

ASPEN PUBLISHERS

MODERN AMERICAN REMEDIES
CASES AND MATERIALS

Fourth Edition

Douglas Laycock

Yale Kamisar Collegiate Professor of Law
University of Michigan
(to 2010)

Armistead M. Dobie Professor of Law
Horace W. Goldsmith Research Professor of Law
University of Virginia
(from 2010)

Alice McKean Young Regents Chair in Law Emeritus
University of Texas



Wolters Kluwer

Law & Business

AUSTIN BOSTON CHICAGO NEW YORK THE NETHERLANDS

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	xxiii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xxix

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION	1
The Role of Remedies	1
Classifying Remedies	3
Substitutionary and Specific Remedies	5
Legal and Equitable Remedies	6
Note on the Nature of Remedies	7
The Modern Remedies Course	8

CHAPTER 2

PAYING FOR HARM: COMPENSATORY DAMAGES	11
A. The Basic Principle: Restoring Plaintiff to His Rightful Position	11
<i>United States v. Hatahley</i>	11
Notes on the Basic Principle	14
B. Value as the Measure of the Rightful Position	18
<i>In re September 11th Litigation</i>	18
Notes on Market Value	22
Notes on "Value to the Owner"	26
<i>Trinity Church v. John Hancock Mutual Life Insurance Co.</i>	28
Notes on Special-Purpose Property	32
Notes on Repair Costs	33
Notes on Property That Fluctuates in Value	34
C. Expectancy and Reliance as Measures of the Rightful Position	35
<i>Neri v. Retail Marine Corp.</i>	35
Notes on §2-708(2) and Attempts to Codify Remedies	37
Notes on Expectancy and Reliance	39
Notes on Compensating Expectancies	42
<i>Chatlos Systems, Inc. v. National Cash Register Corp.</i>	45
Notes on Excessive Expectancies	47
<i>Smith v. Bolles</i>	50
Notes on Expectancy in Tort	50

D. Consequential Damages	52
<i>Buck v. Morrow</i>	52
Notes on General and Special Damages	53
Notes on the Vocabulary of Damages	55
<i>Meinrath v. Singer Co.</i>	58
Notes on Consequential Damages from Failure to Pay Money	60
<i>Texaco, Inc. v. Pennzoil Co.</i>	62
Notes on an Eleven-Figure Verdict	65
E. Limits on Damages	67
1. The Parties' Power to Specify the Remedy	67
<i>Kearney & Trecker Corp. v. Master Engraving Co.</i>	67
Notes on Limitation-of-Remedy Clauses	72
<i>In re Trans World Airlines, Inc.</i>	74
Notes on Liquidated-Damage and Penalty Clauses	77
<i>Northern Illinois Gas Co. v. Energy Cooperative, Inc.</i>	81
Notes on Underliquidated-Damage Clauses	83
2. Avoidable Consequences, Offsetting Benefits, and Collateral Sources	85
<i>S.J. Groves & Sons Co. v. Warner Co.</i>	85
Notes on Avoidable Consequences	88
Notes on Offsetting Benefits	93
<i>Oden v. Chemung County Industrial Development Agency</i>	95
Notes on the Collateral-Source Rule	98
3. The Scope of Liability	102
<i>Pruitt v. Allied Chemical Corp.</i>	102
Notes on the Scope of Liability	105
Notes on the Economic-Loss Rule	109
<i>Evra Corp. v. Swiss Bank Corp.</i>	112
More Notes on the Scope of Liability	116
4. Substantive Policy Goals	118
<i>Brunswick Corp. v. Pueblo Bowl-O-Mat</i>	118
Notes on Remedial Implications of Substantive Policy	122
5. The Requirement of Reasonable Certainty	124
<i>Bigelow v. RKO Radio Pictures</i>	124
Notes on the Requirement of Reasonable Certainty	129
Notes on Litigating Commercial Damages	131
F. Damages Where Value Cannot Be Measured in Dollars	134
1. Personal Injuries and Death	134
<i>Debus v. Grand Union Stores</i>	134
Notes on Pain and Suffering	137
Notes on Wrongful Death	141
Notes on Remedies for September 11 Victims	149
2. The Controversy over Tort Law	151
<i>Arbino v. Johnson & Johnson</i>	151
Notes on the Controversy over Tort Law	159
Notes on Valuing Pain and Suffering and Human Life	166
3. Dignitary and Constitutional Harms	170
<i>Leuka v. City of Chicago</i>	170
Notes on Valuing Emotional Distress	174
Notes on Judicial Review of Jury Verdicts	177
Notes on Recovering Emotional Distress	178

