

# GREAT LEGAL TRADITIONS

*Civil Law, Common Law, and Chinese Law  
in Historical and Operational Perspective*

**John W. Head**

ROBERT W. WAGSTAFF DISTINGUISHED PROFESSOR OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF KANSAS

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS  
Durham, North Carolina

# Contents

---

List of Boxes and Figures	xvii
Preface and Acknowledgments	xix
Notes on Spellings, Usages, Citations, and Other Conventions	xxiii
Chapter One • Introduction to Legal Traditions and Comparative Law	3
Study Questions	4
Introductory Comment	4
I. The Concept of a Legal Tradition	5
A. Defining “Legal Tradition”	5
1. A Straightforward Approach	5
2. A More Nuanced Approach	7
B. Legal Traditions in Today’s World	10
1. Different Methods of Classifying Legal Traditions and Families	10
2. Competing Lists of Legal Traditions and Families	11
3. Purported Convergences in Legal Traditions	12
C. Deeper Questions on Legal Systems	14
1. What Is Law?	14
2. Hart’s Concept of Law	15
3. Fuller’s Morality of Law	16
D. “Legal Traditions” for Purposes of This Book	18
1. Importance of Historic Conditioning	18
2. Three Great Legal Traditions—Plus Others	18
II. The Value and Challenge of a Comparative Study of Law	21
A. “Comparative Law” as a Term and a Discipline	21
1. What Comparative Law Is	21
2. What Comparative Law Is Not	22
B. Possible Aims of a Comparative Study of Law	22
1. Legal Self-Awareness and Self-Identity	22
2. Law Reform	23
3. Sociological Understanding	23
4. A Tool of Construction	24
5. Cross-Border Legal Practice	24
6. Contributing to a Harmonization of Law	25
C. Waxing and Waning Influence of Comparative Legal Studies	26
1. History of Comparative Law Studies	26
2. Challenges to a Comparative Study of Law	27

D. Integrating Two Perspectives: History and Contemporary Operation	28
1. Comparative Legal History	29
2. Contemporary Operation of Legal Systems	30
Appendices to Chapter One	
Appendix 1.1 Comparative Time Lines for the Three Great Legal Traditions	32
Appendix 1.2 Key Dates and Epochs in the Three Great Legal Traditions	38
Appendix 1.3 Map of Eurasia in Outline	40
<b>Chapter Two • The Civil Law Tradition in Historical Perspective</b>	41
Study Questions	42
Introductory Comment	44
I. The “First Life” of Roman Law: Foundation, Maturation, Compilation	45
A. Overview of Roman Times	46
1. Geographic and Chronological Coverage	46
2. Republic and Empire, East and West, Polytheism and Christianity	50
B. The Twelve Tables	51
1. Political Setting	51
2. Content	52
3. Significance	53
C. Legal Practice in Early Rome	54
1. The <i>Praetor</i>	54
2. The <i>Judex</i>	55
3. The <i>Jurisconsults</i>	56
D. Other Aspects of (Western) Roman Law	58
1. The Tendency Toward Chaos	58
2. The Efforts at Codification	59
3. The Overlay of Christianity	60
E. Justinian and the <i>Corpus Juris Civilis</i>	62
1. Justinian and the Eastern Roman Empire	62
2. The Great Compilation	63
F. The “Law” of the “Dark Ages”	66
1. Partial Eclipse of Law	67
2. Survival and Partial Influence of Roman Law	71
II. The “Second Life” of Roman Law: Rediscovery and Change	72
A. Rediscovering the <i>Digest</i> and Creating the <i>Jus Commune</i>	73
1. The Rediscovery of the <i>Digest</i>	73
2. The Glossators	75
3. Gratian’s <i>Decretum</i> and the Codification of Canon Law	77
4. The Commentators (Post-Glossators)	81
5. Commercial Law	82
6. The <i>Jus Commune</i>	84
B. Replacing the <i>Jus Commune</i> with National Legal Systems	86
1. The Rise of the Nation-State and the Intellectual “Revolution”	86
2. The French <i>Code Civil</i>	91
3. The German Civil Code	100
C. Modern Civil Law in Mass Society	103
1. “Modern” in What Sense?	104
2. The Novelty of “Mass Society”	105

