

Luzerner Beiträge zur Rechtswissenschaft (LBR)

Herausgegeben von Jörg Schmid im Auftrag der  
Rechtswissenschaftlichen Fakultät der Universität Luzern

Band 130

**Belkis Vural Çelenk**

**Application of Third Country  
Overriding Mandatory Rules –  
Analytical Comparison of Swiss,  
Turkish and EU Law**

Schulthess § 2018

# Contents

Foreword.....	V
Contents .....	VII
Table of Contents .....	IX
List of Abbreviations.....	XVII
Bibliography .....	XXI
List of Documents.....	XXXV
Introduction.....	1
<b>1. Part: Overriding Mandatory Rules in Private International Law.....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>1. Chapter: Conceptual Clarification of Overriding Mandatory Rules.....</b>	<b>3</b>
I. In General.....	3
II. Short Introduction to Application of Foreign Law and Overriding Mandatory Rules: Impact of Scholars from HUBER to FRANCESKAKIS.....	4
III. Development of Terminology in Certain Languages.....	7
IV. Distinctive Features of Overriding Mandatory Rules .....	14
<b>2. Chapter: Classification of Overriding Mandatory Rules .....</b>	<b>23</b>
I. In General.....	23
II. Classification of Overriding Mandatory Rules .....	24
<b>3. Chapter: Treatment of Overriding Mandatory Rules of <i>Lex Fori</i> and <i>Lex Causae</i>.....</b>	<b>71</b>
I. In General.....	71
II. Treatment of Overriding Mandatory Rules of <i>Lex Fori</i> .....	71
III. Overriding Mandatory Rules of <i>Lex Causae</i> .....	94
IV. Comparison of Legal Orders in terms of Treatment of Overriding Mandatory Rules of <i>Lex Fori</i> and <i>Lex Causae</i> .....	100
<b>4. Chapter: The Hague Principles on Choice of Law and the Treatment of Overriding Mandatory Rules.....</b>	<b>103</b>
I. Hague Principles on Choice of Law in General.....	103
II. Notion of Overriding Mandatory Rules under Hague Principles.....	105
III. Overriding Mandatory Rules as <i>Lex Limitates</i> According to Article 11(1) and Article 11(2) of the Hague Principles.....	107
IV. The Importance of the Hague Principles in the sense of Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rules Doctrine.....	111

<b>2. Part: Overriding Mandatory Rules in Private International Law.....</b>	<b>111</b>
<b>5. Chapter: Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rules and Concerned Questions.....</b>	<b>111</b>
I. In General.....	111
II. Determination of Overriding Mandatory Rules (Qualification).....	111
III. «Statute» as the Starting Point.....	114
IV. Readoption of Unilateralism .....	116
<b>6. Chapter: Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rules and Theoretical Framework .....</b>	<b>119</b>
I. In General.....	119
II. Conflict of Laws Approach: The Theory of Special Connection .....	120
III. Bilateral Approach .....	132
IV. Substantive Law Approach .....	133
V. Other Theories.....	136
VI. Non-Applicability of Foreign Public Law Rules.....	142
<b>3. Part: Treatment of Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rules in Selected Legal Orders .....</b>	<b>145</b>
<b>7. Chapter: Treatment of Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rules in Contracts.....</b>	<b>145</b>
I. In General.....	145
II. Swiss Law .....	145
III. Turkish Law .....	158
IV. EU Law .....	171
V. Comparison of Legal Orders in terms of the Special Connection Method for Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rules for Contractual Obligations .....	189
<b>8. Chapter: Treatment of Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rules in Delicts.....</b>	<b>193</b>
I. In General.....	193
II. Categorisation of Overriding Mandatory Rules which Effect Delict Claims.....	194
III. Swiss Law .....	197
IV. Turkish Law .....	203
V. EU Law .....	208
VI. Comparison of Legal Orders in terms of a Special Connection Possibility for Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rules in Delict Law .....	212
<b>Conclusion.....</b>	<b>215</b>
<b>Table of Index .....</b>	<b>219</b>

