Principles of International Environmental Law

FOURTH EDITION

Philippe Sands

University College London

Jacqueline Peel

University of Melbourne

With

Adriana Fabra

Universitat de Barcelona

Ruth MacKenzie

University of Westminster



Contents

Foreword xxi Preface and Acknowledgements to the Fourth Edition xxv Preface and Acknowledgements to the Third Edition xxvii Preface and Acknowledgements to the Second Edition xxix Preface and Acknowledgements to the First Edition xxxi Table of Cases xxxv Table of Treaties and Other International Instruments xxxix List of Abbreviations lxv

PART I THE LEGAL AND INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK

1 The Environment and International Society: Issues, Concepts and Definitions 3 Chapter Outline 3 Introduction: The Environmental Challenge 3 The Basis for Decision-Making: Science, Economics and Other Values 6 Science 6 Economics 8 Other Social Objectives 9 Sustainable Development 9 The International Legal Order 10 The Functions of International Law 11 Sovereignty and Territory 12 International Actors 13 The Environment and International Law: Defining Terms 14 Challenges for International Environmental Law 16 Further Reading 17 International Environmental Law: Texts, Articles and History 17 Sources of International Environmental Law 19 Primary Materials 19 International Environmental Jurisprudence 20 Secondary Materials – Journals 20 Websites 20

2 History 21

Chapter Outline 21 Introduction 21 From Early Fisheries Conventions to the Creation of the United Nations 22 From the Creation of the United Nations to Stockholm: 1945-72 26 UNCCUR 26 Development of International Environmental Rules 27 The 1972 United Nations Conference on the Human Environment 29 Stockholm Follow-up 32 From Stockholm to Rio: 1972-92 33 Post-Stockholm: Treaties and Other International Acts 33 1978 UNEP Draft Principles 35 1981 Montevideo Programme 36 1982 World Charter for Nature 37 1980 World Conservation Strategy/1991 'Caring for the Earth' Strategy 38 The Brundtland Report and the Report of the Legal Experts Group 38 Lead-up to UNCED 39 UNCED 40 The Rio Declaration 41 Agenda 21 43 UNCED Follow-up 45 Beyond UNCED: Trends and Directions 46 World Summit on Sustainable Development 48 Rio+20 Summit 48 Post Rio+20 Follow-up: Institutional Reform and the Sustainable Development Goals 49 Conclusions 50 Further Reading 51

3 Governance: States, International Organisations and Non-State Actors 52

Chapter Outline 52 Introduction 52 States 53 International Organisations 55 History of International Organisational Arrangements 55 UNCED, WSSD and the Rio+20 Summit 56 The Function and Role of International Organisations 57 Global Organisations 59 United Nations (www.un.org) 59 Coordination 60 UN General Assembly 61 UN Environment Programme (www.unep.org) 63 UN Development Programme (www.undp.org) 65 International Law Commission (www.un.org/law/ilc) 66 High-Level Political Forum on Sustainable Development (sustainabledevelopment.un.org/hlpf) 67 Other Subsidiary Bodies Established by the General Assembly 68 Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC) 69 Security Council 71 Trusteeship Council 72 International Court of Justice (www.icj-cij.org) 72 United Nations Specialised Agencies and Related Organisations 73 Food and Agriculture Organization (www.fao.org) 73