3. Prospects for a New <i>Jus Commune</i>	108
<b>Appendices to Chapter Two</b>	
Appendix 2.1 Biographical Sketch of the Roman <i>Jurisconsult</i> Gaius	111
Appendix 2.2 Biographical Sketch of the Roman <i>Jurisconsult</i> Ulpian	112
Appendix 2.3 Biographical Sketch of the Roman Emperor Constantine	113
Appendix 2.4 Biographical Sketch of the Roman Emperor Justinian	115
Appendix 2.5 Biographical Sketch of Tribonian, Jurist for Justinian	117
Appendix 2.6 Opening Page of the <i>Institutes</i> (Justinian, 6th century CE) (in English translation)	118
Appendix 2.7 Biographical Sketch of Charlemagne	120
Appendix 2.8 Biographical Sketch of Irnerius	122
Appendix 2.9 Biographical Sketch of Gratian (author of <i>Decretum</i> )	123
Appendix 2.10 Biographical Sketch of Accursius (Glossator)	124
Appendix 2.11 Biographical Sketch of Bartolus (Post-Glossator)	125
Appendix 2.12 Biographical Sketch of Dante	127
Appendix 2.13 Biographical Sketch of Machiavelli	129
Appendix 2.14 Biographical Sketch of Thomas Hobbes	131
Appendix 2.15 Biographical Sketch of Napoleon Bonaparte	133
Appendix 2.16 Biographical Sketch of Portalis	136
Appendix 2.17 Biographical Sketch of Savigny	137
Appendix 2.18 Observations by J.A.C. Thomas on “Second Life” of Roman Law	139
Appendix 2.19 Observations by van den Bergh on the <i>Jus Commune</i>	143
Appendix 2.20 Diagrammatic Chronology of European Civil Law	145
Appendix 2.21 History of the Civil Law Tradition in Song	148
<b>Chapter Three • The Civil Law Tradition in Operational Perspective</b>	151
Study Questions	152
Introductory Comments	156
I. Sources of Law and the Role(s) of Lawyers	157
A. Sources of Law	157
1. The Orthodox View	157
2. The Modern View	161
3. The Significance of Caselaw	163
4. The Significance of Legal Scholarship (Doctrine)	164
B. Classifications, Codification, and Certainty	164
1. Private Law and Public Law	165
2. The Role of Codes and Codification	167
3. Certainty and Equity	173
C. The Legal Profession(s)	174
1. Introduction	174
2. Judges	176
3. Public Prosecutors (State’s Attorneys)	178
4. Government Lawyers	179
5. Advocates	179
6. Notaries	181
7. Academic Lawyers (Legal Scholars)	181
D. Illustrations from Italian Law	181

1. Sources of Law in Italy	182
2. Classifications and Codification of Law in Italy	186
3. The Legal Professions and Legal Education in Italy	187
a. The Italian law student	188
b. The Italian law schools	188
c. Courses of study and degree programs	189
d. Curricular details	192
e. Career selection and preparation	194
II. Content and Operation	199
A. Criminal Procedure	199
1. History, Reform, and Compromise	200
2. Criminal Procedure in Action in the Modern Civil Law World	204
B. Civil Procedure	208
1. Where Is the Trial?	208
2. Evidence and Proof	215
3. Judgments, Enforcement, and Appeals	218
C. Division of Court Structures and Jurisdiction	220
1. Ordinary Courts	222
2. Administrative Courts	224
3. Constitutional Councils and Courts	225
D. Illustrations from Italian Law	228
1. Criminal Courts and Actions in Italy	228
2. Constitutional Courts and Actions in Italy	229
III. Closing Observations	231
A. Distribution of the Civil Law	232
1. Colonization	232
2. Decolonization and Nationalization of Law	234
B. The Future of the Civil Law	235
1. "Mixed" Legal Systems	235
2. The Role of Religion and Ideology	236
3. Criticisms of the Civil Law Tradition	238
<b>Appendices to Chapter Three</b>	
Appendix 3.1 Training of Lawyers in Four Legal Systems (excerpts from journal article by Szto)	239
Appendix 3.2 The O.J. Sampson Inquisition (law journal article by Moscovitz on comparative criminal procedure)	255
Appendix 3.3 The Foxy Knoxy Trial (excerpts from article by Griffith on comparative criminal law)	302
Appendix 3.4 Criminal Procedure in Italian Law (by Gabriella Di Paolo, University of Trento)	317
Appendix 3.5 Map of the World in 1800 (showing colonial claims)	325
Appendix 3.6 Map of the World in 1910 (showing colonial claims)	326
Appendix 3.7 Map of Africa in 1914 (showing European claims)	327
<b>Chapter Four • The Common Law Tradition in Historical Perspective</b>	329
Study Questions	330
Introductory Comments	332
I. Pre-Norman English Law	333
A. The Celts and the Romans in Britain	333

