

A Successful Defeat

Eugene IV's Struggle with the Council of Basel
for Ultimate Authority in the Church
1431-1449

Michiel Decaluwe

Bruxelles - Brussel - Roma
Belgisch Historisch Instituut te Rome
Institut Historique Belge de Rome
Istituto Storico Belga di Roma

2009

CONTENTS

<i>Introduction</i>	11
Defining the problem and formulating the objective	13
Methodological observations	14
Questions	18
Sources and literature	20
<i>Part 1. Previous history</i>	33
Papal authority prior to the Western Schism	36
Papal authority under pressure: before and during the Western Schism	42
The Council of Constance	45
The decree <i>Haec sancta</i>	46
The decree <i>Frequens</i>	50
<i>Part 2. Papal politics in the first years of the Council of Basel. Traditional papal authority collapses (1431-1435)</i>	53
Chapter 1. The difficult start to the Council of Basel (1431-1433)	57
Changes in the upper echelons of the Church	57
A new pope: Eugene IV (1431-1447)	57
A new general council: the Council of Basel (1431-1449)	62
A spiral of misunderstanding. The initial contacts between pope and council lead to a crisis	66
A low attendance	66
Different missions	69
The pope draws conclusions	71
A papal delegation	76
Cardinal Cesarini's response	79
The response of the papacy's opponents	81
Lack of understanding ends in a bitter struggle	85
A more trenchant stance	86
Cesarini's response	91
An anti-papal response	92
The Council of Basel's claim to power	95
After <i>Quoniam alto</i> (2) and the second session of the Council of Basel	97

Chapter 2. Words are only words. Eugene has to formally bow before the Council of Basel (1432-1433)	100
Pope Eugene IV realizes he must retrace his steps	103
The pope and the council are convinced of their own authority	103
Eugene IV is confronted with defiance	106
Giovanni Ceparelli	108
A first package of concessions	112
Cesarini again tries to persuade the pope	112
An initial package of concessions	116
Cesarini and <i>Haec sancta</i>	119
A conflict over principles and belief	121
A second wave of concessions	121
The Council of Basel full of self-confidence	125
The ultimate concession?	128
A matter of principles and faith	133
Eugene refuses to yield	136
Sigismund endeavours to pre-empt schism	142
The pope bows his head before the council	147
Given the circumstances...	148
Chapter 3. The Council of Basel as a constant threat to papal authority (1434-1435)	152
The debate on papal presidents	153
Four opinions	155
The papal chairmen accepted	162
Hope and anxiety for the pope	163
The abolition of annates (1435)	166
Unanimity on a decree against annates	167
The papal response	169
Chapter 4. The collapse of belief in papal authority (1431-1435)	174
The judicialised belief in papal authority	174
<i>Haec sancta</i>	182
<i>Part 3. Faced with a never-ending conflict. Papal policy in the period 1434/1435 to 1439</i>	193
Chapter 5. The pope and the Church of Rome (1434-1436) .	197
Three parties difficult to please by the council	198

The cardinals	198
Emperor Sigismund	204
The Greek Church	206
The negotiations with the Greek Church and the relations between Eugene and his cardinals	209
Different tracks	210
Envoys of the Basel cardinals to Eugene	215
Two routes to the union council	217
Allies of the papal cause	223
All roads lead to the Church of Rome	224
Giuliano Cesarini	225
Other allies for the pope	231
Envoys of the Church of Rome at the Council of Basel . .	234
Still three views on authority in the Church	236
Eugene IV returns to a Papal State	239
Nicolo Albergati and the true pope of the Church of Rome .	242
Chapter 6. The Council of Basel disintegrates (1436-1437) . .	244
Discord at the Council of Basel	245
A rift between the Council of Basel and Giuliano Cesa- rini	246
A rift between majority and minority	248
The rift at the Council of Basel and papal policy	250
The more realistic tone	251
Approaching Cesarini	255
Cesarini's conversion?	262
Papal policy and power-sharing conciliarism	266
Chapter 7. The conflict over authority in the Church changes in nature (1437-1439)	270
Three players no longer play a mediating role	271
Cesarini leaves	271
The Greek Church opts for the pope	276
Emperor Sigismund dies	281
Both the pope and the council try to impose their own will .	282
Tres veritates	284
Union with the Greeks	287
Neutral intermediaries, a third player, or the real arbiters . .	289
The choice of neutrality	290
A third player	291
An arbiter	294

Chapter 8. Two equally strong doctrines on authority in the Church (1434/1435-1439)	295
The power of Haec sancta embedded in Tres veritates	296
The papal doctrine of authority.	300
Confirmation of papal authority	302
<i>Part 4. The response to the conciliar threat: a downgrading of papal authority. Papal policy from 1439</i>	307
Chapter 9. The situation in 1439	310
The balance of power in 1439	310
Eugene's secular allies in 1439	313
Philip the Good, Duke of Burgundy	314
Henry VI of England	315
The final battle	317
Chapter 10. The end of the Council of Basel in sight (1439-1449)	319
Turning the Papal States into a safe haven	319
The situation prior to 1439	319
Alfonso of Aragon gains control	322
The contest for the German Empire	325
Neutral, with variations	325
In the papal camp	327
France, the cool lover.	332
De facto French withdrawal	333
The Council of Basel put to rest	334
The King of France as the victor	336
Chapter 11. Ecclesiastical authority downgraded in relation to temporal power (1439-1449)	337
Downgrading papal authority in relation to the authority of European sovereigns	338
Politics replaces belief.	338
A new defence of papal authority.	340
A downgrading in comparison to the authority of secular rulers	342
How the Council of Basel downgraded the pope's ecclesiastical authority in relation to the pope's temporal power	344
No response in Etsi non dubitemus	345
A downgrading of the pope's ecclesiastical authority buys Eugene time	347

<i>General conclusion and epilogue</i>	349
General conclusion	349
Epilogue	358
<i>Appendices</i>	363
Appendix 1: Survey of the relevant papal bulls, letters and instructions of Eugene IV	363
Appendix 2: Survey of the relevant decrees, sessions and documents emanating from the Council of Basel and its chairman Cardinal Cesarini	365
<i>Bibliography</i>	367
Unpublished primary sources	367
Printed sources	367
Secondary sources	369
<i>Colophon</i>	399