

Thomas Burri

# **Models of Autonomy?**

**Case Studies of Minority Regimes  
in Hungary and French Polynesia**

Schulthess § 2010

## Table of contents

Acknowledgements .....	IX
Summary contents .....	XI
Table of contents .....	XIII
List of abbreviations .....	XIX
Bibliography .....	XXIII
Legal materials .....	XXIII
Other materials .....	XXXIII
Websites .....	LIX

<b>Introduction .....</b>	<b>1</b>
---------------------------	----------

### **Chapter 1 The Anatomy of Autonomy: Terms and Models.....5**

1.1 The concept of autonomy .....	7
The law of the community .....	7
Ownership of the community .....	8
1.2 Autonomy and international law .....	10
a) Self-determination .....	11
Indeterminacy .....	12
b) Minority protection .....	14
Weak wording and elusive autonomy .....	15
Effective participation .....	17
c) Indigenous peoples .....	20
A right to autonomy .....	21
No general right to autonomy .....	22

d) Self-government.....	25
Local self-government in Europe .....	25
The Charter and autonomy .....	27
Details of autonomy.....	29
e) Implications of international law .....	30
1.3 Conceptions of autonomy .....	33
a) International legal scholars and autonomy .....	33
Variety and context.....	35
b) On the trail of Ulysses, Aeneas, and the <i>Taucher</i> : a broad conception of autonomy régimes.....	37
Dawning.....	38
1.4 Models of autonomy .....	40
a) Previous efforts to create models of autonomy .....	40
i) The horizontal approach.....	40
Full autonomy.....	40
Factors of success .....	42
Nordic knowledge.....	44
Experiences.....	46
Recommendations from Lund .....	46
ii) In-depth studies .....	49
iii) Indicator models.....	50
b) Devising the idea of a model of autonomy .....	51
What is a model? .....	52
Exemplary character .....	54
Qualifications.....	55
Causation .....	57
Model traits of autonomy régimes.....	58
Effective extrapolation is impossible .....	58
1.5 Concluding observations .....	60

<b>Chapter 2 Of Uses and Abuses: The German Minority in Hungary .....</b>	<b>61</b>
2.1 The basics.....	63
The Hungarian German minority .....	65
2.2 The autonomy régime of the Hungarian German minority.....	68
a) The constitution of identity.....	69
i) The backbone: a three-tier system of minority self- government .....	69
An example: Babarc .....	71
The three original modes of constituting a minority self-government.....	72
The upper levels of minority self-government .....	73
ii) Double identification: the group and the individual.....	75
The identity of the group .....	75
Three inconsistencies.....	77
The identity of the individual .....	80
Freedom of identity misunderstood.....	81
Persons not territory.....	83
iii) The powers under the autonomy régime .....	85
The principles .....	88
Minority education .....	88
A Hungarian German school .....	91
Space for culture.....	93
Speaking identity .....	94
Media.....	96
b) Resources: financing the autonomy régime.....	99
How much does it cost?.....	101
c) Voicing the needs.....	103
i) National minority self-governments.....	103
ii) The minority ombudsperson.....	105
iii) Representation in Parliament and in other institutions.....	107

- The homogeneity and the “Republican” argument..... 108
- iv) The kin State..... 110
  - Bilateral agreements ..... 111
  - The lack of a kin State ..... 112
- d) Controlling the autonomous..... 113
  - Control over the autonomy régimes ..... 113
  - Day-to-day control..... 116
- e) A symbiotic autonomy régime..... 117
- 2.3 Factors having an impact on the autonomy régime..... 120
  - a) History: *angst* of registers..... 120
  - b) The diaspora..... 123
    - Reasons for Hungary’s engagement ..... 124
    - Reciprocity expectations and credibility ..... 125
    - The trigger function ..... 127
  - c) Runaway integration ..... 128
    - Runaway integration vs. a lack of integration: the  
Roma issue..... 130
    - Reflections in the autonomy régime ..... 132
  - d) Membership in the European Union..... 133
    - Monitoring procedures as legal channels for political  
leverage..... 135
    - Ramifications for the autonomy régimes..... 136
  - e) An answer to the question of diversity ..... 138
- 2.4 Model traits of the autonomy régime ..... 140
  - A macro model trait..... 140
  - A micro model trait..... 143

**Chapter 3 The Freedom of the Turtle: French Polynesia ..... 149**

- 3.1 About the turtle ..... 152
  - Of heroes and villains ..... 153

3.2 The autonomy régime of French Polynesia .....	156
a) The Republic and the autonomy régime .....	156
b) Pieces of a French Polynesian identity .....	160
i) The actors .....	160
The executive .....	160
The assembly .....	161
ii) identity <i>stricto sensu</i> .....	164
iii) Powers and preferences .....	165
<i>Spécialité législative</i> .....	166
Explicit competences of French Polynesia .....	167
Employment and land .....	168
iv) Resources .....	172
c) Tones of a voice of French Polynesia .....	175
Participation in the State competences .....	175
Consultation .....	176
Foreign policy powers .....	177
Representation in the central institutions .....	179
d) The strings of the Republic .....	180
The veto over the autonomy régime .....	181
The high commissioner .....	182
Dissolution of the French Polynesian assembly by the French President .....	184
The courts .....	185
e) A modest autonomy régime .....	188
3.3 Factors having an impact on the autonomy régime .....	190
a) Decolonization, international law, decentralization, and the evolution of the autonomy régime .....	190
(De)colonization .....	191
Secession .....	192
Evolution of the autonomy régime .....	193
The role of international law .....	196

b) <i>Unité</i> and <i>indivisibilité</i> of the Republic .....	198
c) Politics and persons .....	200
The rift .....	200
The political figures .....	201
The style of politics .....	205
Reflections of politics and persons .....	207
d) <i>La bombe</i> .....	209
Dependency on financial aid .....	210
Echoes in the autonomy régime .....	211
The gratification logic .....	213
e) The false <i>doppelgänger</i> : New Caledonia .....	214
Differences .....	214
Correlations between New Caledonia and French Polynesia .....	216
The logic of parallelism .....	218
f) A complex situation .....	219
3.4 Model traits of the autonomy régime .....	221
A macro model trait .....	222
A micro model trait .....	223
A long-term approach .....	224
<b>Perspectives .....</b>	<b>227</b>
Four model traits of the examined autonomy régimes .....	227
Sloterdijk's ironic pitfall .....	229
The final argument .....	230