## Echoes from a distant shore: The right to education in international development

With special reference to the role of the World Bank

Joanna Bourke Martignoni



## Table of Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	1
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	9
INTRODUCTION	13
1. Education, Human Rights and Human Development: A Reflexive Relationship?	14
2. Why Rights? The Added Value of a Rights-Based Approach to Education	18
3. Why the World Bank?	21
4. Objectives of this study	23
5. A Note About Terminology and Definitions	24
6. Research Methodology and Structure	25
SECTION I THE RIGHT TO EDUCATION	31
CHAPTER ONE: EDUCATION AS A HUMAN RIGHT	33
1. WHAT IS 'EDUCATION'? HISTORY, DEFINITIONS AND BOUNDARIES	37
2. DEFINITIONS, BOUNDARIES AND LIMITS RELATING TO THE CONCEPT OF 'EDUCATION' IN INTERNATIONAL LAW	41
CHAPTER TWO: SOURCES OF INTERNATIONAL LAW ON THE RIGHT TO EDUCATION	47
1. TREATY LAW	50
1.1. The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	52
1.2. The UN Convention on the Rights of the Child	57
1.3. The UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education	60
1.4. The UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women	61
1.5. The International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination	63
1.6. The UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities	63
1.7. ILO Convention No. 169 Concerning Indigenous and Tribal Peoples in Independent Countries	64
1.8. International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families	65
1.9. The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	66
1.10. Other treaty-based provisions on education	66
1.11. Conclusions on the right to education in international conventional law	67
2. Customary International Law on Education	70
2.1. The content of right to education in customary international law	71
2.2. Violations as contrary practice?	75
2.3. Conclusions on the right to education in customary international law	
3. JUDICIAL AND QUASI-JUDICIAL INTERPRETATION OF THE RIGHT TO EDUCATION	76
3.1. The status of General Comments by UN treaty bodies	77
3.2. Other 'jurisprudence' by international human rights monitoring mechanisms	83

3.3. International and regional courts and the right to education	86
3.4. The right to education before national courts	91
3.5. Conclusions on judicial and quasi-judicial interpretation of the right to education	97
4. POLITICAL DECLARATIONS, NON-BINDING COMMITMENTS AND OTHER 'SOFT LAW'	98
4.1. Political Declarations and Commitments	98
4.2. Conclusions on the Education for All Declarations and the Millennium Development Goals as S of Soft Law	Sources 104
4.3. Other 'standard-setting' tools: institutional policies, procedures, guidelines and conditionalities	106
5. 'SUBSIDIARY SOURCES' OF INTERNATIONAL LAW ON THE RIGHT TO EDUCATION: DOCTRINE AND EXPERT OPINIONS	108
5.1. The Limburg Principles and the Maastricht Guidelines	109
5.2. UN Special Rapporteurs and Independent Experts	110
5.3. NGOs and other Coalitions of Experts	111
6. Conclusions on the Definition of the Right(s) to Education in International Law and its 'Core Content'	112
CHAPTER THREE: RIGHTS TO, WITHIN AND THROUGH EDUCATION WHO ARE THE RIGHT HOLDERS AND WHAT ARE THEIR ENTITLEMENTS?	
1. CHILDREN AND PARENTS AS EDUCATIONAL RIGHT HOLDERS	
1. CHILDREN AND PARENTS AS EDUCATIONAL RIGHT HOLDERS	
	121
1.2. Children's rights within education: non-discrimination, freedom of expression, religion and association, privacy rights and freedom from violence	
1.3. Conclusions on children as the holders of rights to, through and within education	
2. Adult Rights and Education	141
2.1. Life-long learning and adult rights	. 141
2.2. Higher, Technical and Vocational Education	. 143
2.3. The rights of teachers and other education sector workers	
3. NON-CITIZENS' RIGHTS TO EDUCATION	
4. EDUCATION AS A COLLECTIVE OR GROUP RIGHT	. 152
5. GOVERNMENTS AS RIGHT HOLDERS IN DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION	. 156
6. PRIVATE EDUCATIONAL PROVIDERS AS RIGHT HOLDERS IN EDUCATION	. 160
7. CONCLUSIONS ON RIGHT HOLDERS AND RIGHTS WITHIN EDUCATION	. 163
CHAPTER FOUR: WHO HAS OBLIGATIONS IN RELATION TO THE RIGHT TO EDUCATION? THE DUTY BEARERS	167
1.1. Claiming and Enforcing Obligations	
1.2. Positive and Negative Human Rights Obligations	
1.3. Respect, Protect, Fulfil	
1.4. The Relationship Between Legal Obligations, Responsibility and Accountability	
	-

