

Herausgegeben im Auftrag der Rechtswissenschaftlichen Fakultät
der Universität Zürich von G. Biaggini, O. Diggelmann, T. Gächter, A. Glaser,
A. Griffel, C. Kaufmann, H. Keller, R. Kiener, A. Kley, R. Matteotti,
D. Moeckli, M. Oesch, J. Reich, M. Simonek und F. Uhlmann

Julia Richter

**Soft Law in International Health
Law – the Case of the WHO's
Global Code of Practice on the
International Recruitment of
Health Personnel**

Detailed table of contents

Acknowledgements	V
Contents.....	VII
Detailed table of contents	IX
List of abbreviations	XV
Bibliography.....	XVII
Materials and Other Sources.....	LXIX
Materials of the World Health Organization	LXXV
Table of Cases	CI
Table of International and Regional Treaties and Conventions.....	CV
Other International Agreements	CIX
List of figures.....	CXIII

Introduction..... 1

I. Background	1
II. Research Questions and Course of Investigation	5
III. Methodological Approach.....	7
IV. Clarification of Terms	9
A. Towards a Definition of Soft Law	9
1. General Features of the Form-Based Approach	12
2. Other Approaches	20
3. Evaluation and Working Definition of Soft Law	23
B. Other Important Definitions	26
1. Global Public Health.....	26
2. International Health Law.....	31

Part I: The Global Health Workforce Crisis and the Need to Develop Global Responses 35

Chapter 1: Background..... 38

I. Global Shortages of Health Personnel..... 38

II. Migration and Recruitment of Health Personnel: At the Expenses of the Poor?43

A. Drivers of the Migration of Health Personnel: Push- and Pull-Factors44

B. Reinforcing Pull-Factors: International Recruitment46

Chapter 2: Responses to the Health Workforce Crisis..... 48

I. International and Regional Responses.....48

A. The Commonwealth Code of Practice.....49

B. The Pacific Code of Practice 51

II. Bilateral Responses53

III. National Responses 55

A. National Responses of Destination Countries55

B. National Responses from Source Countries57

IV. Evaluation57

Concluding Remarks 63

Part II: The Utility and Limits of Soft Law 65

Chapter 3: Negotiating Soft Law – Mitigating the Challenges of International Lawmaking? 68

I. Challenges of International Treaty-Making69

A. International Treaty-Making: Main Features and Challenges69

B. The Time-Factor.....75

II. Soft Law as a Troubleshooter?.....77

Chapter 4: The Content of Soft Law Instruments: Flexible and Precise? 81

I. Beyond the Lowest Common Denominator?81

II. Soft Law Instruments as a Flexible Alternative to International Treaty Law?.....84

A. The Presumptive Inertia of Hard International Law84

B. Soft Law: A Flexible Alternative?.....	87
Chapter 5: Soft Law and the Inclusion of Non-State Actors	90
I. Basic Legal Questions Regarding Non-State Actors in Public International Law: A State-Centred Domain?	95
A. The Legal Personality of Non-State Actors: A Controversial Issue	95
B. Non-State Actors as Addressees?.....	98
C. Participation in International Lawmaking: Limited Access for Non- State Actors?	99
II. Soft law and the Integration of Non-State Actors	103
A. Soft Law and the Inclusion of Non-State Actors as Lawmakers	104
B. Soft law and the Inclusion of Non-State Actors as Addressees.....	106
III. Hazards of the Inclusion of Non-State Actors.....	107
Chapter 6: The Legal Effects of Soft Law	110
I. Soft Law as a Predecessor of Hard Law.....	111
A. Soft Law as a Predecessor of International, Regional and National Legislation.....	111
B. Soft Law as a Predecessor of Customary International Law	115
1. The Main Elements of Customary International Law	115
2. Soft Law as Customary International Law?	117
II. General Principles of Law and Soft Law.....	118
III. Soft Law Instruments as a Complement to International Hard Law	121
Chapter 7: Limitations and Objections to the Conception of Soft Law	125
I. Practical Objections to Soft Law	125
II. Doctrinal Objections to Soft Law.....	129
A. Objections Based on Legal Positivism	129
B. “Complexity”-Objection	131
Concluding Remarks	133
Part III: Soft Law in International Health Law - the WHO’s Code of Practice on the International Recruitment of Health Personnel.....	135
Chapter 8: Evolution of the Code of Practice: the Choice of Soft Law	138
I. The Legal mandate of the WHO	138

