

Resisting United Nations Security Council Resolutions

Sufyan Droubi

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	x
<i>Table of cases</i>	xi
<i>Preface</i>	xiv
<i>Introduction</i>	xvi
1 The powers of the United Nations Security Council and resistance to its resolutions	1
1.1 Scope of the powers of the UNSC and mandatory resolutions	1
1.2 Addressees of mandatory UNSC resolutions	3
1.3 The effects of mandatory resolutions	5
1.4 Interpreting Council resolutions for the ascertainment of their nature	7
1.5 Resolutions in accordance with the Charter, the presumption against normative conflict and voidability	10
1.6 The Council's competence to decide, States' powers of autointerpretation and judicial review by the ICJ	11
1.7 Resistance to <i>prima facie</i> mandatory resolutions	14
2 UN Charter as a constitution and the notion of constitutional resistance	27
2.1 The Charter as a constitution	27
2.2 Purposes and Principles of the UN	30
2.3 Peremptory norms of international law	34
2.4 Doctrine of implied powers	38
2.5 Rule of law at the UN and international levels	41
2.6 The notion of constitutional resistance	44
3 South African resistance to the demands that it abandon apartheid and withdraw from Namibia	56
3.1 South Africa's arguments	56
3.2 Summary of the main resolutions of the Security Council addressing apartheid	58
3.3 Summary of the main resolutions of the Security Council addressing Namibia	62

3.4	Debates and voting in the Council	65
3.5	The ICJ on Namibia	67
3.6	Review of the lawfulness of South Africa's resistance and conclusion	70
4	Iraq's resistance to economic sanctions, with focus on its opposition to the implementation of humanitarian exemptions	77
4.1	Summary of the main resolutions of the Council in their respective contexts	78
4.2	Debates and voting in the Council	81
4.3	Iraq's resistance and arguments	82
4.4	Failure of the exemptions regime and of the OFF programme: the economic embargo as one of the causes of the humanitarian hardship	84
4.5	Reaction of international organisations	85
4.6	Evolution of the understanding of the aims of economic embargoes	86
4.7	Assessment of the embargo and OFF mechanism	88
4.8	Review of the lawfulness of Iraq's resistance and conclusion	89
5	Bosnia and Herzegovina's noncompliance with the arms embargo	96
5.1	Summary of the main resolutions of the Council	96
5.2	Resort to the General Assembly	98
5.3	Resort to the International Court of Justice	101
5.4	Resort to the Organisation of the Islamic Conference	103
5.5	Reaction of the Council	104
5.6	Resistance to the embargo and its justification	107
5.7	Reports of the Secretary-General	109
5.8	Commentary concerning the right to self-defence and the Security Council	111
5.9	Review of the lawfulness of resistance and conclusion	112
6	Libya's noncompliance with determinations for the surrender of suspects and payment of compensation	120
6.1	Summary of the main resolutions of the Council	120
6.2	Debates and voting in the Council	122
6.3	Resort to the International Court of Justice	125
6.4	Resort to the League of Arab States, Organisation of the Islamic Conference, Non-Aligned Movement and Organisation of African Unity	128
6.5	Strength of the claims of unlawfulness of the Council's resolutions	130
6.6	Differences between Libya and other cases in which extradition was determined by the UNSC	134
6.7	Review of the lawfulness of resistance and conclusion	136

7	Iran's noncompliance with demands that it suspend nuclear activities and comply with the Protocol Additional to the Safeguards Agreement	145
7.1	Legal background	145
7.2	The case of Iraq	148
7.3	The case of the Democratic Popular Republic of Korea	149
7.4	Summary of the main resolutions of the IAEA Board of Governors	150
7.5	Summary of the main resolutions of the Council	151
7.6	Debates and voting in the Council	153
7.7	Strength of the claims on unlawfulness of the Council's resolutions	155
7.8	Review of the lawfulness of resistance and conclusion	159
8	Targeted sanctions on individuals suspected of terrorism	167
8.1	Summary of the main resolutions of the Council	168
8.2	The <i>Kadi</i> case	172
8.3	The <i>Abdelrazik, Othman</i> and <i>Nada</i> cases	177
8.4	Debates in the Council	180
8.5	Impacts of the decisions on the 1267 regime	181
8.6	Review of the 1267/1989 regime by the Special rapporteur	183
8.7	Review of the lawfulness of resistance and conclusion	186
9	Critique of the prevalent theories	194
9.1	Ciobanu: right of last resort as a political determination of a preliminary objection to political organs of the UN	194
9.2	De Wet: right of last resort for the protection of fundamental norms	200
9.3	Tzanakopoulos: civil disobedience to the Council as a countermeasure to the unlawfulness of a resolution	204
10	Resisting UNSC resolutions	212
10.1	Member States' obligation towards peace and security	212
10.2	Resistance as a mechanism to foster development of the law of the UN	216
10.3	State resistance and civil disobedience	219
10.4	Government resistance and State resistance	222
10.5	Resisting UNSC resolutions	225
	Conclusion	230
	<i>Bibliography</i>	234
	<i>Index</i>	244