1.5. Complicity, Complexity and Complementarity: Combining State and Non-State Obligations in Education	181
2. NATIONAL GOVERNMENTS	
2.1. State Obligations to <b>Respect</b> the Right to Education	185
2.2. State Obligations to <b>Protect</b> the Right to Education	
2.3. State Obligations to Fulfil the Right to Education	
3. STATE OBLIGATIONS IN THE CONTEXT OF DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION	
3.1. Obligations of States to Respect, Protect and Fulfil the Right to Education in Third Countries	193
3.2. Obligations of Recipient Countries to Actively Seek External Assistance	
3.3. Corruption prevention	199
4. Putting it Together: Minimum Core Obligations for States to Respect, Protect and Fulfil the Right to Education at Home and Abroad	200
5. INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS AND THEIR OBLIGATIONS TO RESPECT, PROTECT AND FULFIL THE RIGHT TO EDUCATION	204
5.1. Obligations of International Organizations to <b>Respect</b> the Right to Education	208
5.2. Obligations of International Organizations to <b>Protect</b> the Right to Education	210
5.3. Obligations of International Organizations to Fulfil the Right to Education	212
5.4. Conclusions on the Obligations of International Organizations	213
6. The Private Sector	214
7. INDIVIDUALS	217
8. Conclusions on the Holders of Obligations in Connection with the Right to Education	220
CHAPTER FIVE: MEASURING THE RIGHT TO EDUCATION	225
1. AVAILABILITY	231
2. Accessibility	234
2.1. Non-Discrimination	235
2.2. Physical Accessibility	237
2.3. Economic Accessibility	238
3. ACCEPTABILITY	239
4. Adaptability	241
5. INDICATORS ON INTERNATIONAL ASSISTANCE AND COOPERATION	242
6. Conclusions on Measures and Indicators on the Right to Education	248
7. Conclusions to Section I: International Legal Rights and Obligations Connected to Education within Development Cooperation	253

SECTION II INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION AND THE RIGHT TO EDUCATION257
CHAPTER SIX: EDUCATION AND DEVELOPMENT
1. TRENDS IN THE THEORY AND PRACTICE OF DEVELOPMENT ASSISTANCE FOR EDUCATION
1.1. Education as an investment in human capital
1.2. Education as part of human development
1.3. Education and the MDGs
1.4. The Education for All Agenda and Development Aid
1.5. Education as a central human capability
1.6. Evidence-based approaches to education in development assistance
1.7. Human Rights Based Approaches to Education in Development
2. NATIONAL DEVELOPMENT AGENCIES AND EDUCATION
2.1. Rights Based Approaches to Bilateral Aid for Education
2.2. Project-Based Approaches to Education as a Human Right in Bilateral Development Policies 287
2.3. Human Development, the MDGs and Education For All
2.4. Instrumental Justifications for Education Aid: Human Capital and National Strategic Interests. 290
2.5. Value for Money and Cost Effectiveness of Education Aid
3. REGIONAL DEVELOPMENT AGENCIES AND EDUCATION
3.1. The Inter-American Development Bank
3.2. The African Development Bank
3.3. The Asian Development Bank
3.4. The European Commission
4. Conclusions on the Right to Education within Bilateral and Regional Development Programmes and Projects
SECTION III THE WORLD BANK AND EDUCATION
CHAPTER SEVEN: THE WORLD BANK AND THE RIGHT TO EDUCATION
1. AN OVERVIEW OF THE HISTORY, MANDATE, STRUCTURE AND OPERATIONS OF THE WORLD BANK
1.1. Mandate, Organization and Structure
1.2. World Bank Operations: Projects and Operational Guidelines
1.3. Internal Monitoring Mechanisms: the Independent Evaluation Group and the Inspection Panel 327
1.4. The Relationship Between the Bank and its Member States
1.5. The World Bank and the United Nations
2. THE WORLD BANK AND EDUCATION POLICY
2.1. Education, manpower forecasting and vocational training through to basic needs
2.2. Education in the era of structural adjustment

2.3. The phenomenal rise of Education for All	345
2.4. The World Bank and education in the post-MDG era	<b> 34</b> 7
2.5. Whither the Right to Education?	350
3. THE WORLD BANK AND HUMAN RIGHTS: MAKING THE TWAIN MEET	353
3.1. The human rights obligations of the World Bank, under the UN Charter and general international law	353
3.2. The World Bank's mandated prohibition on interference in 'political affairs' and education	357
3.3. Changing the Paradigm: The World Bank and a Rights-Based Approach to Education	359
4. THE WORLD BANK, HUMAN DEVELOPMENT AND THE RIGHT TO EDUCATION. RECONCILIATION OR RESISTANCE?	363
CONCLUSIONS: BRIDGING THE TWO SHORES	371
BIBLIOGRAPHY	379
1. TREATIES, DECLARATIONS AND LEGISLATIVE INSTRUMENTS	379
2. JURISPRUDENCE	382
3. MONOGRAPHS, ARTICLES AND REPORTS	395
4. PRESS CLIPPINGS	431