United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (www.unesco.org) 74 International Maritime Organization (www.imo.org) 75 International Labour Organization (www.ilo.org) 76 World Meteorological Organization (www.wmo.int) 76 International Civil Aviation Organization (www.icao.int) 77 UN Industrial Development Organization (www.unido.org) 77 World Health Organization (www.who.int) 77 International Atomic Energy Agency (www.iaea.org) 78 World Bank, International Monetary Fund, and World Trade Organization 79 Cooperative Arrangements 81 Other Global Institutions 81 Regional and Subregional Organisations 82 Europe and the OECD 82 Africa 86 Americas and the Caribbean 86 Asia Pacific 87 Organisations Established by Environmental Treaties 88 Non-State Actors 89 Scientific Community 90 Environmental, Health and Developmental Organisations 91 Legal Groups 92 Corporate Sector 92 Individuals and Indigenous Communities 94 The Media 95 Conclusions 96 Further Reading 97 4 International Lawmaking and Regulation 101 Chapter Outline 101 Introduction 101 Treaties 104 Environmental Treaties 106 The Treaty-Making Process 106 The 1969 Vienna Convention and Legal Issues Relating to Treaties 107 Interpretation 108 Entry into Force 110 Reservations and Interpretative Declarations 111 Relations between International Agreements 113 Amendment 115 Other International Acts 116 Acts of International Organisations 116 Conference Declarations and Other Acts 118 Customary International Law 119 State Practice 120 Opinio Juris 121 Treaties and Custom 122 Persistent Objector 124 Regional Custom 124 General Principles of International Law 125 Equity 126 Subsidiary Sources 127 Introduction to Regulatory Approaches 128

Direct Regulation 129 Environmental Quality Standards 129 Product Standards 130 Emissions Standards 131 Process Standards 131 Economic Instruments 132 Charges and Taxes 134 Tradeable Permit Schemes 135 Deposit-Refund Systems 136 Subsidies 136 Enforcement Incentives 136 Liability and Compensation for Damage 137 Trade Measures 137 Investment Incentives 137 Voluntary Approaches 138 Consumer Information Incentives 138 Integrated Environmental Management 139 Conclusions 141 Further Reading 142

5 Compliance: Implementation, Enforcement, Dispute Settlement 144

Chapter Outline 144 Introduction 144 Implementation 147 National Law 147 National Compliance 148 Reporting 152 International Enforcement 153 Enforcement by States 153 Damage to a State's Own Environment 154 Damage to the Environment of Another State 155 Damage to the Environment in Areas Beyond National Jurisdiction 155 Enforcement by International Organisations 160 Enforcement by Non-State Actors 163 Enforcement in the National Courts 164 International Enforcement 166 International Settlement of Disputes 167 Introduction 167 Diplomatic Means of Dispute Settlement 168 Negotiation and Consultation 168 Mediation, Conciliation, Fact-Finding and International Institutions 170 Non-Compliance Procedures 172 Inspection Procedures of Multilateral Development Banks 176 NAFTA Commission on Environmental Cooperation 177 Legal Means of Dispute Settlement 178 Arbitration 178 International Courts 180 International Court of Justice 180 UNCLOS and ITLOS 184 WTO Dispute Settlement Body 186 European Court of Justice and Court of First Instance 187 Human Rights Courts 189

PART II PRINCIPLES AND RULES ESTABLISHING STANDARDS

6 General Principles and Rules 197 Chapter Outline 197 Introduction 197 Principles and Rules 199 Sovereignty Over Natural Resources and the Responsibility Not to Cause Damage to the Environment of Other States or to Areas Beyond National Jurisdiction 201 Sovereign Rights Over Natural Resources 202 Sovereignty and Extraterritoriality 203 Responsibility Not to Cause Environmental Damage 206 Conclusion 210 Principle of Preventive Action 211 Cooperation 213 Sustainable Development 217 Introduction 217 Future Generations 221 Sustainable Use of Natural Resources 222 Equitable Use of Natural Resources 225 Integration of Environment and Development 227 Conclusion 229 Precautionary Principle 229 Polluter Pays Principle 240 0ECD 241 European Union 242 Principle of Common But Differentiated Responsibility 244 Common Responsibility 245 Differentiated Responsibility 246 Conclusions 248 Further Reading 249 7 Atmospheric Protection 252 Chapter Outline 252 Introduction 252 Milestones in the Development of Atmospheric Regulation 254 Trail Smelter Case 254 Nuclear Testing 255 Customary Law 257 UN Environmental Summits 258 Urban and Transboundary Air Pollution 259 1979 UNECE Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution and Its Protocols 261 1979 LRTAP Convention 261 1984 Monitoring and Evaluation Protocol 262 1985 Sulphur Protocol 263 1988 NO_x Protocol 263 1991 Volatile Organic Compounds Protocol 265 1994 Sulphur Protocol 267 1998 Aarhus Protocol on Heavy Metals 268

