

How Dwarfs Became Giants

The Discovery of the Mass-Luminosity Relation

Stefano Lecchini



Bern Studies in the History and Philosophy of Science

Bern Studies

Contents

<i>Introduction</i>	<i>i</i>
<i>I Eddington's Star Model</i>	<i>1</i>
1 The Star Model's Equations	1
1.1 The Matter's Equation of State	2
1.2 The Differential Equation for the Radiation Field . . .	3
1.3 Intermezzo	7
1.4 The Hydrostatic Equilibrium Equation	7
1.5 The Thermal Equilibrium Equation	8
1.6 The System of Equations	9
2 The Differential Equation for the Density Function . . .	10
3 The Luminosity Formula	14
4 The Solution for Ideal Gas Spheres	14
5 The Solution for Non-Ideal Gas Spheres	18
6 The Setting-Up of the Parameters	21
7 Summary	22
<i>II The Empirical Basis of the Model</i>	<i>25</i>
1 Verification of the Luminosity Formula	25
1.1 The Temperature of Dwarf Stars	26
2 General predictions	29
2.1 Giant stars	29
2.2 Dwarf stars	32
3 Summary	33
<i>III The Stellar Absorption Theory</i>	<i>35</i>
1 Introduction	35
2 Eddington's Absorption Theory	36

3	Absorption Theory and the Star Model - I	39
3.1	Dwarf Stars	41
3.2	Giant Stars	42
4	Criticisms of Eddington's Theory	45
5	Kramers' Theory	47
6	Absorption Theory and the Star Model - II	50
7	The Case of <i>Capella</i>	52
7.1	A Serious Discrepancy	52
7.2	A New Insight	54
8	Summary	55
<i>IV</i>	<i>The Discovery of the ML Relation</i>	57
1	The Companion of Sirius (Sirius B)	57
2	Explaining Sirius B	58
3	A Series of Problems	61
3.1	The Boundary of the Atoms	62
3.2	The Effective Size of the Ions	62
3.3	The Parameter ρ_0	63
4	Maximal Density and Luminosity Drop	64
4.1	The Drop in Luminosity	64
4.2	Calculating ρ_0 from ΔL	66
5	Recalibrating ρ_0	68
6	The ML Relation	71
7	Structure of the Reconstruction	73
8	<i>Per aspera ad astra</i>	75
9	Other Reconstructions	78
9.1	Kenat, 1987	78
9.2	Schwarz, 1992 & 1994	79
<i>V</i>	<i>Eddington's False Historical Reconstruction</i>	83
1	Eddington's Reversal of the Historical Order	83
2	Sirius B \rightarrow ML Relation vs. ML Relation \rightarrow Sirius B	86
3	Conclusion	90
	<i>Appendices</i>	91
<i>A</i>	<i>Eddington's papers</i>	91

1	Das Strahlungsgleichgewicht der Sterne, Zeitsch. für Phys.7(1921), pp. 351-397.	91
2	On the relation between the masses and luminosities of the stars, MNRAS 84 (1924), pp. 308-332.	139
<i>B</i>	<i>Eddington - Ehrenfest Correspondence</i>	167
1	Eddington to Ehrenfest, 21th September 1923.	168
2	Eddington to Ehrenfest, 4th October 1923.	170
<i>C</i>	<i>Eddington - Kramers Correspondence</i>	173
1	Eddington to Kramers, 12th December 1923.	174
2	Kramers to Eddington, 15th December 1923.	177
<i>D</i>	<i>Eddington - Adams Correspondence</i>	181
1	Adams to Eddington, 3rd January 1924.	182
2	Adams to Eddington, 12th February 1924.	184
3	Adams to Eddington, 3rd March 1923.	187
4	Eddington to Adams, 13th January 1924.	190
5	Eddington to Adams, 6th February 1924.	192
6	Eddington to Adams, 22nd March 1924.	195
<i>E</i>	<i>Leiden, 1923</i>	199
<i>F</i>	<i>Astronomics</i>	201
1	Astronomical Quantities	201
1.1	The Parallax	201
1.2	The Spectral Type	202
1.3	The Magnitude(s) and the Luminosity	202
1.4	The Effective Temperature	203
1.5	The Radius	204
1.6	The Mass	205
2	The Hertzsprung-Russell (HR) Diagram	205
2.1	Giant and Dwarf Stars	206
2.2	Russell's Stellar Evolutionary Theory	207