

ARBEITEN AUS DEM IURISTISCHEN SEMINAR
DER UNIVERSITÄT FREIBURG SCHWEIZ

Herausgegeben von Peter Gauch

278

DANIEL PASCAL WYSS

Social Insurance Law and
Statutory Interpretation:
The Practicability
Argument

The Swiss Approach
in a Comparative Perspective

Schulthess § 2008

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>page</i>
Bibliography	XIX
Abbreviations	XLI
Introduction.....	1
First Part: Basics	5
Chapter 1: The notion of practicability.....	5
§ 1 From a linguistic point of view.....	5
§ 2 From a legal point of view.....	7
I The law finding process in Switzerland and Canada.....	7
1 The Swiss approach according to article 1 of the <i>Swiss Civil Code</i>	7
2 The Canadian approach according to section 1 of the <i>Canadian Interpretation Act</i>	9
II Legal literature on the concept of practicability: An overview	10
III Definition of practicability	13
Chapter 2: Terms and definitions in Social Security Law.....	16
§ 1 What is Social Security Law?.....	16
§ 2 What is Social Insurance Law?.....	20
I The concept of social insurance	20
1 Historical background.....	21
2 Characteristic components	22
II Social Insurance in Switzerland	25
1 Old Age, Survivors' and Disability Insurance («first pillar»).....	26
A) <i>Old Age and Survivors' Insurance</i>	26
B) <i>Disability Insurance</i>	27
2 Mandatory Occupational Pension Plans («second pillar»)	28
3 Compensation for loss of income because of military service, civil protection service or maternity	29

4 Unemployment Insurance incl. allowances in case of insolvency of employers	30
5 Sickness Insurance and Health Care	31
6 Accident Insurance for Workers	32
7 Family Allowances	33
8 Military Insurance	34
III Social Insurance in international perspective	35
1 Old Age Insurance	35
2 Disability or Invalidity Insurance	42
3 Mandatory Occupational Plans or Mandatory Individual Accounts System	48
4 Income Compensation in case of maternity	50
5 Unemployment Insurance	53
6 Sickness or Health Insurance	56
7 Insurance for occupational and non-occupational accidents (Work Injury Insurance)	65
IV Definition of Social Insurance Law	70
§ 3 Additional social security related terms and definitions	71
I Social program	71
1 Historical background	71
2 Pursuit of social equality	72
3 Categories of social programs	73
4 Allocations of powers in Canada and Switzerland	74
5 Definition	75
II Social right(s)	76
1 Conceptual components	76
A) What is a «right»?	76
B) What does «social» mean?	78
2 Examples	79
A) On the international level	79
B) On the national constitutional level	85
3 Definition	114
4 Violation of constitutional freedoms and rights due to the non-granting of social benefits	114

Second Part: The interrelation between practicability and the concept of justice	123
Chapter 1: The concept of justice from an occidental perspective	124
§ 1 The Christian and the Humanistic approaches to justice	124
I The Christian perspective	124
II The Humanistic or scientific perspective	126
1 Justice and toleration	128
2 Justice and fairness	130
3 Justice and morality	132
4 Justice and impartiality	136
5 Justice and equality	138
6 Justice and practicability	147
III Findings	153
§ 2 The contemporary approach to justice: examples	155
I Justice and its relative character	155
II The changing nature of justice in the course of time	157
III Justice and the redistribution of wealth	158
§ 3 Potential points of conflict between practicability and justice: a summary	160
Chapter 2: Comments	164
Third Part: Administrative efficiency and the economic analysis of law	165
Chapter 1: What is efficiency?	165
Chapter 2: Efficiency and equality	170
Chapter 3: Efficiency in social insurance administration	172
§ 1 Practicability and administrative efficiency	172
I The principle of proportionality and practicability	172
II Practicability and finances	173
§ 2 Financial aspects of social insurance programs	174
I In general	174
II In terms of administration costs	176

Chapter 4: Efficiency as a rule of interpretation.....	179
§ 1 In legal literature.....	179
§ 2 In Canadian and Swiss case law	181
I Preliminary remarks	181
II In the Supreme Court of Canada’s jurisdiction	182
1 Access to the Supreme Court of Canada.....	182
2 Standard of judicial review:	
the «pragmatic and functional approach»	183
3 Efficiency as a law finding argument	185
III In the Swiss Federal Supreme Court’s jurisdiction	188
1 Access to the Swiss Federal Supreme Court.....	188
2 No constitutional review of federal statutes.....	189
3 Efficiency as a law finding argument	192
IV Comparison between the Canadian and the Swiss approach.....	196
Chapter 5: Comments.....	208
Chapter 6: Definition of efficiency.....	210
Fourth Part: Methods.....	211
Fifth Part: Results	215
Chapter 1: The practicability argument from a Swiss perspective	217
§ 1 Practicability in legislative schemes	217
I Federal and Cantonal Constitution Acts.....	217
1 Swiss Federal Constitution of April 18, 1999.....	217
A) <i>Practicable fulfillment of federal tasks</i>	217
B) <i>Practicability in the federal law making process</i>	218
2 Cantonal Constitution Acts	219
A) <i>Constitution of the Canton of St. Gallen (SG)</i>	
<i>of June 10, 2001</i>	219
B) <i>Constitution Acts of other Cantons</i>	221
a) <i>Constitution of the Canton of Lucerne (LU)</i>	
<i>of January 29, 1875</i>	221
b) <i>Constitution of the Canton of Solothurn (SO)</i>	
<i>of June 8, 1986</i>	221