A.	Background	139
B.	Legally Binding Instruments	140
C.	Soft Law Instruments	143
II.	Development of the Global Code of Practice	145
A.	Towards a Global Code of Practice – Important Steps	145
1.	Initiation of Code Development and First Phase	146
2.	Becoming More Concrete: Development and Negotiations of Draft Codes	149
3.	Adoption of the Code of Practice at the 63 rd World Health Assembly	152
4.	Evaluation of the Development of the Code of Practice	153
B.	Main Challenges in the Development of the Code of Practice	155
1.	The Complexity of Health Workforce Regulation: Fuelling Political and Economic Controversies	155
2.	Reducing Global Health Disparities: Compensation for Brain Drain Losses?	159
C.	Discussions on the Legal Form of the Code of Practice	164
1.	Controversies on the Legal Form	165
2.	The Choice of Soft Law	166
i.	Why Were Article 19 or 21 WHO Constitution Not Applied?	167
ii.	Mitigation of Political and Economic Controversies through Soft Law: Prevention of Negotiation Deadlocks	169
iii.	Rapidity	172
III.	A Lack of Democratic Legitimacy?	173
IV.	Intermediate Conclusion	174
Chapter 9: The WHO Code of Practice - Fulfilling the Promises of Soft Law?		176
I.	A Global Response to a Global Problem: Content of the Code of Practice	177
II.	Beyond the Lowest Common Denominator?	183
A.	Substantive Commitments and Precision of the Code of Practice	183
B.	Unanimous Adoption	187
III.	The Legal Character of the Code of Practice: A Trailblazer for Flexibility?	188
IV.	Intermediate Conclusion	189

Chapter 10: The Legal Nature of the Code of Practice and the Inclusion of Non-State Actors.....	192
I. The Role of Non-State Actors in the Development of the Code of Practice.....	193
II. The Code of Practice and the Responsibility of Non-State Actors.....	202
III. Critical Discussion and Conclusion.....	203
A. Soft Law as a Panacea for the Inclusion of Non-State Actors?	203
B. Constraints to the Responsibility of Non-State Actors	204
Chapter 11: Implementation of the Code of Practice: Does Soft Law Generate State Compliance?	206
I. The Code of Practice as a Predecessor of Policy Measures and Legislation?.....	210
A. Protection of the Rights of Migrant Workers	213
1. Non-Discrimination, Working Conditions and Career Opportunities.....	213
2. The Right to Leave One's Country	216
B. Health Workforce Planning and Health System Sustainability	217
1. Health Workforce Planning and National Self-Sufficiency	217
2. Ethical Recruitment Practices	220
3. Bilateral and Multilateral Agreements	221
C. Data Collection and Monitoring.....	224
1. Collection, Exchange and Analysis of Data	224
2. Information Exchange and Monitoring	227
D. Importance of Awareness-Building.....	228
E. International Assistance and Cooperation	230
F. Non-State Actors and the Implementation of the Code of Practice	232
G. The Role of International Organisations for the Implementation of the Code of Practice	236
1. The Role of the WHO	236
2. The Role of Other International Organisations	238
II. The Code of Practice as a Predecessor of Customary International Law?	241
A. WHA Resolutions as Elements of Customary International Law?.....	241
B. The Code of Practice and the Determination of Customary International Law	245
III. General Principles of International Law and the Code of Practice.....	247
IV. The Code of Practice as a Complement to International Treaty Law?	248
V. Summary and Evaluation	250

**Discussion and Conclusion: Lessons for the Future –
Soft Law in International Health Law as an Alternative
to Hard Law?253**

I. Synthesis – the Legal Nature of the Code of Practice: Successes and
Limits255

 A. Soft Law and the Code of Practice: Summary of the Main Results255

 B. Discussion259

II. Outlook263