1998 Aarhus Protocol on Persistent Organic Pollutants 269 1999 Gothenburg Protocol to Abate Acidification, Eutrophication and Ground-Level Ozone 270 1991 Canada-US Air Quality Agreement 271 Sulphur Dioxide 272 Nitrogen Oxides 272 Ozone 273 Assessment, Information and Institutions 273 2002 ASEAN Agreement on Transboundary Haze Pollution 274 Aircraft Emissions: ICAO Convention 275 2013 Minamata Mercury Convention 276 Ozone Depletion 277 1985 Vienna Convention 279 The 1987 Montreal Protocol: Adjustments and Amendments 280 Controlled Substances 282 Control Measures: Consumption and Production 282 Control Measures: Trade in Controlled Substances 286 Developing Countries 287 Technical, Financial and Other Assistance 288 Reporting and Compliance 289 Institutional Arrangements 289 Outer Space 290 1967 Outer Space Treaty 291 1979 Moon Treaty 291 Outer Space Principles 292 Conclusions 293 Further Reading 294 8 Climate Change 295 Chapter Outline 295 Introduction 295 The Climate Change Problem 297 Development of the Climate Change Regime 299 1992 Climate Change Convention 300 Preamble, Definition, Objective and Principles 301 General Commitments 302 Reporting 303 Specific Commitments: Sources and Sinks 304 Commitments: Financial Resources and Technology Transfer 305 Institutional Arrangements 306 Implementation and Dispute Settlement 307 The 1997 Kyoto Protocol 307 Emission Reduction Targets and Timetable 308 Policies and Measures 309 Flexibility Mechanisms: Emissions Trading, Joint Implementation and the CDM 310 Sinks 313 Developing Countries 315 Reporting and Compliance 315 Negotiations for a New Climate Treaty Agreement 316 Paris Agreement 318 Preamble and Objectives 319 Nationally Determined Contributions 321 Mitigation Commitments 322 Sinks 323

Voluntary Cooperation and Carbon Markets 324 Adaptation and Loss and Damage 325 Financial Resources, Technology Transfer and Capacity-Building 327 Implementation and Compliance 328 Institutional Arrangements 330 Post-Paris Developments 330 Intersectoral Linkages 331 Emissions from International Aviation 332 Emissions from International Shipping 333 Conclusions 334 Further Reading 335 9 Freshwater Resources 337 Chapter Outline 337 Introduction 337 Customary Law 339 Lac Lanoux Arbitration 341 ILA: 1966 Helsinki Rules 342 ILC 2008: Articles on Transboundary Aquifers 344 Case Concerning the Gabčíkovo-Nagymaros Project 345 The Case Concerning the Pulp Mills on the River Uruguay 351 Indus Waters Kishenganga Arbitration 355 Costa Rica v. Nicaragua Cases 359 Global Rules 360 1997 Watercourses Convention 361 1992 Convention on the Protection and Use of Transboundary Watercourses and International Lakes 363 Regional Rules 366 Europe 366 Rhine 367 Americas 370 1909 Boundary Waters Treaty 371 Gut Dam Arbitration 371 1978 Great Lakes Water Quality Agreement 372 Africa 374 Niger Basin 374 Southern Africa, Including the Zambezi River 375 Asia 377 Mekong River Basin 377 Subcontinental Asia 378 Middle East 379 Israel-Jordan Peace Treaty 380 Jordan-Saudi Arabia Al-Sag/Al-Disi Aquifer Agreement 380 Conclusions 381 Further Reading 382 10 Biological Diversity 384 Chapter Outline 384 Introduction 384 Convention on Biological Diversity and Its Protocols 388 1992 Convention on Biological Diversity 388 Objectives 389 Preamble and Jurisdictional Scope 389

