

Schweizer Schriften zur Vermögensberatung und zum Vermögensrecht
Schriftenreihe von KENDRIS AG

Herausgegeben von
Prof. Dr. Margareta Baddeley, Prof. Dr. Peter Breitschmid,
Prof. Dr. Paul Eitel, Prof. Dr. Hans Rainer Künzle und Dr. Rudolf Roth

12



**The Development, Use,
and Misuse of the Trust
Protector and its Role in
Trust Law and Practice**

Alexander A. Bove, Jr.

KENDRIS
THE WEALTH OF
INDEPENDENCE

Schulthess § 2014

Main Table of Contents

TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS.....	XI
TABLE OF CASES.....	XVII
BIBLIOGRAPHY	XXI
ABSTRACT.....	1
CHAPTER 1 – INTRODUCTION.....	5
1.1 – INTRODUCTION TO THE PROTECTOR.....	5
1.2 – THE FIRST UNITED STATES CASE.....	5
CHAPTER 2 – BRIEF HISTORY OF THE TRUST.....	9
2.1 – THE CONCEPT OF “USES”	9
2.2 – THE BEGINNING OF THE TRUST CONCEPT	9
2.3 – VULNERABILITY OF THE “USE” AND THE ESTABLISHMENT OF A SPECIAL COURT	10
2.4 – REFINEMENT OF THE TRUST CONCEPT AND ITS WIDESPREAD ACCEPTANCE.....	11
2.5 – ELEMENTS OF THE TRUST	12
2.6 – INTERNATIONAL RECOGNITION OF THE TRUST.....	13
2.7 – INCREASED USE OF TRUSTS IN PLANNING.....	14
CHAPTER 3 – DEVELOPMENT OF THE POSITION OF THE TRUST PROTECTOR.....	17
3.1 – THE TRUST WITHOUT THE PROTECTOR	17
3.2 – ORIGIN OF THE TERM, “PROTECTOR”, AND ITS INITIAL ROLE	18
3.3 – ORIGIN OF THE CONCEPT OF PROTECTOR AND THE RELEVANCE OF THE TERM.....	20
CHAPTER 4 – THE PROTECTOR AS FIDUCIARY.....	23
4.1 – ANALYZING THE ROLE AND ITS RESPONSIBILITIES	23
4.2 – PERSONAL V. FIDUCIARY POWER AND STATUTORY DICTATES	24
4.3 – LEGAL FORMS FOLLOW THE PACK.....	26
4.4 – COURTS BEGIN TO CONSIDER THE ROLE	28
4.5 – WHEN A PERSONAL POWER IS INTENDED.....	30
4.6 – FIDUCIARY POWER AND FIDUCIARY DUTY.....	31
4.7 – FIDUCIARY POWER V. FIDUCIARY POSITION	33
4.8 – FIDUCIARY BY VIRTUE OF PROFESSION OR IDENTITY.....	35
4.9 – FIDUCIARY BY CIRCUMSTANCES	35

4.10 – A COURT’S ANALYSIS OF POWERS	37
4.11 – THE SETTLOR’S INTENT SHOULD CONTROL	38
4.12 – TRUST LANGUAGE CONTRADICTING THE SETTLOR’S INTENT	41
4.13 – WHERE THE TRUST IS SILENT	42
4.14 – DRAFTING AWAY FIDUCIARY DUTY	44
4.15 – STATUTORY ELIMINATION OF FIDUCIARY DUTY	48
4.16 – THE OFFICE OF PROTECTOR V. THE INDIVIDUAL	49
4.17 – STATING THE OBVIOUS – THE PROTECTOR IS A FIDUCIARY	50
CHAPTER 5 – POWERS OF THE PROTECTOR	53
5.1 – REASONS FOR POWERS	53
5.2 – HOW POWERFUL CAN/SHOULD THE PROTECTOR BE?	54
5.3 – ILLEGAL AND IMPERMISSIBLE POWERS	54
5.4 – ARE MORE POWERS BETTER?	55
5.5 – DECIDING ON GREATER OR FEWER POWERS	56
5.6 – IMPLIED POWERS	57
5.7 – STATUTORY POWERS	57
5.8 – HOW THE POWERS ARE EXERCISED	58
5.9 – MULTIPLE PROTECTORS	58
5.10 – ENTITY PROTECTORS	59
5.11 – DELEGATION OF POWERS	60
5.12 – RELEASE OF POWERS	61
CHAPTER 6 – DUTIES OF THE PROTECTOR	63
6.1 – DUTY UNDER A PERSONAL POWER	63
6.2 – DUTIES OF PROTECTOR AS BENEFICIARY	64
6.3 – PROTECTOR’S DUTY TO MONITOR THE TRUSTEE	65
6.4 – MANNER OF DUTY AND DISCRETION	67
6.5 – DUTY NOT TO GIVE PRE-ARRANGED CONSENT	67
6.6 – DUTY OF PROTECTOR WITH A CONFLICT OF INTEREST	69
CHAPTER 7 – PROTECTOR’S LIABILITY	71
7.1 – ESTABLISHMENT OF PROTECTOR’S LIABILITY	71
7.2 – IDENTIFYING THE SPECIFIC LIABILITY	71
7.3 – LIABILITY OF THE PROTECTOR V. THAT OF THE TRUSTEE	72
7.4 – DETERMINING THE EXTENT OF LIABILITY	73
7.5 – EXCULPATING THE PROTECTOR	74
CHAPTER 8 – RIGHTS OF THE PROTECTOR	77
8.1 – PROTECTOR’S RIGHTS IN GENERAL	77
8.2 – THE RIGHT TO INFORMATION – PROTECTOR WITH A PERSONAL POWER	77
8.3 – THE RIGHT TO INFORMATION – PROTECTOR WITH A FIDUCIARY POWER	78