	<i>Carey v. Piphus</i>	181
	Notes on Valuing Constitutional Rights	184
	Notes on Defamation Damages	187
G.	Taxes, Time, and the Value of Money	187
1.	The Impact of Taxes	187
	<i>Norfolk & Western Railway v. Liepelt</i>	187
	Notes on Taxes	191
2.	Interest on Past Damages	193
	<i>City of Milwaukee v. Cement Division, National Gypsum Company</i>	193
	Notes on Interest	197
3.	The Net Present Value of Future Damages	200
	<i>Jones & Laughlin Steel Corp. v. Pfeifer</i>	200
	Notes on the September 11 Calculations	207
	Notes on Discounting to Present Value	208
	Notes on Race- and Sex-Based Data	211
	Notes on Periodic Payments and Structured Settlements	212
	Notes on Damages in Foreign Currency	215

CHAPTER 3

PUNITIVE REMEDIES 217

A.	Punitive Damages	217
1.	Common Law and Statutes	217
	<i>Exxon Shipping Co. v. Baker</i>	217
	Notes on Punitive Damages	225
	Notes on Measuring Punitive Damages	230
2.	The Constitution	233
	<i>State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. v. Campbell</i>	233
	Notes on Constitutional Limits on Punitive Damages	237
	<i>Philip Morris USA v. Williams</i>	241
	More Notes on Constitutional Limits on Punitive Damages	245
3.	Punitive Damages in Contract	248
	<i>Formosa Plastics Corp. USA v. Presidio Engineers and Contractors, Inc.</i>	248
	Notes on Punitive Damages in Contract	252
B.	Other Punitive Remedies	257
1.	Statutory Recoveries by Private Litigants	257
2.	Civil Penalties Payable to the Government	259

CHAPTER 4

PREVENTING HARM: THE MEASURE OF INJUNCTIVE RELIEF 263

A.	The Scope of Injunctions	263
1.	Preventing Wrongful Acts	263
	<i>Almurbati v. Bush</i>	263
	Notes on Ripeness	265

	<i>Marshall v. Goodyear Tire & Rubber Co.</i>	269
	Notes on the Scope of Injunctions to Prevent Wrongful Acts	271
	Note on Individual and Class Injunctions	275
	<i>United States v. W.T. Grant Co.</i>	276
	Notes on Voluntary Cessation of Wrongful Acts	278
2.	Preventing Lawful Acts That Might Have Wrongful Consequences	280
	<i>Nicholson v. Connecticut Half-Way House, Inc.</i>	280
	Notes on Ripeness and Uncertain Consequences	282
	<i>PepsiCo, Inc. v. Redmond</i>	284
	Notes on Prophylactic Injunctions	287
	An Aside: Preventive Relief at Law	293
3.	Repairing the Consequences of Past Wrongful Conduct	295
	<i>Forster v. Boss</i>	295
	Notes on Reparative Injunctions	297
	Notes on Coordinating Multiple Remedies	300
	<i>Winston Research Corp. v. Minnesota Mining & Manufacturing Co.</i>	300
	Notes on Reparative Injunctions and the Rightful Position	303
	<i>Bailey v. Proctor</i>	304
	Notes on Equitable Discretion	307
4.	Ending Complex Violations—and Their Consequences— in Large Institutions	310
a.	A Case Study: School Desegregation	310
	Introductory Notes	310
	<i>Missouri v. Jenkins</i>	314
	Notes on the Kansas City Example	321
b.	Other Examples, and the Current Law in the Supreme Court	325
	<i>Hutto v. Finney</i>	325
	More Notes on the Measure of Injunctive Relief: The Institutional Reform Cases	329
	<i>Lewis v. Casey</i>	330
	More Notes on the Measure of Injunctive Relief: Recommitment to the Rightful Position?	333
	<i>United States v. Virginia</i>	336
	Notes on Plaintiffs' Use of the Rightful-Position Standard	338
	Notes on Paying for the Remedy	338
	Historical Notes: The Municipal Bond Cases	340
B.	Modifying Injunctions	342
	Introductory Notes	342
	<i>Horne v. Flores</i>	346
	Notes on Modification of Decrees	354
	Notes on Modification Under the Prison Litigation Reform Act	356
	Notes on Modifying School Desegregation Decrees— and Maybe Decrees More Generally	358

