

CFAC – The Aviation Series

Edited by Prof. Dr. Roland Müller and Dr. Andreas Wittmer

Volume 12

Claudio Noto

Airport Capacity Allocation with Network Airlines

Contents

List of Figures	xii
List of Tables	xii
Executive Summary	xiii
Kurzzusammenfassung	xiv
I Motivation	1
1 Introduction	1
2 Background	9
2.1 Scope & Definitions	10
2.1.1 Airport Capacity	10
2.1.2 Congestion Externalities	10
2.1.3 Capacity Expansion and Capacity Allocation	11
2.2 Typology	12
2.2.1 Public and Private Goods	12
2.2.2 Club Goods	13
2.2.3 Multilateral Externalities	14
2.2.4 Scarcity and Congestion	15
2.3 Regulation	16
2.3.1 Policy	16
2.3.2 Fundamentals	16
2.4 Airport Capacity Allocation in Practice	18
2.4.1 Two different Paradigms	18
2.4.2 EU: Administrative Airport Slot Allocation	18
2.4.3 US: First-come, first-served Airport Access	19
2.4.4 Note: Airport Slots vs. CTOT's	20
2.4.5 Note: En-Route Airspace	21
2.5 Recent Criticism in the Literature	22
2.5.1 Overview	22
2.5.2 Economic Efficiency	24
2.5.3 Technical Efficiency	25
2.5.4 Transactional Efficiency	27
2.5.5 Distributional Considerations	27
2.5.6 Legal and Policy Accordance	28
2.5.7 Summary	29
2.6 Alternative Instruments	30
2.6.1 Congestion Pricing	30
2.6.2 Secondary Trading	30
2.6.3 Allocation Efficiency	31
2.6.4 Note: Slot Auctions	31
3 Theoretical Foundations	32

3.1	Market Structure	32
3.1.1	Economies of Scale and Scope	32
3.1.2	Network Density Benefits	34
3.1.3	Vertical Product Differentiation	36
3.1.4	Implications	38
3.2	Resource Allocation with Externalities	40
3.2.1	Economic Instruments	40
3.2.2	Allocation Efficiency	41
3.2.3	Distributional Equity	43
3.2.4	Implications	44
3.3	Dual Distortion	44
3.3.1	Market Power and Congestion	44
3.3.2	Welfare Caveat	47
3.3.3	Congestion: The internalization Debate	49
3.4	Oligopoly Models	50
3.4.1	COURNOT Competition with homogeneous Goods	50
3.4.2	BERTRAND Competition with homogeneous Goods	51
3.4.3	Heterogeneous Goods	52
3.4.4	Implications	53
3.5	Strategic Competition and Strategic Behavior	55
3.5.1	General Definitions	55
3.5.2	Strategic Airline Behavior	56
3.5.3	Implications	58
4	Previous Studies	59
4.1	Overview	59
4.2	Theoretical Models	60
4.2.1	Essential Foundations	61
4.2.2	Slot (Re-)Allocation	64
4.2.3	Congestion Pricing	67
4.2.4	Secondary Trading and Congestion Pricing	70
4.2.5	Slot Auctions	72
4.3	Policy Studies and Empirical Evidence	74
4.4	Model Foundations	75
4.4.1	Network Effects and Density Benefits	75
4.4.2	Vertical Product Differentiation	77
4.5	Gap in the Literature	79
II	Analysis	81
5	Generic Model	81
5.1	Causal Relations	81
5.1.1	Supply and Demand	82
5.1.2	Network Density Benefits	83
5.1.3	Congestion	84

