

**Transfer of legal ownership in tangible movable property:  
The effects of mistake and other defects on the passage of title**

Dissertation  
der Rechtswissenschaftlichen Fakultät  
der Universität Zürich

zur Erlangung der Würde eines Doktors der Rechtswissenschaft

vorgelegt von

**Samuel Zogg**

von Fehraltorf ZH

genehmigt auf Antrag von

Prof. Dr. Wolfgang Ernst

und

Prof. Dr. Andrew Burrows

## Table of Contents

<i>Foreword</i>	<i>i</i>
<i>Table of Contents</i>	<i>iii</i>
<i>Table of Abbreviations</i>	<i>vii</i>
<i>Bibliography</i>	<i>xv</i>
<b>Part I: Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
§ 1 Subject-matter and scope of the analysis	1
§ 2 Plan and structure of the book	2
<b>Part II: Defective transfers of ownership: A general introduction</b>	<b>2</b>
§ 3 Three distinct levels where a defect might operate: Property, contract and unjust factors	3
A. The three levels	3
B. Interrelation between the three levels	6
C. Mistake as an example: Confused terminology	6
§ 4 Contractual and non-contractual transfers of property	7
A. Contractual transfers of property	8
I. Valid contracts: "Curing effects"	8
1. Unjust factor regime: Contract as a justifying factor	8
2. If a defect cannot affect a contract, it can neither affect the passage of property	11
II. Terminated (discharged) contracts	11
III. Unenforceable and voidable contracts	12
B. Non-contractual transfers of property	13
I. Gifts	13
II. Transfers without (any) basis	14
III. Void contracts	15
§ 5 Defects in the formation stage and defects in the execution stage	16
<b>Part III: Transfer of legal ownership in tangible movable property</b>	<b>19</b>
§ 6 Introduction and history	19
§ 7 Transfer of legal title by delivery	23
A. Voluntary transfer of possession	23
B. Intention of the transferor to transfer ownership	25
C. Intention of the transferee to receive ownership	25
D. The principles of separation and abstraction in transfers by delivery	27
§ 8 Transfer of legal title by sale	30
A. The requirement of specific or ascertained goods	30
B. Intention of the parties to transfer ownership: Contractual intention or principle of separation?	30
C. Transfer by sale: Principle of causality or abstraction?	36
I. Cases where the relevant contract was void and where property had <i>not</i> passed: Explainable by the doctrine of "dual defects"	37

II.	Cases where the contract was void but where property <i>did</i> pass:	
	Abstraction as the best explanation	39
III.	Arguments in favour of abstraction derived from the law of rescission	46
IV.	History and coherence	51
V.	Conclusions	52
§ 9	Scope of the transfer by sale and by delivery	53
A.	Transfer of goods for non-money consideration: Delivery required?	54
B.	Transfer of goods for no consideration: Delivery required	57
I.	In general	57
II.	Transfers carried out under void contracts: Delivery required?	58
1.	Sale of Goods Act 1979 may apply to void contracts of sale	58
2.	Consideration in transfers made under void contracts?	59
C.	Conclusions	70
§ 10	Transfer of legal title by deed	71
A.	History	72
B.	Scope of the transfer by deed	73
C.	Requirements to effect a transfer by deed	73
I.	Drawing up and delivery of a deed	73
II.	Conveyance: Real agreement	75
D.	Principle of separation: Deed may contain obligation and/or conveyance	76
E.	Abstraction or causality?	77
§ 11	Transfer of legal title by registration (a brief overview)	80
A.	Transfer of registered legal estates in land: "Super-abstract transfer"	80
B.	Registration requirements in transfers of personal property: Shares and British ships	82
	<b>Part IV: Defects which prevent the passage of legal ownership</b>	<b>84</b>
§ 12	Introduction	84
§ 13	Complete absence of intention: Theft, loss and misappropriation	86
§ 14	Lack of authority	87
§ 15	Fundamental duress	90
§ 16	Fundamental mistake	93
A.	Introduction	93
B.	Mistakes which render contracts void: An overview	94
I.	Mistakes which negative consent (no agreement)	94
II.	Mistakes which nullify consent (common mistakes)	96
C.	Mistakes which prevent the passage of legal ownership	97
I.	Introduction	97
1.	An overview	97
2.	The relevance of (old) criminal cases	98
II.	Motivational mistakes (particularly liability mistakes)	99
1.	Property not prevented from passing	99
2.	Transfers of property under contracts which are void for common mistakes	104
III.	Mistakes as to the transferee's identity	106
1.	Contract: Void or voidable?	107
(a)	Cases prior to Shogun Finance	108

(b)	The Shogun Finance case	110
(c)	Conclusions and scope of the face-to-face principle	116
2.	Proprietary transfer: Void or voidable?	118
(a)	Parallel between the contractual and the proprietary position: "Identity mistakes" as dual defects	118
(b)	Dealings at a distance: Identification by description (or otherwise than by sight)	121
(c)	Face-to-face dealings: Identification by sight	124
(d)	Conclusions	129
IV.	Mistakes as to the transferred property's identity	130
1.	Contractual level	131
(a)	Overview: Five ways how a mistake as to the contract goods may be relevant	131
(b)	Identification of the contract goods	132
2.	Proprietary level	142
(a)	The contract analogy	142
(b)	(Specific) identification at a distance by description	143
(c)	Identification by sight	144
(d)	Identification by touching (in the dark)	147
(e)	Chattels contained within other chattels	150
V.	Mistakes as to the transferred property's quantity	152
1.	Contractual level	152
(a)	Sale of generic, quasi-specific or specific goods?	152
(b)	Appropriation and the problem of s 30 of the SGA 1979	155
2.	Proprietary level	157
(a)	Overview	157
(b)	Lack of clear authority	158
(c)	The problem of identification and mixture: Co-ownership rights and the rules of following	163
(d)	The difficult distinction between genuine quantity mistakes and mere motivational (liability) mistakes	165
(e)	The difficult distinction between genuine quantity mistakes and mistakes as to the transferred property's identity or quality	170
VI.	Mistakes as to the nature of the underlying transaction: Fundamental if relating to the legal interest to be transferred	173

<b>Part V:</b>	<b>Summary</b>	<b>178</b>
----------------	----------------	------------