C. The Rights of Third Parties	359
<i>Hills v. Gautreaux</i>	359
Notes on Relief Against Third Parties	363
<i>General Building Contractors Association v. Pennsylvania</i>	366
More Notes on Relief Against Third Parties	370

CHAPTER 5

CHOOSING REMEDIES	375
A. Substitutionary or Specific Relief	375
1. Irreplaceable Losses	375
a. Injunctions	375
<i>Pardee v. Camden Lumber Co.</i>	375
<i>F.W. Mailland, Equity</i>	378
Note on Equity in the United States	380
Notes on the Reasons for the Irreparable Injury Rule	380
<i>Brook v. James A. Cullimore & Co.</i>	384
Notes on Replevin and Injunctions	385
<i>Continental Airlines, Inc. v. Intra Brokers, Inc.</i>	387
Notes on the Content of the Irreparable Injury Rule	388
b. Specific Performance of Contracts	391
<i>Campbell Soup Co. v. Wentz</i>	391
Note on Specific Performance of Contracts	393
Notes on Efficient Breach of Contract	396
Notes on Specific Performance Where Cover Is Possible	400
<i>Van Wagner Advertising Corp. v. S & M Enterprises</i>	402
Notes on Irreparable Injury and Undue Hardship	404
Notes on Personal Service Contracts	408
2. Burdens on Defendant or the Court	409
<i>Whitlock v. Hilander Foods, Inc.</i>	409
Notes on Undue Hardship	411
Notes on the Economics of Undue Hardship	414
<i>Co-operative Insurance Society Ltd. v. Argyll Stores (Holdings) Ltd.</i>	416
Notes on Practicality and Private Litigation	420
3. Other Reasons (and More of the Same Reason)	423
<i>eBay Inc. v. MercExchange, L.L.C.</i>	423
Notes on Confusion in the Supreme Court	426
<i>Willing v. Mazzocone</i>	429
Notes on Defamation Damages and Insolvent Defendants	433
Notes on Prior Restraints	435
Notes on the Right to Jury Trial	438
Notes on Avoiding a "Multiplicity of Suits"	439
B. Preliminary or Permanent Relief	440
1. The Substantive Standards for Preliminary Relief	440
<i>Winter v. Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc.</i>	440
Notes on Preliminary Relief	444

	Notes on Preserving the Status Quo	448
	<i>Coyne-Delany Co. v. Capital Development Board</i>	450
	Notes on Injunction Bonds	453
2.	The Procedure for Obtaining Preliminary Relief	456
	<i>Carroll v. President and Commissioners of Princess Anne</i>	456
	Notes on Temporary Restraining Orders	458
	<i>Sampson v. Murray</i>	460
	More Notes on Irreparable Injury	464
	Notes on Preliminary Procedure	465
C.	Prospective or Retrospective Relief	470
1.	Suits Against Officers in Their Official Capacities	470
	<i>Edelman v. Jordan</i>	470
	Notes on Prospective-Only Remedies	474
	Notes on the Evolution of Eleventh Amendment Doctrines	478
	Notes on the Reasons for Sovereign Immunity	484
2.	Suits Against Officers in Their Personal Capacities	486
	<i>Harlow v. Fitzgerald</i>	486
	Notes on Qualified Official Immunities	490
	Notes on Enforcing New Rules of Law	496
	Notes on the Fear of Damage Remedies	499

