)	Overview .....	169
b)	Benefits of Joint Enforcement Agreements.....	172
3.	<i>Effects on Non-Member Jurisdictions</i> .....	173
4.	<i>Obstacles to the Creation of International Antitrust Institutions and Joint Enforcement</i> .....	174
a)	Costs of Establishing .....	174
b)	Loss of Sovereignty .....	174
c)	Lack of a Competition Culture.....	175
d)	Method of Antitrust Interpretation.....	176
<b>G.</b>	<b>CONCLUDING REMARKS</b> .....	<b>180</b>
I.	PUBLIC ENFORCEMENT .....	180
II.	PRIVATE ENFORCEMENT .....	181
III.	KEY DIFFERENCES BETWEEN DEVELOPED AND EMERGING JURISDICTIONS ...	182
IV.	INTERNATIONALIZATION OF ANTITRUST ENFORCEMENT .....	184