

Völkerstrafrecht und
internationales Strafrecht

Edited by / Herausgegeben von
Prof. Dr. iur. Felix Bommer, Universität Luzern
Prof. Dr. iur. Sabine Gless, Universität Basel
Prof. Dr. iur. Frank Meyer, Universität Zürich
Prof. Dr. iur. Hans Vest, Universität Bern

Dr. iur. Thomas Forster

The Khmer Rouge
and the Crime of Genocide

Issues of Genocidal Intent with Regard to
the Khmer Rouge Mass Atrocities

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	V
Table of Common Abbreviations	XIII
Preliminary Remarks	XV
I. INTRODUCTION	1
A. Scope and Outline of the Study	3
B. Introductory Notes on the Crime of Genocide	6
1. Basic Notions	6
2. Relevance of Genocide Charges	9
C. Historical Background	12
1. The Rule of the Khmer Rouge	12
2. The Struggle for Accountability	14
3. Establishment of the ECCC	16
II. THE EXTRAORDINARY CHAMBERS IN THE COURTS OF CAMBODIA AND THE CRIME OF GENOCIDE	19
A. Set-up of the Court	21
1. Legal Basis and Structure of the ECCC	21
2. Jurisdiction of the ECCC	23
a) Scope of the Jurisdiction	24
b) Nullum Crimen Sine Lege	26
c) Impunity Gaps	29
B. Dealing with the Crime of Genocide at the ECCC	31
1. Jurisdiction for the Crime of Genocide	31
a) Discrepancies in the Definition of the Crime of Genocide	32
(1) Variation between Article II of the Genocide Convention and Article 4 of the ECCC Law	32
(2) Variation between Article III of the Genocide Convention and Article 4 of the ECCC Law	34
b) Relevance of the Discrepancies	36
2. Investigation and Prosecution of the Crime of Genocide at the ECCC	39
a) System of Investigation and Prosecution at the ECCC	40
b) Overview of the Challenges to the Genocide Investigations	42
(1) The ECCC as a New and Particular Hybrid Criminal Court	42
(2) Problems Stemming from the ECCC's Hybrid Nature	43
(3) Language and Cultural Problems	45
(4) Financial and Time Constraints	45
(5) Structural and Political Challenges	46

c) Evidence	47
(1) Testimonial Evidence	50
(2) Documentary Evidence	50
(3) Forensic Evidence	53
d) Genocide Charges at the ECCC	55

III. GENOCIDE AS A CRIMINAL OFFENCE – RELEVANT DOGMATIC ISSUES

A. General Notions of the Crime of Genocide	60
1. Nature of the Crime of Genocide	60
a) Genocide as a Crime Against Humanity	61
b) Hierarchical Position	62
c) Status as Legal Norm in International Criminal Law	64
2. Basic Structure and Characteristics of the Crime of Genocide	67
a) Structure	68
b) Intended Group Destruction	69
c) Object of Protection	69
d) Inchoate Offense	70
3. Structural Elements	71
a) Physical Element	71
b) Mental Element Corresponding to the Actus Reus	73
c) Intent to Destroy a Group	73
B. A Closer Look at Intent	75
1. The Concept of Intent	75
a) Paradigm and Connotations	75
b) Comparative Perspective	76
(1) Intent Covers Ends and Means	77
(2) Intent Includes ‘Oblique Intent’	78
(3) Volitional and Cognitive Elements Need Not Be Present Cumulatively	79
c) Delimitation and Differentiation of Intent	79
d) Specific Intent	80
2. Concept of Intent for the Crime of Genocide	81
a) Required Degree of Intent for ‘Intent to Destroy’	82
(1) Special Intent in the Sense of Purpose Required?	83
(a) Prevailing View	84
(b) Closer Scrutiny	85
(2) Reckless Genocide?	87
(3) Practical Implications	87
b) Reference to Collective Acts	88
(1) Relevant Perspective on Genocidal Intent	89
(2) Collective Context	91
(3) Relationship Between Individual Acts and Collective Context	93