# Table of Contents

Foreword.....	V
Contents .....	VII
Table of Contents .....	IX
List of Abbreviations.....	XVII
Bibliography .....	XXI
List of Documents.....	XXXV
Introduction.....	1
<b>1. Part: Overriding Mandatory Rules in Private International Law.....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>1. Chapter: Conceptual Clarification of Overriding Mandatory Rules .....</b>	<b>3</b>
I. In General.....	3
II. Short Introduction to Application of Foreign Law and Overriding Mandatory Rules: Impact of Scholars from HUBER to FRANCESCAKIS.....	4
1. Application of Foreign Law and HUBER's Perspective .....	4
2. Introduction to Overriding Mandatory Rules: From SAVIGNY to FRANCESCAKIS.....	5
III. Development of Terminology in Certain Languages.....	7
1. Lois d'application Immédiate as French Expression .....	7
2. German Expression <i>Eingriffsnormen</i> .....	9
3. Doğrudan Uygulanan Kurallar in Turkish.....	10
4. Overriding Mandatory Rules in English.....	12
IV. Distinctive Features of Overriding Mandatory Rules .....	14
1. Hybrid Character of Overriding Mandatory Rules .....	14
A. The Element of Special Purpose .....	15
B. The Element of Unilateral Operation.....	18
2. Relative Character of Overriding Mandatory Rules .....	19
3. Overriding Mandatory Rules and <i>Ordre Public</i> .....	20
<b>2. Chapter: Classification of Overriding Mandatory Rules ...</b>	<b>23</b>
I. In General.....	23
II. Classification of Overriding Mandatory Rules .....	24
1. Classification of Overriding Mandatory Rules upon Their Paramount Intention .....	24

A.	Overriding Mandatory Rules that Serve the Political and Economic Interests .....	24
a)	Organisation .....	24
aa)	Swiss Law .....	26
bb)	Turkish Law .....	28
cc)	EU Law .....	30
b)	Exchange Control Regulations .....	32
aa)	Swiss Law .....	35
bb)	Turkish Law .....	35
cc)	EU Law .....	37
c)	Competition Law Rules .....	38
aa)	Swiss Law .....	39
bb)	Turkish Law .....	40
cc)	EU Law .....	41
B.	Overriding Mandatory Rules that Serve the Sociopolitical Interests .....	43
a)	Rules on Protection of Environmental and Cultural Assets....	43
aa)	Swiss Law .....	44
bb)	Turkish Law .....	45
cc)	EU Law .....	47
b)	Rules on Protection of Public Safety, Health, and Public Interests.....	48
aa)	Swiss Law .....	49
bb)	Turkish Law .....	50
cc)	EU Law .....	52
2.	Classification upon the Scope of Application .....	57
A.	Overriding Mandatory Rules which Operate within the Territory of Issuing Jurisdiction .....	57
a)	Swiss Law .....	58
b)	Turkish Law .....	59
c)	EU Law .....	61
B.	Overriding Mandatory Rules which may have Extraterritorial Effect.....	62
a)	Swiss Law .....	63
b)	Turkish Law .....	65
c)	EU Law .....	66
3.	<b>Chapter: Treatment of Overriding Mandatory Rules of <i>Lex Fori</i> and <i>Lex Causae</i>.....</b>	<b>71</b>
I.	In General.....	71
II.	Treatment of Overriding Mandatory Rules of <i>Lex Fori</i> .....	71
1.	Swiss Law .....	71
A.	The Notion of Overriding Mandatory Rules under Article 18 of the Swiss PILA of 1987 .....	72

