

Reforming Rome

Karl Barth and Vatican II

Donald W. Norwood

WILLIAM B. EERDMANS PUBLISHING COMPANY
GRAND RAPIDS, MICHIGAN / CAMBRIDGE, U.K.

Contents

FOREWORD, <i>by Baroness Helena Kennedy</i>	xii
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	xiv
ABBREVIATIONS	xvi
Introduction	xvii
1. Why Rome? Why Reform? Why Barth?	1
Why Rome?	1
Why Reform?	6
Reform and the Scandal of Sexual Abuse	9
Why Barth?	11
Why Only Barth?	13
Barth as a “Catholic” and Ecumenical Theologian for the Whole Church	15
Ecumenical and Polemical	18
How Can One Who Is Not a Roman Catholic Assist the Reform of Rome?	23
2. Reforming Rome: Continuing the Reformation	25
Reformation and Reunion, Barth and Congar	25
Catholic Challenges to Be More “Catholic”	29
Straight Talking and Dialogue	32
	vii

The Reformers and Their Hopes for a Free Reforming Council	35
Vatican II: The Council the Reformers Hoped For?	39
What Influence Did Barth and the Observers Have?	42
Specific Influences	46
Examples of the Observers' Influence	47
<i>Scripture</i>	47
<i>Tradition</i>	47
<i>Church</i>	48
<i>Roman Catholic Ecumenism and the</i> <i>World Council of Churches</i>	48
<i>Israel and the Jews Today</i>	53
<i>Human Rights</i>	53
<i>East/West Conflict and Communism</i>	54
<i>Mary Co-Redeemer and Mother of the Church?</i>	55
Is the Reformation Over?	55
3. Responding to Vatican II, Part 1	57
The Surprise Announcement	57
Barth's Excitement and Cautious Expectations	59
Barth's Summing Up of Main Issues at Vatican II	61
<i>Dei Verbum</i>	62
<i>Scripture and Tradition</i>	64
<i>Hierarchy of Truths</i>	65
<i>Tradition and Magisterium</i>	66
<i>Lumen Gentium</i>	70
Vatican Documents about the Church	71
<i>People of God and/or Body of Christ</i>	72
<i>Body of Christ, Head of the Body</i>	74
<i>People of God and Vox Populi</i>	77
Subsistit in	78
<i>Eucharist Makes the Church?</i>	80
<i>Local Church and/or Universal Church</i>	81
<i>Authority beyond the Local Church</i>	83

4. Responding to Vatican II, Part 2	85
Barth as Questioner	85
<i>Humanae Vitae</i> and the Challenge to Papal Authority	86
Papacy as a Question for All Christians	88
Can Only a Pope Get Things Done and Speak for All Christians?	90
How Does Barth Contribute to the Debate? Barth on Pope and Polity	91
Papal Infallibility?	94
Is the Pope Successor of Peter?	97
Irreformable Dogmas?	99
What More Did Barth Say about Hierarchy and Apostolic Succession?	102
Does It Matter to God How the Church Is Ordered?	104
What about the Hierarchy?	106
What about the Laity?	108
The Ministry of the Community: Is Barth's Radically Different Approach to Questions of Ministry Ecumenically Helpful?	110
Responding to Vatican II's Unfinished Agenda: Laity, Community of Women and Men?	113
Collegiality?	115
Collegial Theology	116
5. Reforming or Converting Karl Barth:	
Roman Catholic Critics	118
Dialogue Is Two-Way	118
Converted Critics	121
Is Barth Sufficiently "Catholic"?	122
Six Fundamental Roman Catholic Criticisms of Barth	124
Misunderstandings or Valid Criticisms?	125
Provisional Ecclesiology	126
<i>Criticisms of Barth: Ecclesial Mediation</i>	127

<i>Baptism and Sacraments</i>	128
<i>Human Cooperation in Salvation</i>	135
<i>Church as Event and Institution</i>	138
<i>The Work of the Holy Spirit in the Church</i>	143
<i>The Church Universal</i>	145
The Question of Woman, a Question Addressed to Barth <i>and</i> Rome	146
<i>Vatican II and Women</i>	146
<i>Women Arguing with Barth</i>	149
<i>Moving on from Barth: Post-Vatican II Partnership of Barth Scholars and Feminists</i>	158
Can Barth, with the Help of His Critics, Women and Men, Help Reform Rome?	163
6. Differences That Still Divide?	165
After Vatican II, Are There Still Differences That Divide?	165
Justification by Faith	167
Natural Knowledge of God and the <i>Analogia Entis</i>	177
Mary and Joseph, Immaculate Conception, and the Assumption of the Blessed Virgin	182
Hierarchy of Truths	192
7. The Rediscovery of Unity	197
Unity in Theory and Practice: Vatican II as an Example of Unity	198
Jewish Comment: The Joy of Acceptance	200
Pope John XXIII's Vision	201
The Council Was an "Event"	202
The Restoration of Unity, an Event Not of Our Making	204
Saying Yes, "placet," to God's Will	205
Praying Together	206
Responding to the Word	208
Receptive Ecumenism	211

The Ecumenical Gift Exchange	213
Catholic Learning	215
Universal Catholicity	216
Pastoral Council	217
Subsidiarity	219
Conciliar Consensus and Discerning Truth through Debate	220
Does Barth Have Anything to Add to Discussions about Bishops?	220
Mission, Ecumenism, or an Interfaith Issue? The Jewish Question	222
Concluding Comment	230
Postscript: Joy and Peace and a New Pope	231
Bibliography	233
INDEX OF NAMES	258
INDEX OF SUBJECTS	262