C. Object and Substance of Additional Intent	96
1. The Group as Target of the Intent to Destroy	96
a) Interpretation of the Enumerated Groups	98
(1) Definition of Enumerated Groups	99
(2) Exclusiveness or Overall-Conception of Enumerated Groups?	100
b) Relevant Perception of Victim Groups	102
(1) Impossibility of Finding an Objective Definition	103
(2) Groups as Social Constructs	104
(3) Differing Approaches	105
(4) Tangible Group Identity	107
(5) Importance of the Perpetrators' View of Group Affiliation	109
c) An Important Shift	112
2. Intended Destruction	113
a) Nature of the Intended Destruction	114
b) Intending to Destroy 'In Whole or In Part'	117
c) Intent to Destroy a Group 'As Such'	121
D. Motive	123
1. The Distinction between Motive and Intent and the Irrelevance of Motive	123
2. The Role of Motive for Genocide	125
a) Where Motive Comes Into Play	126
b) Individual and Collective Motive	127
E. Proving Genocidal Intent	132
1. Proving Intent By Inference	132
2. Establishing the Collective Context	135
a) Articulations of a Collective Course of Action	138
b) Nature and Extent of Violent Acts	140
(1) Systematic Targeting	140
(2) Scale	141
(3) Characteristics of Acts	142
c) Accompanying Acts	143
3. Proving the Individual Components	144
(1) Proving Knowledge of the Collective Context	144
(2) Proving Individual Intent	145
(a) Characteristics of Individual Acts	146
(b) Individual Statements	146
4. Evidence speaking against the Presence of Genocidal Intent	147
a) Counterindicators at the Collective Level	147
b) Counterindicators at the Individual Level	151
5. Standard of Proof	152

IV. QUESTIONS RAISED BY THE KHMER ROUGE MASS ATROCITIES	155
A. Mass Atrocities Committed Under the Khmer Rouge	156
1. Overview	156
a) Perpetrators	156
b) Policies and Acts	158
c) Victims	159
2. Victim Groups	160
a) Purges	161
(1) Purges of People Affiliated with the Khmer Republic	161
(2) Intra-Party Purges	161
(3) Purges of the General Population	162
b) New People	162
c) Buddhist Monkhood	163
d) Cham Muslims	165
e) Ethnic Vietnamese	168
f) Khmer Krom	169
g) Ethnic Chinese	170
h) East Zone Massacres	171
B. Assessing the Targeting of the Khmer Rouge	173
1. Fundamental Issues	174
a) Basic Implications of the Particular Legal Nature of the Crime of Genocide	175
(1) One Genocide, Multiple Genocides	175
(2) Result Trap	176
b) Leadership Responsibility	178
(1) Errors in Policy?	179
(2) Official Policy, Local Practice	181
c) The Motive Debate	182
(1) The Role of Historical Analysis	182
(2) Motives for Group Targeting	185
2. Group Conceptions	188
a) Targeted Groups within the Khmer Majority	190
(1) Auto-Genocide?	191
(a) Auto-Genocide and the Genocide Convention	192
(b) Targeting of Non-Minority Victims as Auto-Genocide	193
(2) Targeting of a National Group	195
(3) Targeting of Groups Based on Political, Economic and Social Criteria	197
(a) Distinguishing the 'New People'	198
(b) Targeting of People Affiliated with the Khmer Republic	199

(c) Targeting of the East Zone Population	200
(d) Group Conceptions Unprovided For by the Genocide Convention	201
b) Targeting of Minorities	202
3. Genocidal Intent	204
a) Presence and Absence of Intent to Destroy	204
b) Ambiguous Intent	206
(1) Threshold Between Discriminatory Mass Killings and Genocidal Intent	206
(a) Intended Destruction	208
(b) Forced Assimilation	209
(c) Killing of Leadership	213
c) Issues of Proof	216
(1) Consistency	216
(2) Exclusivity of Targeting	218
V. CONCLUDING REMARKS	221
A. Perspectives Gained	222
B. Looking Forward	226
Bibliography	231