8.4 – THE RIGHT TO ENFORCE CLAIMS AND TRUST PROVISIONS ON BEHALF OF THE TRUST AND THE BENEFICIARIES	80
8.5 – THE RIGHT TO INDEMNIFICATION	85
8.6 – PROTECTOR’S LIEN FOR EXPENSES	87
8.7 – THE RIGHT TO COMPENSATION.....	87

**CHAPTER 9 – THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE
PROTECTOR AND THE TRUSTEE 89**

9.1 – INTRODUCTION	89
9.2 – IS THE TRUSTEE BOUND TO FOLLOW THE PROTECTOR’S INSTRUCTIONS?	89
9.3 – STATUS OF THE TRUSTEE IN RELATION TO THE PROTECTOR.....	90
9.4 – WHERE THE POWERS OF THE PROTECTOR AND THE TRUSTEE OVERLAP	91
9.5 – UNITED STATES TRUST LAW AND THIRD PARTY ADVISERS	93
9.6 – STATUTORY EXCULPATION OF TRUSTEES FOLLOWING ADVISER’S DIRECTION.....	95
9.7 – “DIRECTED” TRUSTS.....	96
9.7.1 – <i>Directed Trustee has no duty to inform the Protector</i>	98
9.7.2 – <i>Establishing a directed Trustee’s breach – A near impossible burden of proof for the Beneficiaries</i>	100
9.7.3 – <i>Directions outside the scope of Protector’s authority</i>	101
9.7.4 – <i>Where the Trustee should have known of a breach by the Protector</i>	102
9.8 – THE UNCERTAINTY OF THE UNIFORM TRUST CODE	102
9.9 – TRUSTEE’S INHERENT OBLIGATION TO INQUIRE	104
9.10 – PROTECTOR’S DUTY OF INQUIRY	105
9.11 – CONSIDER THE PURPOSE OF THE GRANT OF THE POWER	105
9.12 – ONE UNITED STATES CASE – NO DUTY TO INQUIRE	106
9.13 – VETO POWER	107
9.13.1 – <i>Protector’s veto powers</i>	107
9.13.2 – <i>Trustee’s disagreement with veto</i>	109
9.14 – CONCLUSION.....	110

**CHAPTER 10 – THE COURTS’ ROLE AND JURISDICTION
OVER THE PROTECTOR..... 113**

10.1 – DEVELOPMENT OF THE LAW THROUGH PRECEDENT	113
10.2 – THE COURT’S INHERENT JURISDICTION OVER THE PROTECTOR AS A FIDUCIARY	113
10.3 – JURISDICTION WHERE THE PROTECTOR IS NOT A FIDUCIARY	115
10.4 – WHERE THE NON-FIDUCIARY PROTECTOR IS FOUND TO BE A FIDUCIARY.....	116
10.5 – COURT’S RECOGNITION OF STATUTORY DECLARATIONS	117
10.6 – WHERE THE PROTECTOR IS A FIDUCIARY	118
10.7 – COURT’S POWER TO APPOINT AND REMOVE A PROTECTOR	119