B.	The Anglo-Saxon Period	334
1.	Germanic Tribes and the Importance of Customs	334
2.	Courts in Anglo-Saxon England	336
II.	The Rise of Common Law after the Norman Conquest	338
A.	The Norman Takeover and William's Reforms	338
1.	An Overview of the Significance of 1066	338
2.	The Bayeux Tapestry	339
3.	Feudalism, Centralization, and the Common Law	342
4.	The Royal Courts	343
B.	A Tug-of-War of Courts—National versus Local	344
1.	Peculiarities of Courts—Further Details	344
2.	The Writ System	347
3.	Consequences of this Peculiar Course of Development	348
a.	Emphasis on procedure	349
b.	Categories and concepts	349
c.	Public law and private law	350
d.	Barriers to the reception of Roman law	350
III.	The Need for and Rise of Equity	354
A.	Law and Equity in Conflict	354
B.	The Post-Conflict Complementarity of Law and Equity	360
IV.	Modestly Revolutionary Change and Legal Continuities	364
A.	The Rationalization of English Law	364
1.	Commercial Law	364
2.	Blackstone's <i>Commentaries</i>	365
3.	The 19th Century Reforms	366
B.	Modern Common Law in Mass Society	370
V.	Transplantation of the Common Law	372
A.	Reasons for, and Extent of, Distribution	372
B.	The American Experience	378
<b>Appendices to Chapter Four</b>		
Appendix 4.1	Excerpts from Laws of King Æthelbert, 600 CE	383
Appendix 4.2	Biographical Sketch of King Æthelbert	385
Appendix 4.3	Biographical Sketch of King Canute	387
Appendix 4.4	Biographical Sketch of William of Normandy	389
Appendix 4.5	Biographical Sketch of Harold II	391
Appendix 4.6	List of English Sovereigns Beginning with William I	392
Appendix 4.7	Biographical Sketch of King John	393
Appendix 4.8	Biographical Sketch of Vacarius	395
Appendix 4.9	Biographical Sketch of Henry de Bracton	396
Appendix 4.10	Biographical Sketch of Thomas de Littleton	397
Appendix 4.11	Biographical Sketch of Henry VIII	398
Appendix 4.12	Biographical Sketch of Sir Edward Coke	400
Appendix 4.13	Biographical Sketch of Lord Mansfield	401
Appendix 4.14	Biographical Sketch of William Blackstone	402
Appendix 4.15	Biographical Sketch of Jeremy Bentham	404
Appendix 4.16	Biographical Sketch of James Kent	405
Appendix 4.17	Biographical Sketch of David Dudley Field	406

Appendix 4.18	Legal Codification in America (excerpt of law journal article by Head)	408
Appendix 4.19	History of the Common Law Tradition in Song	432
<b>Chapter Five • The Common Law Tradition in Operational Perspective</b>		<b>433</b>
Study Questions		433
Introductory Comments		434
I. Sources of Law		436
A. Sources of Law in General		436
B. The Interplay of Statutes and Caselaw		440
C. Law and Equity		442
D. Custom		445
E. The Role of Jurists and Legal Writing		446
II. Categories of Law and Lawyers		447
A. The Legal Profession		447
B. Private Law and Public Law		447
III. Content and Operation		448
A. Criminal Procedure		448
B. Civil Procedure		451
C. Division of Court Structures and Jurisdiction		452
D. The Role of Religion and Ideology		452
IV. Closing Observations		453
<b>Chapter Six • The Chinese Legal Tradition in Historical Perspective</b>		<b>455</b>
Study Questions		456
Introductory Comments		458
I. Dynastic China's Legal Development		459
A. Overview and Patterns		459
B. Confucianism and Legalism		463
1. Foundations of <i>Lǐ</i> and the Confucianist Tradition		463
a. Confucius and the <i>lǐ</i>		463
b. Mengzi and Xunzi		468
2. Legalism and the "Confucianization" of the Law		470
a. The Legalists, <i>Fǎ</i> , and the Qin Dynasty		470
b. The Han Dynasty and Dong Zhongshu		472
C. Law Codes in Dynastic China		476
1. The Han Code		476
2. The Kaihuang Code and the Tang Code		477
a. Yang Jian		477
b. The Tang Code		478
3. The Song, Yüan, Ming, and Qing Codes		481
a. Song, Yüan, and Ming continuity		481
b. Qing Code—general structure and substance		482
c. The district magistrate		482
d. Civil law under the Qing Code		484
e. Rules of behavior outside the code		488
D. Key Themes in Dynastic Chinese Law		489
1. Law and Continuity		490
a. Qin unification		492