Conservation and Sustainable Use 390 Access to Genetic Resources and Benefit Sharing 394 Biotechnology and Living Modified Organisms 396 Financial Resources 397 Institutions and Other Mechanisms 397 2000 Cartagena Protocol on Biosafety 397 2010 Nagoya Protocol 403 Evolution of the Biodiversity Convention 404 Other Global Biodiversity-Related Conventions 409 Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species 409 CITES Institutions 410 Preamble and Definitions 410 Appendices I-III and International Trade 411 Introduction from the Sea Under CITES 412 Amendments to Appendices 413 Reservations 414 Exemptions and Special Provisions 415 Compliance and Enforcement 416 1979 Bonn Convention on Migratory Species 417 Ramsar Convention 420 1972 World Heritage Convention 422 International Treaty on Plant Genetic Resources for Food and Agriculture 424 International Plant Protection Convention 427 Other Instruments Addressing Specific Ecosystems or Species 427 Forests 428 International Tropical Timber Agreement 2006 428 UN Forum on Forests 429 2007 UN Forest Instrument 430 Land and Soil Degradation, and Desertification 431 1994 Convention to Combat Desertification 433 Birds 434 1950 Birds Convention 435 1970 Benelux Convention 435 Other Animal Species 435 1973 Polar Bear Agreement 435 1979 Vicuna Convention 436 General Instruments of Regional and Subregional Application 436 Africa 437 1968 African Nature Convention 438 2003 Revised African Nature Convention 439 1994 Lusaka Agreement 440 The Americas and the Caribbean 441 1940 Western Hemisphere Convention 441 1978 Treaty for Amazonian Cooperation 442 Pacific Islands Region 443 Europe 444 1979 Berne Convention 444 1982 Benelux Convention 446 1991 Alpine Convention 446 2003 Carpathians Convention 447 Asia 447 Conclusions 449 Further Reading 451

11 Oceans, Seas and Marine Living Resources 455 Chapter Outline 455 Introduction 455 Protection of the Marine Environment 459 Introduction 459 Development of International Law Rules 460 Global Rules: UNCLOS 462 Regional Arrangements 464 UNEP Regional Seas Programme 465 North-East Atlantic: 1992 OSPAR Convention 472 Baltic Sea: the 1992 Helsinki Convention 474 Pollution from Land-Based Sources 476 Pollution by Dumping 479 1972 London Convention and 1996 Protocol 480 Regional Agreements 483 Pollution from Vessels 486 UNCLOS Rules 487 MARPOL 73/78 488 Polar Code 493 Other Agreements on Pollution from Ships 494 Safety Agreements 495 Pollution from Seabed Activities 496 UNCLOS and the International Seabed Authority 497 Regional Agreements 499 Environmental Emergencies 500 1969 Intervention Convention and 1973 Intervention Protocol 501 1989 Salvage Convention 502 1990 OPRC Convention and 2000 HNS Protocol 503 Regional Agreements 504 Liability and Compensation 505 Conservation of Marine Living Resources 506 Introduction 506 Development of International Law Rules 509 Pacific Fur Seal Arbitration 509 Food and Agriculture Organization 510 The First UN Conference on the Law of the Sea (1958) 511 Fisheries Jurisdiction Cases 512 1972 Stockholm Conference on the Human Environment 513 UNCLOS 513 Territorial Waters, Archipelagic Waters and the Continental Shelf 514 Exclusive Economic Zone 514 High Seas 516 1995 Fish Stocks Agreement and Other Global Arrangements 516 1995 Fish Stocks Agreement 517 1993 Compliance Agreement 519 1995 Code of Conduct for Responsible Fisheries 520 Regional Fishery Arrangements 520 Fisheries Case Law 526 Estai Case (Canada v. Spain) 527 Southern Bluefin Tuna Cases (New Zealand v. Japan, Australia v. Japan) 528 Swordfish Case (Chile v. EU) 529 South China Sea Arbitration (Philippines v. China) 531