Table of cases

Abdelrazik v. Canada (Minister of Foreign Affairs), 2010 Federal Courts Reports (Canada) 267 (Federal Court 2009).....	177, 181, 190, 205
Admissibility of Hearings of Petitioners by the Committee on South West Africa. Advisory Opinion, 1956 ICJ Reports 23 (ICJ 1956).....	67, 75
Application of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, Provisional Measures, Order of 13 September 1993, 1993 ICJ Reports 325 (ICJ 1993).....	xviii, 26, 51, 114, 115
Case of Al-Adsani v. the United Kingdom (Application no. 35763/97), 2001-XI Reports of Judgments and Decisions (European Court of Human Rights, Grand Chamber 2001)	35, 51
Case T-85/09 Yassin Abdullah Kadi v. European Commission, 2010 Reports of Cases (European General Court (Seventh Chamber) 2010)	181, 182, 189
Case T-306/01 Ahmed Ali Yusuf and Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities, 2005 II-03533 Reports of Cases (ECJ) (Court of First Instance (Second Chamber, extended composition) 2005)	189
Case T-315/01 Yassin Abdullah Kadi v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities, 2005 II-03649 Reports of Cases (ECJ) (Court of First Instance (Second Chamber, extended composition) 2005)	173, 180, 181, 182, 186, 189
Case T-318/01 Othman v. Council and Commission, 2009 Reports of Cases (ECJ) (Court of First Instance (Seventh Chamber) 2009)	178, 181, 182, 190
Caso de la Masacre de La Rochela v. Colombia, 132 (Corte Interamericana de Derechos Humanos 2007)	51
Caso Maritza Urrutia v. Guatemala (Corte Interamericana de Derechos Humanos 2003)	35, 51
Certain Expenses of the United Nations (Article 17, paragraph 2, of the Charter), Advisory Opinion, 1962 ICJ Reports 151 (ICJ 1962)	10, 12, 24, 25, 39, 40, 52, 195, 198, 208, 209
Competence of the International Labour Organization to Regulate, Incidentally, the Personal Work of the Employer, Series B – N. 13 Publications of the Permanent Court of International Justice 5 (Permanent Court of International Justice 1926)	39, 52

Dred Scott v. Sandford, 60 US 393, 1857	46, 55
East Timor (Portugal v. Australia), Judgment, 1995 ICJ Reports 90 (ICJ 1995)	55
Effect of awards of compensation made by the UN Administrative Tribunal, Advisory Opinion, 1954 ICJ Reports 47 (ICJ 1954)	39, 40, 52
Her Majesty's Treasury (Respondent) v. Mohammed Jabar Ahmed and others (FC) (Appellants); Her Majesty's Treasury (Respondent) v. Mohammed al-Ghabra (FC) (Appellant); R (on the application of Hani El Sayed Sabaei Youssef) (Respondent) v. Her Majesty's Treasury (Appellant), 2010 UKSC 2 (UK Supreme Court 2010)	191
International Status of South West Africa, Advisory Opinion, 1950 ICJ Reports 128 (ICJ 1950)	67, 74, 75
Joined Cases C-402/05 P and C-415/05 P Yassin Abdullah Kadi and Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities, 2008 Reports of Cases (ECJ) (European Court of Justice (Grand Chamber) 2008).....	173, 175, 178, 180, 181, 182, 189
Joined Cases C-584/10 P, C-593/10 P and C-595/10 P European Commission and Others v. Yassin Abdullah Kadi, not yet published (European Court of Justice (Grand Chamber) 2013)	175, 181, 182, 190
Jurisdiction of the European Commission of the Danube Between Galatz and Braila, Series B – N. 14 Publications of the Permanent Court of International Justice 5 (Permanent Court of International Justice 1927)	39, 52
Korematsu v. United States, 323 United States Reports 214, 246 (Supreme Court of the United States 1944).....	133, 143
Legal Consequences of the Construction of a Wall in the Occupied Palestinian Territory, Advisory Opinion, 2004 ICJ Reports 136 (ICJ 2004).....	227
Legal Consequences for States of the Continued Presence of South Africa in Namibia (South West Africa) notwithstanding Security Council Resolution 276 (1970). Advisory Opinion, 1971 ICJ Reports 16 (ICJ 1971)	xvii, xviii, 21, 23, 24, 25, 50, 74, 75, 76, 139, 209
Legality of the Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons, Advisory Opinion, 1996 ICJ Reports 226 (ICJ 1996).....	53, 118, 215, 227
Liversidge v. Anderson, 1941 UKHL 1 (United Kingdom House of Lords 1941)	127, 133, 140, 143
McCulloch v. Maryland, 17 United States Reports 316 (U.S. Supreme Court 1819)	39, 52
Mavrommatis Palestine Concessions, Series A – N. 2 Publications of the Permanent Court of International Justice (PCIJ 1924).....	127, 132, 140, 142
Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua (Nicaragua v. United States of America), Merits, Judgment, 1984 ICJ Reports (ICJ 1984)	14, 101, 115, 125, 131, 142
Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua (Nicaragua v. United States of America), Merits, Judgment, 1986 ICJ Reports 14 (ICJ 1986)	14, 30, 49