b. Continuity and legal conservatism	492
c. Codes as cultural constitutions	493
2. Law and Dynastic China's Rejection of Challengers	494
a. Military and political challenges	494
b. Religious and intellectual challenges	497
c. European ideas and economic pressure	497
d. Durability in China's response to external influence	500
3. The Rule of Law versus Political Control	501
4. The Guiding Ethic in Law and Government	503
II. Modern China's Legal Development	506
A. Overview and Patterns	506
B. The Republic of China (1911–1949)	513
1. The Qing Collapse, Legal Reform, and the May Fourth Movement	514
2. Nationalists and Communists	516
C. The PRC in Mao Zedong's Grip (1949–1978)	517
1. A Sharp Left Turn	517
2. Governing by Movement	518
3. Revolutionary Meltdown	520
D. The PRC in Reform Mode (1979–Present)	520
1. Legal and Economic Reclamation	520
2. A Legislative and Regulatory Frenzy	521
3. Institutional Recovery	525
4. Summing Up as of 2010	526
E. Discontinuities and Disconnections in Contemporary Chinese Law	527
1. A Termination of Dynastic Chinese Law's Continuity	527
2. The Balance between Indigenous and Exogenous Influences	530
a. Striking the balance in dynastic Chinese law	530
b. Striking the balance in contemporary Chinese law	530
c. Reasons for a thorough filtering	534
Appendices to Chapter Six	
Appendix 6.1 History of the Chinese Legal Tradition in Song	536
Chapter Seven • The Chinese Legal Tradition in Operational Perspective	537
Study Questions	539
Introductory Comments	540
I. Rule of Law in China	541
A. Preliminary Definitions and Distinctions: Fazhi, Renzhi, and Instrumentalism	541
1. Rule of Law—A Survey of Meanings	542
2. Rule of Law in a Chinese Context	544
a. In general	544
b. Rule of man, rule of law, and rule by law	546
c. Constitutional considerations	548
B. Three Questions	553
1. Control versus Discretion	554
2. A Focus on <i>Minshi</i>	555
3. Who Writes the Rules?	556
C. Thick and Thin Versions of a Rule of Law	560

1. Peerenboom and Fuller	560
2. Proposing and Testing a Hypothesis	561
a. A hypothesis on aspirations	561
b. "Feeling the stones when crossing the river"	564
c. Democracy and rule of law	566
d. Importance of administrative procedure rules	567
e. Restrictions on officials' power	567
f. Rule of law and international standards	568
g. Rule of law or rule of <i>li</i> ?	569
h. Pluralism in perspectives	569
i. Consensus in observation?	570
D. A Summing-Up on the Rule of Law	573
II. Sources and Categories of Law and Lawyers	574
A. Formal and Informal Sources of Law	575
B. Legal Categories	580
C. The Roles of Judges and Legal Scholars	583
1. Judicial Jurisdiction Outside Trials	584
2. Questionable Independence of Judges	584
3. Lingering Problems with Judicial Incompetence	586
4. Judicial "Explanation" — Limited Legislative Power?	588
5. The Role of Scholars	589
III. Chinese Criminal Procedure	590
A. Historical Foundations in Modern China	591
1. Efforts before 1979	591
2. The Criminal Procedure Law of 1979	592
3. The Criminal Procedure Law of 1996	593
4. Related Legislation	594
B. General Procedure in Criminal Cases	594
1. Pre-Trial Stage	594
2. First Instance	595
3. Second Instance	597
4. Execution of Judgment	598
C. Roles and Rights of the Main Parties in Criminal Cases	598
1. The Criminal Suspect and Defendant	598
2. Victims	599
3. Judges	599
4. Public Prosecutors	599
5. People's Assessors	600
6. Defense Lawyers	600
7. Public Security Organs	601
D. Issues Concerning Criminal Justice in China	601
1. Judicial Independence	601
2. Relationship between Courts, Procuratorates, and Public Security Organs	602
3. The Lawyer's Restricted Role in Defense	602
4. Testimony by the Suspect or Defendant	603
5. Other Issues	604
IV. Modern China's Legal Ethic	605
A. Preliminary Observations	605