Prompt Release Cases 532 Marine Mammals 533 International Whaling Commission 534 Regional Agreements 538 Marine Birds 540 Destructive Fishing Practices 540 Driftnet Fishing 541 Bottom Trawling 542 Illegal, Unreported and Unregulated (IUU) Fishing 543 2009 Agreement on Port State Measures 545 Voluntary Guidelines for Flag State Performance 546 ITLOS Jurisprudence 546 Conservation of Marine Biodiversity 548 Introduction 548 From Agenda 21 to the Sustainable Development Goals 549 Resolutions of the United Nations General Assembly 550 The International Legal Framework 551 UNCLOS and the 1995 Fish Stocks Agreement 551 Convention on Biological Diversity 552 **Regional Arrangements** 553 Protection of Deep-Sea Ecosystems 555 Resolutions of the UN General Assembly 556 Food and Agriculture Organization 558 Marine Protected Areas 558 Marine Protected Areas Under National Jurisdiction 560 MPAs in Areas Beyond National Jurisdiction 562 Conclusions 564 Further Reading 566

12 Hazardous Substances and Activities, and Waste 569

Chapter Outline 569 Introduction 569 Hazardous Substances 572 Definition of Hazardous Substances 572 Accident Prevention, Preparedness and Response 573 Eu Seveso Directive 575 1992 Industrial Accidents Convention 576 Chemicals, Pesticides and Other Dangerous Substances 578 Registration and Classification (Including Labelling and Packaging) 578 Production and Use 580 International Trade 585 Transport 589 Exposure in the Work Environment 590 Hazardous Activities 593 Nuclear Activities and Radioactive Substances 593 Nuclear Safety 595 Transport 597 Protection of Workers and the Public 598 Border Area Cooperation 599 Emergencies 599 Nuclear Weapons and Testing, and Nuclear-Free Zones 601

Other Hazardous Activities 603 Energy 604 Mining 606 Agriculture 608 Transportation 609 Tourism 609 Wastes 609 Defining Wastes 610 Municipal Waste 610 Hazardous and Toxic Wastes (Industrial, Agricultural and Mining Waste and Sewage Sludge) 611 Radioactive Waste 613 Prevention and Treatment 613 Disposal 615 Disposal at Sea 615 Disposal into Rivers and Lakes by Other Land-Based Sources 616 Incineration 616 Landfill and Other Land Disposal and Storage 617 Recycling and Reuse 618 International Movement (Including Trade) In Waste 619 The 1989 Basel Convention 620 1991 Bamako Convention 623 1995 Waigani Convention 624 North America 625 1990 IAEA Code of Conduct on Radioactive Waste and 1997 Joint Convention on Spent Fuel and Radioactive Waste Management 625 Conclusions 627 Further Reading 629

13 The Polar Regions: Antarctica and the Arctic 632

Chapter Outline 632 Introduction 632 The Antarctic 633 The Antarctic Treaty Regime 634 1959 Antarctic Treaty 634 1972 Antarctic Seals Convention 635 1980 CCAMLR 635 1988 CRAMRA 637 1991 Environment Protocol 639 Other Treaty Provisions 644 The Arctic 644 The Arctic Council 645 Arctic Monitoring and Assessment Programme 646 Arctic Contaminants Action Program 647 Protection of the Arctic Marine Environment Working Group 647 Conservation of Arctic Flora and Fauna Working Group 648 Emergency Prevention, Preparedness, and Response Working Group 648 Sustainable Development Working Group 648 Arctic Treaties 649 Conclusions 650 Further Reading 651

PART III TECHNIQUES FOR IMPLEMENTING INTERNATIONAL PRINCIPLES AND RULES

14 Environmental Impact Assessment 657 Chapter Outline 657 Introduction 657 Non-Binding Instruments 658 Developments from Stockholm to Rio 658 UN Environmental Summits 660 ILC Draft Articles on Prevention of Transboundary Harm 661 Treaties and Other Binding Instruments 662 1982 UNCLOS 664 1986 Noumea Convention 666 1991 Espoo Convention 667 2003 Strategic Environmental Assessment Protocol 670 1991 Antarctic Environment Protocol 671 1992 Biodiversity Convention 673 Risk Assessment Procedures 673 World Bank and Other Multilateral Lending Institutions 675 International Cases 676 Conclusions 680 Further Reading 681