c)	Constitution of the Canton of Berne (BE) of June 6, 1993	222
d)	Constitution of the Canton of Appenzell Ausserrhoden (AR) of April 30, 1995.....	222
e)	Constitution of the Canton of Jura (JU) of March 20, 1977	222
f)	Constitution of the Canton of Fribourg (FR) of May 16, 2004	222
II	Federal Social Insurance Acts	224
1	Sickness Insurance Act of March 18, 1994.....	224
A)	<i>Administration costs (article 22)</i>	225
B)	<i>Legal requirements concerning the amounts covered (article 32)</i>	227
2	Accident Insurance Act of March 20, 1981	231
A)	<i>Occupational diseases (article 9)</i>	232
B)	<i>Disability caused by an accident (article 18)</i>	235
a)	The Federal Supreme Court's legal practice	236
b)	Legislative reasons for the latest amendment	238
c)	The idea of practicability	240
III	Findings.....	241
§ 2	The practicability argument in legal literature.....	244
I	Statutory interpretation: Social Insurance Law	245
1	The characteristics of Social Insurance Law.....	245
A)	<i>In legislation</i>	245
B)	<i>Regarding the application of law</i>	246
C)	<i>Concerning legal interpretation</i>	247
2	Findings	248
II	Statutory interpretation in other areas of the law	249
1	In general	249
A)	<i>Interpretation methods</i>	249
B)	<i>Rules of interpretation</i>	250
C)	<i>Findings</i>	250
2	<i>Practicability as a rule of interpretation</i>	251
A)	<i>In Social Insurance Law</i>	251
B)	<i>In Public and Administrative Law</i>	252
C)	<i>In Private Law</i>	253
D)	<i>Findings</i>	255

- § 3 The practicability argument in the Federal Supreme Court's jurisdiction 256
 - I Practicability as the purpose of interpretation 258
 - 1 Practicability in the context of a fair and just interpretation 258
 - A) *Case law* 258
 - B) *Comments* 263
 - 2 Practicability in the context of an efficient interpretation 267
 - A) *Case law* 267
 - B) *Comments* 273
 - II Practicability and the law's feasible implementation 275
 - 1 Practicability as a means of avoiding disproportionate administrative burdens 276
 - A) *Case law* 276
 - B) *Comments* 282
 - 2 Practicability in the sense of schematization 289
 - A) *Case law* 289
 - B) *Comments* 296
 - III Additional aspects of the practicability argument 301
 - 1 Practicability and administrative guidelines and tariff agreements 301
 - A) *Case law* 301
 - B) *Comments* 305
 - 2 Practicability and the principle of equality 307
 - A) *Case law* 307
 - B) *Comments* 310
 - 3 Practicability and the principle of legal certainty 311
 - A) *Case law* 312
 - B) *Comments* 314
 - 4 Practicability and the principle of legality 317
 - A) *Case law* 317
 - B) *Comments* 321
- § 4 Outlook on the next chapters 323

Chapter 2: The practicability argument in a comparative perspective.....	325
§ 1 Continental European civil law countries.....	325
I Austria.....	325
1 Statute Law	325
2 Legal literature on statutory interpretation.....	326
3 Judgments of the Constitutional Court («Verfassungsgerichtshof»)	328
4 Comments	331
II Germany.....	332
1 Statute Law	332
2 Legal literature on statutory interpretation.....	334
3 Federal Constitutional Court and Federal Social Court judgments.....	339
A) <i>Decisions of the Federal Constitutional Court</i> («Bundesverfassungsgericht»).....	339
B) <i>Decisions of the Federal Social Court</i> («Bundessozialgericht»).....	344
4 Comments	348
§ 2 North American common law countries.....	350
I Excursus: What is common law?	351
II The Canadian and the U.S. perspectives.....	353
1 Canada	354
A) <i>Legislative schemes</i>	357
B) <i>Legal literature on statutory interpretation</i>	358
C) <i>Decisions of the Supreme Court of Canada</i>	361
D) <i>Comments</i>	365
2 The U.S.	367
A) <i>Legislative schemes</i>	368
B) <i>Legal literature on statutory interpretation</i>	371
C) <i>Decisions of the U.S. Supreme Court</i>	372
D) <i>Comments</i>	376

Sixth Part: Discussion	379
Chapter 1: Starting point(s)	379
Chapter 2: Elements of the practicability argument	381
§ 1 Practicability as a component of the Rule of Law	381
§ 2 Practicability as an inherent aspect of justice	382
§ 3 Practicability as a legal concept at the constitutional level.....	388
§ 4 The binding character of the practicability argument	397
§ 5 Practicability as a bridge between justice and efficiency	398
Chapter 3: Prospects	405
 Conclusion	 409
 Theses	 411
Thèses (en français)	415
Thesen (auf Deutsch)	419
 Index	 423