5.1.4	Product Differentiation	84
5.1.5	Airport Capacity Allocation	85
5.2	Formal Setting	86
5.2.1	Airport and Network Structure	87
5.2.2	Passenger Utility	88
5.2.3	Airline Profits	92
5.2.4	Partial Equilibrium Perspective	93
5.2.5	Market Coverage	93
5.3	Equilibrium: Natural Market Structure	95
5.3.1	Utility Maximization	95
5.3.2	Profit Maximization	98
5.3.3	First-Order Conditions	99
5.3.4	Interior Solution	100
5.3.5	Corner Solution	102
5.3.6	Partial Market Coverage	103
5.3.7	Network Value	104
5.3.8	Conjectural Variations	106
5.4	Social Optimum: Optimal Resource Allocation	107
5.4.1	Welfare Maximization	107
5.4.2	Optimal Off-Peak-Period Output	109
5.4.3	Optimal Peak-Period Output	110
5.4.4	Optimal Network Size Condition	111
5.4.5	Interior Solution	112
5.4.6	Corner Solutions	113
5.4.7	Second-Order Conditions	114
6	Airport Quotas (“Airport Slots”)	114
6.1	Individual Quotas	115
6.1.1	Determination	115
6.1.2	Initial Allocation	116
6.1.3	Welfare Analysis	116
6.2	Proportionate Constraint	118
6.2.1	Determination	118
6.2.2	Welfare Analysis	119
7	Secondary Trading	119
7.1	Strategic Behavior and Strategic Competition	120
7.1.1	Strategic Competition	120
7.1.2	Strategic Behavior	121
7.1.3	Implications	122
7.2	Trading Rules	123
7.2.1	The Hand-Back Rule (“use-it-or-lose-it”)	123
7.2.2	The Reallocation Rule (after Hand-back)	124
7.2.3	Implications	126
7.3	Trading Potentials	127
7.3.1	Airline Profits with Secondary Trading	128
7.3.2	Trading Gains and Losses	129

7.3.3	Necessary Condition: Positive Trading Potential	131
7.3.4	Sufficient Condition: Positive Market Price	132
7.3.5	Symmetric vs. Asymmetric Trading	133
7.3.6	Limitations	134
7.4	Welfare Effects	135
7.5	Asymmetric Trade without Strategic Behavior	135
7.5.1	Trading Potentials	135
7.5.2	Welfare Analysis	139
7.6	Asymmetric Trade with Babysitting	140
7.6.1	Trading Potentials	140
7.6.2	Welfare Analysis	143
7.7	Symmetric Trade without Strategic Behavior	144
7.7.1	Trading Potentials	144
7.7.2	Welfare Analysis	145
7.8	Symmetric Trade with Slot Hoarding	146
7.8.1	Trading Potentials	146
7.8.2	Welfare Analysis	148
8	Congestion Pricing	149
8.1	Determination	149
8.2	Welfare Analysis	150
9	Discussion	152
9.1	Generic Model	152
9.1.1	Equilibrium	152
9.1.2	Social Optimum	153
9.1.3	Allocation Efficiency	154
9.1.4	Model Properties	156
9.2	Individual Quotas	157
9.3	Proportionate Constraint	159
9.4	Secondary Trading	160
9.4.1	Secondary Trading with Individual Quotas	160
9.4.2	Secondary Trading with Proportionate Constraint	162
9.4.3	Strategic Airline Behavior: Two distinct Types	164
9.4.4	Secondary Trading and Market Concentration	165
9.5	Congestion Pricing	166
9.6	Reference to Previous Research	167
9.6.1	Innovations & Dissociation	167
9.6.2	Airport Quotas	168
9.6.3	Secondary Trading	169
9.6.4	Congestion Pricing	170
9.7	Review of the Assumptions	171
9.7.1	Exogenous Airline Asymmetry	171
9.7.2	Direct Flight Benefits	173
9.7.3	Network Density Benefits	174

9.7.4	Product Quality Choice	176
9.7.5	Aircraft Size and Seat Load Factor	177
9.7.6	Quality Costs	178
9.7.7	Marginal Costs	179
9.7.8	Congestion Costs	180
9.7.9	Time Costs	181
III	Simulation	182
10	Parametric Model	182
10.1	Specific Functions	182
10.2	Parameter Choice	184
10.3	Calibration	185
11	Equilibrium	186
11.1	Numeric Results	186
11.1.1	Individual Outputs	186
11.1.2	Profits, Flight Fares, Utility & Welfare	189
11.1.3	Comparison: Simple vs. Balanced Set	192
11.2	Sensitivity Analysis	193
11.2.1	Network Density Benefits	194
11.2.2	Population Wealth	195
11.2.3	Direct Flight Benefits	197
11.2.4	Peak-Period Direct Flight Benefits	199
11.2.5	Congestion and Time Costs	200
11.2.6	Marginal Costs	201
11.2.7	Hub Dominance and the Cost-Benefit-Ratio	202
12	Social Optimum	203
12.1	Numeric Results	203
12.1.1	Market Shares	203
12.1.2	Outputs, Flight Fares, Profits & Utilities	206
12.2	Sensitivity Analysis	209
12.2.1	Network Density Benefits	209
12.2.2	Population Wealth	210
12.2.3	Flight Fares	211
12.2.4	Airline Profits	213
12.2.5	Net Utility	214
12.2.6	Welfare	215
13	Allocation Efficiency	216
13.1	Numeric Results	216
13.2	Sensitivity Analysis	218
13.2.1	Individual and Overall Outputs	218
13.2.2	Airline Profits	220
13.2.3	Passenger Utility and Welfare	221

