

The Formation of the Babylonian Talmud

DAVID WEISS HALIVNI

*Introduced, Translated,
and Annotated by*

JEFFREY L. RUBENSTEIN

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

<i>Biography of David Weiss Halivni</i>	ix
<i>Translation Conventions</i>	xi
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xv
<i>Translator's Introduction</i>	
Jeffrey L. Rubenstein	xvii
<i>Author's Introduction</i>	
David Weiss Halivni	xxxi

Part I: The Stammaim 3

The Period of the Stammaim	4
The Saboraic Era	6
Evidence for the Dating of the Stammaitic Period	11
Differences between My Account and That of Sherira Gaon	25
The Stammaitic Era and the Closing of the Talmud	28
Stammaitic Strata	29
Early Anonymous Passages	43
External Signs of Unattributed Statements	44
(A) “And Some State It Anonymously”	44
(B) “The Master Stated”	46
(C) Combination of Different Opinions into a Dispute	47
Internal Markers of Anonymous Dicta	50
(A) Brief Explanations	50
(B) Questions Preceding Amoraic Responses	51
(C) Attributed Scriptural Interpretations That also Appear Anonymously	52
(D) Brief Explanations That are Scriptural Interpretations	53

Why Did Previous Chroniclers and Authors Fail to Mention the Stammaim?	54
Explanations of Amoraic Dicta Understood as the Amora's Own Words	57
 <i>Part II: The Editing of the Talmud</i> 63	
Contradictions in the Talmud	65
(A) Contradictions across the Talmud	65
(B) Contradictions on the Same Folio	67
“Rav Ashi and Ravina—the End of <i>hora'ah</i> ”	85
Forced Responses about Statements of Rav Ashi	88
Disagreements between Rav Aha and the Second Ravina	92
Rabbana Ashi, the Closing and Editing of the Talmud	98
The Editor of the Mishnah and His Role in Editing	103
Differences between the Closing of the Mishnah and of Baraitot and the Closing of the Traditions of the Amoraim and Stammaim	112
 <i>Part III: Apodictic Transmission and Dialectical Argumentation</i> 117	
The Development of Dialectical Argumentation in the Halakhic Midrashim, in the Yerushalmi and in the Bavli	117
The Transmitters (<i>Tannaim</i>)	133
The Stammaim as “Reciters” and as Editors	138
Forced Explanations	143
The Dialectical Argumentation of the Talmud Is Not Amoraic	145
Aspects of the Methods of Reconstruction of the Stammaim	150
 <i>Part IV: Compilers and Transposers</i> 155	
Compilers	156
Transposers and Types of Transpositions	168
Five Additional Observations	184
By Way of Conclusion	188
 <i>Part V: Postscript</i> 191	
The Anonymous Stratum of the Mishnah, Yerushalmi, and Halakhic Midrashim in Comparison to that of the Bavli	191

The Anonymous Stratum of the Mishnah	192
The Anonymous Stratum of the Yerushalmi	193
The Anonymous Stratum of the Halakhic and Aggadic Midrashim	195
Addendum	199
<i>Notes</i>	205
<i>Translator's Annotations</i>	267
<i>Selected Bibliography</i>	291
<i>Source Index</i>	293
<i>Subject Index</i>	301