CHAPTER 6

	REMEDIES AND SEPARATION OF POWERS	501
A.	More on Governmental Immunities	501
1.	Consented Suits Against the Government	501
	<i>Stone v. North Carolina Department of Labor</i>	501
	Notes on the Public Duty Doctrine	505
	Notes on the Governmental/Proprietary Distinction	510
	Notes on the Discretionary Function Exception	511
	More Notes on Federal Waivers of Immunity	513
2.	Suits Against Officers—Absolute Immunity	517
	<i>Van de Kamp v. Goldstein</i>	517
	Notes on Prosecutorial Immunity	522
	Notes on Other Absolute Immunities	525
B.	Creating Causes of Action	530
	<i>Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents</i>	530
	Notes on Implied Remedies for Constitutional Violations	534
	<i>Alexander v. Sandoval</i>	536
	Notes on Implied Remedies for Statutory Violations	540
C.	Initiating Criminal and Administrative Remedies	545
	<i>Linda R.S. v. Richard D.</i>	545
	Notes on Private Initiation of Criminal Remedies	548
	<i>Federal Election Commission v. Akins</i>	548
	Notes on Private Initiation of Administrative Remedies	553
D.	The Right to Jury Trial	558
	<i>Chauffeurs Local No. 391 v. Terry</i>	558

Notes on the Evolution of the Federal Right to Jury Trial	565
Notes on Characterizing Claims as Legal or Equitable	568
Notes on Specialized Tribunals	571

CHAPTER 7

PREVENTING HARM WITHOUT COERCION: DECLARATORY REMEDIES	573
A. Declaratory Judgments	573
1. The General Case	573
<i>Nashville, Chattanooga, & St. Louis Railway v. Wallace</i>	573
Notes on Declaratory Judgments and Ripeness	575
Notes on Declaratory Judgments, Irreparable Injury, and Supplemental Relief	577
<i>Cardinal Chemical Co. v. Morton International, Inc.</i>	579
Notes on the <i>Young</i> Dilemma	583
Notes on Declaratory Judgments and Tactical Advantage	586
2. The Special Case of Interfering with State Enforcement Proceedings	589
<i>Steffel v. Thompson</i>	589
More Notes on the <i>Young</i> Dilemma	593
Notes on the <i>Steffel</i> Solution	595
<i>Doran v. Salem Inn, Inc.</i>	597
Notes on Preliminary Injunctions Against Prosecution	599
Notes on Federal Litigation After State-Court Judgments	602
B. Quiet Title and the Like	603
<i>Newman Machine Co. v. Newman</i>	603
Notes on Bills to Quiet Title and Related Actions	606
C. Reformation	610
<i>Hand v. Dayton-Hudson</i>	610
Notes on Reformation	613
D. Declaratory Relief at Law	615
Notes on Nominal Damages	615
Notes on Quo Warranto	616
Notes on Coram Nobis	617

CHAPTER 8

BENEFIT TO DEFENDANT AS THE MEASURE OF RELIEF: RESTITUTION	619
A. Restitution from Innocent Defendants—and Some Who Are Treated as Innocent	619
1. Introducing Restitution—Mistake	619
<i>Blue Cross Health Services, Inc. v. Sauer</i>	619

Introductory Notes on Restitution	621
Notes on the Grounds for Restitution	625
<i>Somerville v. Jacobs</i>	627
Notes on Mistaken Improvers	629
Notes on Other Grounds for Restitution	632
2. Measuring Restitution from the Innocent—and More Restitutionary Causes of Action	634
a. Court Orders Later Reversed	634
<i>State v. A.N.W. Seed Corp.</i>	634
Notes on Court Orders Later Reversed	637
b. Unenforceable Contracts and Quantum Meruit	638
<i>Anderson v. Schwegel</i>	638
Notes on Measuring Restitution from Innocent Defendants	640
<i>Farash v. Sykes Datatronics, Inc.</i>	643
Notes on the Benefit Requirement	646
B. Recovering More than Plaintiff Lost	649
1. Disgorging the Profits of Conscious Wrongdoers	649
<i>Olwell v. Nye & Nissen Co.</i>	649
Notes on Recovering More than Plaintiff Lost	651
Notes on the Causes of Action for Restitution Against Wrongdoers	655
<i>Maier Brewing Co. v. Fleischmann Distilling Corp.</i>	658
More Notes on Recovering More than Plaintiff Lost	661
2. Measuring the Profits	665
<i>Sheldon v. Metro-Goldwyn Pictures Corp.</i>	665
Notes on Apportioning Profits	669
<i>Hamil America, Inc. v. GFI</i>	671
Notes on Calculating Profits	676
3. Breach of Contract	678
a. Disgorging the Profits from Opportunistic Breach	678
<i>Snepp v. United States</i>	678
Notes on Contracts to Preserve Confidential Information	681
<i>May v. Muroff</i>	683
Notes on Disgorging the Profits from Breach of Contract	683
b. Rescission	686
<i>Mobil Oil Exploration and Producing Southeast, Inc. v. United States</i>	686
Notes on Rescission	688
Notes on Election of Remedies	691
Notes on Losing Contracts Where the Benefit Cannot Be Returned	692
Notes on Other Grounds for Rescission	694
C. Restitutionary Rights in Specific Property	695
1. Constructive Trusts	695
<i>Paoloni v. Goldstein</i>	695
Notes on Constructive Trusts	697
<i>Ruffin v. Ruffin</i>	700
More Notes on Constructive Trusts	701