15 Environmental Information and Technology Transfer 682

Chapter Outline 682 Introduction 682 Environmental Information 683 Information Exchange 685 Reporting and Provision of Information 688 Reports by Organisations 689 Reports Under Treaties or Other Agreements 689 Reports of Events Other than Emergencies 692 Information to and from Non-State Organisations 694 Consultation 694 Prior Informed Consent 697 Notification of Emergency Situations 698 Nuclear Accidents 699 Monitoring and Other Information Gathering 703 Treaty Arrangements 704 Access to Environmental Information and Public Participation 707 1992 OSPAR Convention 708 1998 Aarhus Convention 710 2003 Protocol on Pollutant Release and Transfer Registers 712 Public Education and Awareness 715 Eco-Labelling 716 Eco-Auditing and Accounting 717 Environmental Accounting 717 Environmental Auditing 719 Technology Transfer and Technical Assistance 720 Soft Law Developments 721

Treaty Provisions 722 The Ozone Regime 723 Biodiversity Convention 724 The Climate Change Regime 726 Intellectual Property and Barriers to Technology Transfer 727 Conclusions 730 Further Reading 733 16 Liability for Environmental Damage 735 Chapter Outline 735 Introduction 735 State Liability 737 Introduction 737 General International Law 739 Defining Environmental Damage 741 Threshold at which Environmental Damage Entails Liability 743 Standard of Care 746 Reparation 749 State Practice 752 UN Compensation Commission 755 International Crimes 760 Treaties 762 1972 Space Liability Convention 762 1979 LRTAP Convention 764 1982 UNCLOS 764 1988 CRAMRA and 1991 Antarctic Environmental Protocol 767 1992 Climate Change Convention and 2015 Paris Agreement 768 The Work of the International Law Commission 769 Civil Liability for Environmental Damage Under International Law 771 Nuclear Installations 772 1960 Paris Convention and 1963 Brussels Convention 773 1963 Vienna Convention 775 1988 Joint Protocol 778 1997 Convention on Supplementary Compensation 779 Oil Pollution 779 1992 Civil Liability Convention 780 The 1992 Fund Convention 781 2003 Supplementary Fund Protocol 783 IOPC Fund Practice 784 2001 Bunker Oil Convention 788 Private Compensation Schemes 789 Marine Environment 790 Waste 790 Transport 792 Antarctic 794 1988 CRAMRA 794 1991 Antarctic Environment Protocol 794 Biodiversity 797 General Instruments Relating to Dangerous Goods or Activities 799 1993 Lugano Convention 799 2003 Civil Liability Protocol 801 Conclusions 803 Further Reading 804

PART IV LINKAGE OF INTERNATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL LAW AND OTHER AREAS OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

17 Human Rights and International Humanitarian Law 811

Chapter Outline 811 Introduction 811 Human Rights Law 813 Development of International Human Rights Law 813 Environmental Protection and Human Rights 814 Economic, Social and Cultural Rights 817 Civil and Political Rights 825 International Humanitarian Law 828 Military Activities and Environmental Protection 829 International Environmental Law During War and Armed Conflict 829 International Law of War and Armed Conflict: General Rules of Environmental Protection 834 Environmental Security and International Law 836 Conclusions 837

Further Reading 838

18 International Economic Law: Trade, Investment and Intellectual Property 841

Chapter Outline 841 Introduction 841 Trade and Environment 843 Trade Measures in International Environmental Agreements 843 Unilateral Environmental Measures and International Trade 848 WTO/GATT 850 WTO Dispute Settlement 854 Measures for Health and Safety Protection 871 Beef Hormones Disputes (1998 and 2008) 873 Assessment 881 Regional and Bilateral Free Trade Agreements 882 European Union 882 North American Free Trade Agreement 887 African Economic Community 893 Competition and Subsidies 894 Subsidies 895 Anti-Competitive Agreements 898 Anti-Dumping 899 Foreign Investment 900 Investment Treaties 900 Substantive Rules 901 Dispute Settlement 904 Case Law 905 Insurance 916 Intellectual Property Rights 916 Patents and Other Rights 917 Traditional Knowledge 922 Conclusions 924 Further Reading 926

19 Future Developments 930

Chapter Outline 930 Introduction 930 Governance Challenges 933 Implementation and Enforcement Challenges 936 Future Regulatory Development 938 Conclusions 940

Index 941