10.8 – COURT’S POWER TO REVIEW APPOINTMENT OF A PROTECTOR	121
10.9 – COURT’S POWER TO OVERRIDE A PROTECTOR’S DECISION OR EXERCISE OF POWER.....	124
10.10 – COURT’S POWER TO SUSPEND PROTECTOR’S POWERS.....	124
10.11 – COURT’S POWER TO SURCHARGE THE PROTECTOR.....	126
10.12 – COURT’S POWER TO COMPEL THE EXERCISE OF A PROTECTOR’S POWER.....	127
10.13 – CONCLUSION.....	127

CHAPTER 11 – PRACTICAL ISSUES IN USING PROTECTORS 129

11.1 – INTRODUCTION	129
11.2 – ISSUES IN SELECTING A PROTECTOR.....	129
11.3 – PROTECTOR IN A FOUNDATION.....	130
11.3.1 – <i>Reasons for including a Protector in a foundation</i>	131
11.3.2 – <i>The foundation and fiduciary duty</i>	133
11.4 – PROTECTOR IN A PURPOSE TRUST	134
11.5 – SELECTING A PROTECTOR.....	135
11.5.1 – <i>General criteria to be considered</i>	137
11.5.2 – <i>Specific criteria to apply in the selection</i>	137
11.5.2.1 – Experience in the area of Trusts/foundations	138
11.5.2.2 – Insurance coverage for damages or losses	138
11.5.2.3 – Adequate staff.....	139
11.5.2.4 – Response time.....	139
11.5.2.5 – Regulated.....	139
11.5.2.6 – Location (where asset protection is an objective)	140
11.6 – INDIVIDUAL V. COMMITTEE V. ENTITY AS PROTECTOR.....	140
11.6.1 – <i>Individuals</i>	140
11.6.2 – <i>Committee</i>	141
11.6.3 – <i>Corporation and limited liability company</i>	142
11.7 – DRAFTING CONSIDERATIONS.....	142
11.7.1 – <i>The fiduciary issue</i>	143
11.7.2 – <i>The compensation issue</i>	143
11.7.3 – <i>Hiring agents and attorneys</i>	144
11.7.4 – <i>Right to defend claims against himself</i>	145
11.7.5 – <i>Enumeration of specific powers</i>	145
11.7.5.1 – Power to remove and replace the Trustee	146
11.7.5.2 – Power to enforce claims.....	147
11.7.5.3 – Right to reimbursement.....	148
11.7.5.4 – Right to information.....	148
11.7.5.5 – Power to amend the Trust	149
11.7.5.6 – Power to add or delete Beneficiaries.....	150
11.7.5.7 – Power to decant.....	151
11.7.5.8 – The new “flee” clause	152
11.7.5.9 – Change of situs and governing law	153
11.7.5.10 – Power to terminate the Trust.....	154
11.7.5.11 – Power to consent or veto.....	155
11.7.5.12 – Tax restrictions	156

11.7.5.13 – Vacancies	157
11.7.5.14 – Excluded Protectors	157
11.7.5.15 – Resignation	158
11.7.5.16 – Incapacity, insolvency, disappearance	158
11.7.5.17 – Perpetuities	159
11.7.5.18 – Standards of Protector liability.....	159
11.7.5.19 – Incorporating powers by reference.....	160
11.7.5.20 – Anti-duress provision.....	161
11.8 – LETTER OF WISHES.....	161
11.8.1 – <i>Introduction and use</i>	161
11.8.2 – <i>Letter of wishes to the Protector</i>	162
11.8.3 – <i>Revealing the Settlor’s state of mind</i>	162
11.8.4 – <i>Letter should be non-binding</i>	163
11.9 – USE OF THE PROTECTOR IN ASSET PROTECTION PLANS	164
11.9.1 – <i>Introduction</i>	164
11.9.2 – <i>The Protector and asset protection</i>	166
11.9.3 – <i>Special drafting considerations for asset protection plans</i>	167
11.10 – THE SPRINGING PROTECTOR	168
11.10.1 – <i>Introduction and purpose</i>	168
11.10.2 – <i>Employing a springing Protector</i>	169
11.11 – TAX CONSIDERATIONS FOR THE PROTECTOR.....	171
11.12 – COURT’S REACTION TO THE PROTECTOR.....	172
11.12.1 – <i>Slow but steady acceptance by the common law courts</i>	172
11.12.2 – <i>Reluctant, questionable acceptance by United States courts</i>	173
11.13 – STATUTORY TREATMENT OF THE PROTECTOR.....	175
11.13.1 – <i>Background and development</i>	175
11.13.2 – <i>Practical issues concerning the statutes</i>	176

CHAPTER 12 – CONCLUSION 179