B.	Discretion of the Judge and the Mode of Application of Overriding Mandatory Rules of Forum under Article 18 of the Swiss PILA of 1987 .....	74
C.	Relevance of the <i>Ordre Public</i> Exception and Overriding Mandatory Rules of Forum under Swiss Law .....	76
2.	Turkish Law .....	78
A.	Notion of Overriding Mandatory Rules under Article 6 of Turkish PILA of 2007 .....	79
B.	Discretion of the Judge and Mode of Application of Overriding Mandatory Rules of Forum under Article 6 of the Turkish PILA of 2007 .....	80
C.	Relevance of <i>Ordre Public</i> Exception and Overriding Mandatory Rules of Forum under Turkish Law .....	83
3.	EU Law .....	83
A.	Notion of Overriding Mandatory Rules under the Rome I Regulation .....	85
B.	Overriding Mandatory Rules of National Laws .....	87
C.	Overriding Mandatory Rules and the Primacy of EU Law .....	87
D.	The Case of Overriding Mandatory Rules of Directives and the Transposition Rules in Member States .....	89
E.	Discretion of the Judge and Mode of Application of Overriding Mandatory Rules of the Forum .....	92
F.	Overriding Mandatory Rules of Forum under the Rome II Regulation .....	93
III.	Overriding Mandatory Rules of <i>Lex Causae</i> .....	94
1.	Swiss Law .....	94
2.	Turkish Law .....	97
3.	EU Law .....	98
IV.	Comparison of Legal Orders in terms of Treatment of Overriding Mandatory Rules of <i>Lex Fori</i> and <i>Lex Causae</i> .....	100
4.	<b>Chapter: The Hague Principles on Choice of Law and the Treatment of Overriding Mandatory Rules .....</b>	<b>103</b>
I.	Hague Principles on Choice of Law in General .....	103
II.	Notion of Overriding Mandatory Rules under Hague Principles .....	105
III.	Overriding Mandatory Rules as <i>Lex Limitates</i> According to Article 11(1) and Article 11(2) of the Hague Principles .....	107
1.	Article 11(1) of the Hague Principles .....	107
2.	Article 11(2) of the Hague Principles .....	108
IV.	The Importance of the Hague Principles in the sense of Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rules Doctrine .....	110

<b>2. Part: Overriding Mandatory Rules in Private International Law</b> .....	<b>111</b>
<b>5. Chapter: Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rules and Concerned Questions</b> .....	<b>111</b>
I. In General.....	111
II. Determination of Overriding Mandatory Rules (Qualification).....	111
III. «Statute» as the Starting Point.....	114
IV. Readoption of Unilateralism .....	116
<b>6. Chapter: Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rules and Theoretical Framework</b> .....	<b>119</b>
I. In General.....	119
II. Conflict of Laws Approach: The Theory of Special Connection.....	120
1. In General.....	120
2. Criteria for Special Connection.....	121
A. Existence of a Rule that Applies Overridingly .....	121
B. Existence of a Sufficiently Close Connection between the Legal Relationship and the Third Country.....	121
C. Worthiness of Protection of a Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rule .....	122
3. Aim of Special Connection .....	123
A. Uniformity of Decisions .....	123
B. International Legal Cooperation .....	124
4. Criticism of the Theory of Special Connection.....	125
A. Lack of Legal Certainty .....	125
B. The Problem of Unity and <i>Dépeçage</i> .....	127
C. Restriction of Party Autonomy .....	128
D. Politicization of Private International Law Before the National Courts .....	129
E. Special Connection Theory and Positive Law.....	130
III. Bilateral Approach .....	132
IV. Substantive Law Approach .....	133
V. Other Theories.....	136
1. The Theory of Datum.....	136
2. The Theory of Statute .....	137
3. The Theory of Authority .....	138
4. Comity .....	140
5. Idea of Equivalence of Legal Orders and Existence of Shared Values .....	140
VI. Non-Applicability of Foreign Public Law Rules.....	142
1. In General.....	142
2. Theory of Conflict of Public Laws.....	142

