

Vanessa Thalmann

Reasonable and effective universality

Conditions to the exercise by national
courts of universal jurisdiction over
international crimes

Contents

Introduction.....	9
I. The aim of the study.....	9
II. The scope of the study.....	12
III. Terminology.....	15
A. Universal jurisdiction.....	15
B. International crimes.....	15
C. “Reasonable and effective universality”: the principles guiding this study.....	16
D. Other terms.....	16
IV. Structure, methodology and sources.....	16
V. Legal impediments to the exercise of criminal jurisdiction in the context of universal jurisdiction cases.....	19
A. Amnesties.....	19
B. Immunities.....	22
C. Ne bis in idem.....	33
Part I: Universal jurisdiction in international law.....	39
Chapter 1: Jurisdiction.....	41
I. Definition.....	41
II. Types of jurisdiction.....	42
A. Prescriptive, adjudicatory and enforcement jurisdiction.....	42
B. Criminal and civil jurisdiction.....	44
III. The two approaches of public international law.....	44
A. The Lotus approach.....	44
B. The modern approach.....	47
IV. Extraterritorial jurisdiction and the principles of sovereignty and non-intervention.....	48
V. Bases of criminal jurisdiction.....	51
A. Territoriality principle.....	52
B. Active nationality principle.....	55
C. Passive nationality principle.....	58
D. Protective principle.....	61
E. Universal principle.....	62
F. The representation principle.....	62
G. Other principles.....	65
Chapter 2: The universal jurisdiction doctrine.....	67

I.	The notion of universal jurisdiction	67
II.	Distinctions	69
A.	Unilateral, delegated and absolute universal jurisdiction	69
B.	Conditional and absolute universal jurisdiction	71
C.	Other distinctions.....	73
III.	Universal jurisdiction and <i>aut dedere aut judicare/ prosequi</i>	74
A.	Introductory remarks	74
B.	Categories of <i>aut dedere</i> clauses.....	75
C.	The relationship between extradition and prosecution	78
D.	Precedence of the “prosecute” obligation over the “extradite” obligation	83
IV.	Concluding remarks.....	84
Chapter 3: Universal jurisdiction and international crimes.....		87
I.	Introductory remarks	87
II.	International crimes and <i>jus cogens</i>	87
A.	The notion of international crimes	88
B.	<i>Jus cogens</i> norms, obligations <i>erga omnes</i> and universal jurisdiction ..	98
III.	Universal jurisdiction over core crimes and torture	105
A.	Preliminary remarks: crimes subject to universal jurisdiction under international law	105
B.	Core crimes and torture	106
IV.	The duty to prosecute core international crimes under the universality principle	119
A.	Introductory remarks	119
B.	<i>Jus cogens</i> prohibitions	121
C.	Human rights obligations	123
D.	The ICC Statute	128
E.	The duty of states to prosecute or extradite.....	131
F.	Concluding remarks.....	133
V.	Treaty-based universal jurisdiction.....	136
Part II: Universal jurisdiction in national law		141
Chapter 1: A general overview of domestic legislation on universal jurisdiction		143
I.	The universality principle in domestic legislation.....	143
A.	The existence of the universality principle	143
B.	Restrictions to the exercise of universal jurisdiction	149
C.	Limited universal jurisdiction for specific situations or territories	158
D.	A list of crimes subject to universal jurisdiction and/or a general provision?	159

II.	The crimes subject to universal jurisdiction in domestic law	164
A.	Genocide, crimes against humanity and war crimes.....	164
B.	A general clause for treaty-based crimes.....	177
C.	Other crimes subject to universal jurisdiction	186
	Chapter 2:State practice.....	205
I.	A general overview.....	205
II.	A regional overview	208
	Part III: Conditions to exercise of universal jurisdiction.....	213
	Chapter 1:The principle of legality	215
I.	Introductory remarks	215
II.	The legality principle and the implementation of international law ...	222
A.	The principle of legality	222
B.	The legality principle and the need for implementation at the domestic level.....	236
III.	The absence of domestic criminalization of international crimes in universal jurisdiction cases.....	246
A.	Introductory remarks	246
B.	War crimes and absence or insufficient implementation provisions ...	248
C.	Crimes against humanity	260
D.	Genocide.....	279
E.	Torture as a discrete crime.....	302
F.	Concluding remarks of section III	314
IV.	Lack of domestic provisions providing universal jurisdiction	315
A.	Introductory remarks	315
B.	The absence of domestic provisions on universal jurisdiction.....	316
C.	Application of a new universal jurisdiction statute to a prior situation: jurisdictional rules as procedural rules	343
V.	The role of the foreign law of the territorial state and the legality principle.....	358
A.	Introductory remarks	358
B.	The dual criminality requirement	359
C.	The application of foreign criminal law	365
D.	Penalties and the legality principle	369
VI.	Concluding remarks to chapter 1	370
A.	The limits to judicial activism, the legality principle and the separation of powers.....	370
B.	The need for implementation and the need for international sanctions on states	372

Chapter 2: The requirement of a link with the state exercising universal jurisdiction	375
I. Introductory remarks	375
II. A jurisdictional link: the debate.....	377
A. Terminology.....	377
B. The presence requirement: the debate	378
III. The presence requirement under international law	382
IV. The requirement of a link in state practice.....	387
A. The debate about the presence requirement before some national courts	387
B. The requirement of the residence of the suspect or the victim	398
V. The definition of “presence” and the timing	404
A. Introductory remarks	404
B. The debate in Switzerland	406
VI. Critical assessment and concluding remarks to chapter 2.....	412
Chapter 3: Subsidiarity	417
I. Introductory remarks	417
II. Is the principle of subsidiarity a rule of international law?.....	419
A. The debate in international law	419
B. Conclusions arising from national legislation and case law.....	426
C. Concluding remarks	442
III. Issues arising from the analysis of state practice	444
A. The time of the subsidiarity principle.....	444
B. The same precise case or the “situation”?	445
C. Subsidiarity to which state?.....	447
D. What is the “standard” to test the inaction of the territorial/national state?.....	449
E. Is the forum state obliged to inform the affected states? Does a request need to be made to the territorial state?	459
F. Extradition issues.....	462
IV. Concluding remarks	467
A. The rationale for the subsidiarity principle.....	467
B. The subsidiarity principle as a legal rule rather than a “policy”	471
C. The content of the subsidiarity principle.....	472
V. Double-subsidiarity: Does “priority” also apply to the International Criminal Court?.....	473
Chapter 4: The initiation of universal jurisdiction proceedings.....	479
I. Introductory remarks	479

II.	The role of private parties in the initiation of universal jurisdiction proceedings.....	479
A.	Introductory remarks	479
B.	The debate.....	482
C.	The role of victims in universal jurisdiction proceedings according to international law	488
D.	State practice.....	490
E.	Concluding remarks	500
III.	The role of the prosecutor, prosecutorial discretion, and judicial intervention.....	503
A.	The debate.....	503
B.	The legality and opportunity maxims	504
C.	The status of the prosecutor, prosecutorial discretion and judicial review	507
D.	Concluding remarks and critical assessment.....	521
	General conclusions.....	525
I.	Summary	525
II.	The way forward.....	528
	Bibliography	531
	Table of Contents	557