	<i>In re Leitner</i>	703
	Notes on Constructive Trusts in Bankruptcy	706
2.	Tracing the Property	711
	<i>In re Erie Trust Co.</i>	711
	Notes on Tracing	713
	<i>In re JD Services, Inc.</i>	717
	Notes on the Mechanics of Tracing	719
	Notes on Advanced Tracing Issues	722
	Tracing Problems	725
3.	Equitable Liens and Subrogation	726
	<i>In re Mesa</i>	726
	Notes on Equitable Liens	729
	<i>Mort v. United States</i>	733
	Notes on Subrogation	736
	Notes on Indemnity and Contribution	740
D.	Defenses and the Rights of Third Parties	741
1.	Bona Fide Purchasers	741
	<i>Newton v. Porter</i>	741
	Notes on Tracing into the Hands of Third Parties	743
2.	Payment for Value	748
	<i>Banque Worms v. BankAmerica International</i>	748
	Notes on Paying Debts with Other People's Property	751
E.	Replevin, Ejectment, and the Like	754
	Notes on Replevin, Ejectment, and the Like	754

CHAPTER 9

	ANCILLARY REMEDIES: ENFORCING THE JUDGMENT	759
A.	Enforcing Coercive Orders: The Contempt Power	759
1.	The Three Kinds of Contempt	759
	<i>International Union, United Mine Workers v. Bagwell</i>	759
	Notes on the Three Kinds of Contempt	766
	Notes on Coercive Contempt	769
	Notes on the Yonkers Confrontation	771
	<i>Colin Diver, The Judge as Political Powerbroker:</i>	
	<i>Superintending Structural Change in Public Institutions</i>	774
2.	How Much Risk of Abuse to Overcome How Much Defiance?	775
a.	Perpetual Coercion?	775
	<i>Anyanwu v. Anyanwu</i>	775
	Notes on Perpetual Coercion	778
b.	Anticipatory Contempt	783
	<i>Griffin v. County School Board</i>	783
	Notes on Contempt of Anticipated Injunctions	787
	Notes on Contempt Statutes	790
3.	The Collateral Bar Rule	791
	<i>Walker v. City of Birmingham</i>	791
	Notes on the Duty to Obey Erroneous Injunctions	798
	<i>John Leubsdorf, Constitutional Civil Procedure</i>	804

4. The Rights of Third Parties	805
<i>Planned Parenthood Golden Gate v. Garibaldi</i>	805
Notes on Contempt Proceedings Against Third Parties	809
Notes on the Array of Theories for Binding Third Parties	812
Notes on the Notice Requirement	817
5. The Maxim That Equity Acts in Personam	818
6. Drafting Decrees	820
Notes on the Requirement That Injunctions Be Specific	820
Notes on the Rule Against Incorporating Other Documents	825
Drafting Your Own Injunction	827
B. Collecting Money Judgments	829
1. Execution, Garnishment, and the Like	829
<i>Credit Bureau, Inc. v. Moninger</i>	829
Notes on Execution	830
Notes on Exemptions	834
<i>Dixie National Bank v. Chase</i>	837
Notes on Garnishment	839
Notes on Other Means of Collecting	841
Note on Bankruptcy	845
Notes on Collecting Money from the Government	846
2. Coercive Collection of Money	848
<i>In re Marriage of Logston</i>	848
Notes on Collecting Family Support	852
Notes on Coercing the Payment of Money in Other Contexts	857
More Notes on the Irreparable Injury Rule	860
3. Preserving Assets Before Judgment	861
<i>City of New York v. CitiSource, Inc.</i>	861
Notes on Attachment	865
Notes on Prejudgment Freeze Orders	867
<i>W.E. Erickson Construction, Inc. v. Congress-Kenilworth Corp.</i>	868
Notes on Receivership	870
Notes on Ne Exeat	873