13.2.4	Relative Welfare Loss	222
13.3	Distributional Effects	223
14	Allocation Instruments	224
14.1	Individual Quotas	224
14.2	Proportionate Constraints	226
14.3	Secondary Trading	229
14.4	Congestion Pricing	230
15	Discussion	231
15.1	Equilibrium	232
15.2	Social Optimum	233
15.3	Allocation Efficiency	233
15.4	Allocation Instruments	234
15.5	Distributional Analysis	236
IV	Conclusion	237
16	Summary	237
16.1	Study Design	237
16.2	Market Structure	239
16.3	Allocation Instruments	239
17	Conclusions	241
17.1	Individual Quotas	241
17.2	Proportionate Constraint	242
17.3	Secondary Trading with Individual Quotas	243
17.4	Secondary Trading with Proportionate Constraint	245
17.5	Congestion Pricing	246
17.6	Unique Contributions	248
18	Limitations & Outlook	249
18.1	Single Airport vs. Airport Network	249
18.2	Traditional Market Power	251
18.3	Exogenous Airline Asymmetry	252
18.4	Dependent Quality Choice	253
18.5	Nondiscriminatory Pricing	255
18.6	Inefficient Slot Babysitting	256
18.7	Generic Functional Forms	258
19	Implications for Practice	259
19.1	Regulation Policy	259
19.2	Strategic Airline Behavior	263

19.3 Excess Airport Demand and Market Power	264
19.4 Final Remark	265

References	267
-------------------	------------

List of Figures

3.1	Foundations - Dual Distortion	45
4.1	Literature - Airport Capacity Allocation	59
5.1	Generic Model - Causal Relations	82
5.2	Generic Model - Network Structure	87
5.3	Generic Model - Travel Benefits and Demand	97
5.4	Equilibrium - Network Value Function	106
10.1	Equilibrium - Market Coverage and Population Range	185
11.1	Equilibrium - Net Utility and Peak-Period Preference	191
11.2	Equilibrium - Outputs and Network Density Benefits	194
11.3	Equilibrium - Individual Outputs and Θ	195
11.4	Equilibrium - Outputs and Direct Flight Benefits	197
11.5	Equilibrium - Flight Volume and Direct Flight Benefits	198
11.6	Equilibrium - Outputs and relative Peak-Period Bonus	200
11.7	Equilibrium - Individual Outputs and Congestion Costs	200
11.8	Equilibrium - Individual Outputs and Marginal Costs	201
11.9	Equilibrium - Total Outputs and Marginal Costs	202
12.1	Social Optimum - Outputs and Network Density Benefits	209
12.2	Social Optimum - Outputs and Population Wealth	210
12.3	Social Optimum - Flight Fares and Network Density Benefits	212
12.4	Social Optimum - Airline Profits and Network Density Benefits	213
12.5	Social Optimum - Net Utility and Network Density Benefits	215
12.6	Social Optimum - Welfare and Network Density Benefits	215
13.1	Market Distortions - Output in Equilibrium	219
13.2	Market Distortions - Airline Profits	220
13.3	Market Distortions - Passenger Utility and Welfare	221
13.4	Market Distortions - Relative Welfare Loss	222
14.1	Individual Quotas - Airline Profits and Welfare	225
14.2	Individual Quotas - Welfare Gains and Losses	226
14.3	Proportionate Constraint - Welfare Losses for $q = 0.8$	227
14.4	Proportionate Constraint - Welfare, q and δ	228
14.5	Proportionate Constraint - Relative Welfare Loss	228

List of Tables

7.1	Asymmetric Trading Properties (without Strategic Behavior)	136
7.2	Asymmetric Trading Properties (with Strategic Behavior)	141
7.3	Symmetric Trading Properties (without Strategic Behavior)	144
7.4	Symmetric Trading Properties (with Strategic Behavior)	146
10.1	Simulation - Parameter Values	184
11.1	Equilibrium - Individual Outputs	187
11.2	Equilibrium - Flight Fares, Profits, Net Utility	190
12.1	Social Optimum - Characteristic θ 's	204
12.2	Social Optimum - Outputs, Flight Fares, Profits & Utility	207
13.1	Simulation - Inefficiencies in Equilibrium	217