<b>3. Part: Treatment of Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rules in Selected Legal Orders.....</b>	<b>145</b>
<b>7. Chapter: Treatment of Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rules in Contracts.....</b>	<b>145</b>
I. In General.....	145
II. Swiss Law.....	145
1. In General.....	145
2. Conditions to Apply Article 19 of the Swiss PILA.....	146
A. Existence of an Overriding Mandatory Rule of a Third Legal Order, which is External to <i>Lex Causae</i> and <i>Lex Fori</i> .....	147
B. Existence of a Sufficiently Close Connection Between the Disputed Legal Relationship and the Issuing Legal Order.....	148
C. Predominant Interest, Worthiness of Protection and the Swiss Conception of Law.....	150
3. Mode of Application and Discretion of Judge in Article 19 of the Swiss PILA.....	153
4. The Fate of Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rules which are Outside the Scope of Article 19 of the Swiss PILA.....	156
III. Turkish Law.....	158
1. In General.....	158
2. Conditions to Apply Article 31 of the Turkish PILA.....	159
A. Existence of an Overriding Mandatory Rule.....	160
B. Close Connection between the Contractual Relationship and the Issuing Legal Order.....	161
C. Consideration of the Aim, Nature and Results of the Rule Concerned.....	163
3. Mode of Application and Discretion of Judge in Article 31 of the Turkish PILA.....	164
4. The Fate of Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rules which are Outside of Article 31 of the Turkish PILA.....	170
IV. EU Law.....	171
1. In General.....	171
2. Conditions to Apply Article 9(3) of Rome I Regulation.....	174
A. Existence of an Overriding Mandatory Rules in the sense of Article 9(1) of the Rome I Regulation.....	174
B. Overriding Mandatory Rules of the Place of Performance of the Obligations arising out of the Contract.....	177
C. Effect of Overriding Mandatory Rules as Unlawfulness of Performance.....	180
3. Mode of Application and Discretion of Judge in Article 9(3) of the Rome I Regulation.....	182
4. The Fate of Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rules which are Outside of Article 9(3) of the Rome I Regulation.....	187



V.	Comparison of Legal Orders in terms of the Special Connection Method for Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rules for Contractual Obligations .....	189
<b>8.</b>	<b>Chapter: Treatment of Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rules in Delicts .....</b>	<b>193</b>
I.	In General.....	193
II.	Categorisation of Overriding Mandatory Rules which Effect Delict Claims.....	194
1.	The Rules on Instructions and Prohibitions ( <i>Ge- und Verbotsnormen</i> ).....	194
2.	The Rules as Ground of Claims ( <i>Anspruchsgrundlage</i> ).....	195
3.	Permission Rules ( <i>Erlaubnisnormen</i> ) .....	196
4.	The Rules Providing Release of Liability ( <i>Haftungsfreistellende Normen</i> ) .....	196
III.	Swiss Law .....	197
1.	In General.....	197
2.	Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rules in Delict Claims within the Swiss PILA .....	198
3.	Legal Result of a Special Connection Under Swiss Law .....	199
A.	Legal Result of a Special Connection for the Rules on Instructions and Prohibitions ( <i>Ge- und Verbotsnormen</i> ) and the Permission Rules ( <i>Erlaubnisnormen</i> ) .....	199
B.	Legal Result of a Special Connection of Grounds of Claims ( <i>Anspruchsgrundlage</i> ) and Rules Providing Release of Liability ( <i>Haftungsfreistellende Normen</i> ) in Delikt Law .....	202
IV.	Turkish Law .....	203
1.	In General.....	203
2.	Lack of Concerned Legal Provision and Operation of Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rules in Delict Claims Before Turkish Courts.....	203
A.	Legal Result of a Lack of a Special Connection Rule for the Rules on Instructions and Prohibitions ( <i>Ge- und Verbotsnormen</i> ) and the Permission Rules ( <i>Erlaubnisnormen</i> ). 204	
B.	Legal Result of a Lack of a Special Connection Rule for the Grounds of Claims ( <i>Anspruchsgrundlage</i> ) and Rules Providing Release of Liability ( <i>Haftungsfreistellende Normen</i> ) in Delikt Law .....	206
V.	EU Law .....	208
1.	In General.....	208
2.	The Legal Result of the Lack of the Special Connection for Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rules in the Rome II Regulation.....	209

---

3.	Treatment of the Rules of Safety and Conduct within the Substantive Law .....	210
VI.	Comparison of Legal Orders in terms of a Special Connection Possibility for Third Country Overriding Mandatory Rules in Delict Law .....	212
	<b>Conclusion.....</b>	<b>215</b>
	<b>Table of Index.....</b>	<b>219</b>