CHAPTER 10

MORE ANCILLARY REMEDIES: ATTORNEYS' FEES AND THE COSTS OF LITIGATION	877
A. Fee-Shifting Statutes	877
<i>City of Riverside v. Rivera</i>	877
Notes on the American Rule	881
Notes on Exceptions to the American Rule	882
Notes on One-Way Fee Shifting	885
Notes on the Amount of the Judgment as a Constraint on Attorneys' Fees	888

	Notes on the Prevailing-Party Requirement	890
	Notes on Calculating the Lodestar	892
B.	Attorneys' Fees from a Common Fund	894
	<i>In re Cabletron Systems, Inc. Securities Litigation</i>	894
	Notes on the Common-Fund Rule	899
	Notes on Contingency Enhancements	901
	Notes on Competing Approaches to Calculating Fee Awards	902
	Notes on Costs	908
C.	Ethical Issues in Fee Awards	909
	<i>Evans v. Jeff D.</i>	909
	Notes on Ethical Problems in Fee-Shifting Cases	917
	Notes on Ethical Problems in Common-Fund Cases	921

CHAPTER 11

	REMEDIAL DEFENSES	925
A.	Unconscionability and the Equitable Contract Defenses	925
	<i>Muhammad v. County Bank</i>	925
	Notes on the Reach of Equitable Defenses	930
	Notes on Unconscionable Contracts	931
B.	Unclean Hands and <i>In Pari Delicto</i>	935
	<i>Pinter v. Dahl</i>	935
	Notes on Unclean Hands and <i>In Pari Delicto</i>	938
C.	Estoppel and Waiver	941
1.	Equitable Estoppel	941
	<i>Geddes v. Mill Creek Country Club, Inc.</i>	941
	Notes on Equitable Estoppel	945
	Notes on Estoppel Against the Government	947
2.	Waiver	949
	<i>Carr-Gottstein Foods Co. v. Wasilla, LLC</i>	949
	Notes on Waiver	954
	Notes on Waiver by the Government	956
D.	Laches	957
	<i>Pro-Football, Inc. v. Harjo</i> (D.C. Cir. 2005)	957
	<i>Pro-Football, Inc. v. Harjo</i> (D.C. Cir. 2009)	958
	Notes on Laches	961
	Notes on the Relation Between Laches and Statutes of Limitations	963
E.	Statutes of Limitations	966
1.	Continuing Violations	966
	<i>Klehr v. A.O. Smith Corp.</i>	966
	Notes on Continuing Violations	968
	Notes on Limitations of Federal Claims	972
2.	The Discovery Rule	973
	<i>Debiec v. Cabot Corp.</i>	973
	Notes on the Discovery Rule	980
3.	Fraudulent Concealment	984
	<i>Knaysi v. A.H. Robins Co.</i>	984

Notes on Fraudulent Concealment	987
Notes on Estoppel to Assert Limitations	989
Notes on the Policy Choices in Statutes of Limitations	990

CHAPTER 12

FLUID-CLASS AND CY PRES REMEDIES	993
---	------------

<i>In re Pharmaceutical Industry Average Wholesale Price Litigation</i>	993
Notes on Class Actions for Damages	997
Notes on Fluid-Class Recoveries and Cy Pres Distributions	999
Notes on Affirmative Action as a Fluid-Class Remedy	1003
Notes on Partly Identifiable Victims	1006

APPENDIX

PRESENT VALUE TABLES	1009
-----------------------------	-------------

<i>Table of Cases</i>	1013
<i>Table of Statutes, Rules, Constitutions, Treaties, Restatements, and More</i>	1031
<i>Table of Secondary Authorities</i>	1037
<i>Index</i>	1047