Missouri v. Holland, 252 United States Reports 416 (U.S. Supreme Court 1920)	52
Nabil Sayadi and Patricia Vinck (authors) v. Belgium. CCPR[C]94 1472 2006 (Comité des Droits de L'Homme – Human Rights Committee (UNCCPR) 2008)	10, 24, 191
Nada v. Switzerland [GC], no. 10593/08, 2012 Reports of Judgments and Decisions (European Court of Human Rights 2012)	11, 24, 182, 190
Oliver Brown, et al. v. Board of Education of Topeka, et al., 347 United States Reports 483 (Supreme Court of the United States 1954).....	195, 208
Prosecutor v. Anto Furundzija, Trial Chamber, Case No IT-95-17/1-T (International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia 1998)..	35, 50, 51
Questions of Interpretation and Application of the 1971 Montreal Convention Arising from the Aerial Incident at Lockerbie (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya v. United States of America), Provisional Measures, 1992 ICJ Reports 3, 1992 ICJ Reports 114 (ICJ 1992).....	5, 22, 134, 135, 136, 138, 139, 140, 141, 142, 143
Questions of Interpretation and Application of the 1971 Montreal Convention Arising from the Aerial Incident at Lockerbie (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya v. United States of America), Preliminary Objections, 1998 ICJ Reports 9, 1998 ICJ Reports 115 (ICJ 1998)	13, 14, 16, 17, 25, 139, 140
Questions Relating to the Obligation to Prosecute or Extradite (Belgium v. Senegal), 2012 ICJ Reporter 1 (International Court of Justice 2012).....	22, 51, 143
Reparation for Injuries Suffered in the Service of the United Nations, Advisory Opinion, 1949 ICJ Reports 174 (ICJ 1949).....	49, 52
R v. Jones (Appellant) [2006] UKHL 16, paragraph 89	205, 219
South West Africa Cases (Ethiopia v. South Africa; Liberia v. South Africa), Preliminary Objections, Judgment, 1962 ICJ Reports 319 (ICJ 1962).....	67 75
South West Africa Cases, Second Phase, Judgment, 1966 ICJ Reports 6 (ICJ 1966)	67, 76, 76
Tadic (Case No IT-94-1-AR72) (Jurisdiction) (Appeals Chamber), 105 International Law Report (International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia 1995)	53
Territorial Dispute (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya/Chad), Judgment, 1994 ICJ Reports 6 (ICJ 1994).....	137
The Case of the S.S. 'Lotus', Series A. – No. 10 Publications of the Permanent Court of International Justice 1, 19 (Permanent Court of International Justice 1927).....	215, 227
Voting Procedure on Questions Relating to Reports and Petitions Concerning the Territory of South West Africa. Advisory Opinion, 1955 ICJ Reports 67 (ICJ 1955).....	67, 75
Western Sahara, Advisory Opinion, 1975 ICJ Reports 12 (ICJ 1975).....	33, 50