B. Where To Find the Central Legal Ethic—A Survey of Possibilities	607
1. A New Confucianism?	607
a. Neo-Confucianism	607
b. New Confucianism	610
c. Confucianist influence in today's China	612
2. Marxist-Leninist-Maoist-Dengist Thought?	615
a. Constitutional foundations	615
b. Party Line as a new legal ethic?	618
3. Constitutionalism?	622
a. A comparative detour	622
b. Constitutionalism in China	624
4. Religion?	628
5. Other Possibilities	632
C. Modern China's Legal Identity	636
1. Progressivism	637
2. Restoration	638
3. China-Appropriateness	638
4. Extroversion	639
5. Legitimacy	640
6. Materialist Orientation	641
V. Closing Observations	642
Appendix to Chapter Seven	
Appendix 7.1 Sampling of Rule-of-Law Definitions	645
<b>Selected Bibliography</b>	655
<b>About the Author</b>	661
<b>Index</b>	663

# List of Boxes and Figures

---

## Boxes

Box #1.1	Lon Fuller and the “Morality” of Law	16
Box #1.2	History of Comparative Law	26
Box #2.1	Key Developments in the History of Ancient Rome	49
Box #2.2	Excerpts from the Twelve Tables	52
Box #2.3	Early Documents of Christian Doctrine	60
Box #2.4	Preparation of the Corpus Juris Civilis	63
Box #2.5	Defining the “Dark Ages” and the “Middle Ages”	67
Box #2.6	“Holy Roman Empire”	69
Box #2.7	Rediscovery of Justinian’s Digest—Two Accounts	73
Box #2.8	The Authentica Habita	76
Box #2.9	The Age of Enlightenment	90
Box #2.10	Increases in World Population	106
Box #3.1	Orthodox View of the Sources of Law in the Civil Law Tradition	160
Box #3.2	Modern View of the Sources and Authorities of Law in the Civil Law Tradition	161
Box #3.3	The Private/Public Distinction in the Civil Law Tradition	166
Box #3.4	Conditions and Factors for Codification	170
Box #3.5	History and Prestige of Judges and Scholars—Common Law and Civil Law	177
Box #3.6	Compulsory Law Courses at Italian Universities	193
Box #3.7	Sample Course of Study (in Law) at University of Trento	194
Box #3.8	Pyramid Structure of a Career as a Legal Scholar	198
Box #3.9	Cesare Beccaria	201
Box #3.10	Criminal Trial Procedure in Civil Law Countries: Selected Operational Points	207
Box #3.11	Diagram of a Civil Lawsuit—Civil Law Countries versus Common Law Countries	210
Box #3.12	The Division of Court Structures in a Typical Civil Law Country	221
Box #3.13	Italy’s Constitutional Court—Powers, Structures, Operation	229
Box #3.14	The Surge of European Colonization and Conquest— The 1500s through the 1800s	232
Box #3.15	Relationship between Religion and Law—Islamic Legal Tradition versus Western Legal Traditions	237
Box #4.1	Key Dates and Developments in English Legal History	332

Box #4.2	The Bayeux Tapestry and the Battle of Hastings	340
Box #4.3	Diagrammatic Representation of the Development of Courts in England	361
Box # 6.1	Simplified Time Line of Most Significant Chinese Dynasties (with approximate starting dates, if known)	460
Box #6.2	Main Chinese Dynasties and Periods	460
Box #6.3	Highlights of Chinese Legal History	461
Box #6.4	Chinese Legal Terms and Concepts	465
Box #6.5	The Tang Code— Article 170	479
Box #6.6	The Tang Code— Selected Specific Provisions	479
Box #6.7	Sample Provisions from the Qing Code	484
Box #6.8	Comparative Degrees and Continuity of Political Organization	491
Box #6.9	General Definition of “Rule of Law”	501
Box #6.10	Selected Chinese Legal and Political Developments from about 1900	507
Box #6.11	The “Anti-Rightist” Campaign	518
Box #6.12	The “Great Leap Forward” Movement	519
Box #6.13	Post-1979 Chinese Laws— Selected Listing	522
Box #7.1	Rule-of-Law Definitions— An Array of Typical Elements	542
Box #7.2	Formality, Discretion, and Control in Fazhi, Renzhi, and Rule by Law	547
Box #7.3	Excerpts from 1999 Constitutional Amendments on “Rule of Law”	548
Box #7.4	Focusing on Fazhi and the Role of Law in China	550
Box #7.5	“Democratic” Elections in China	559
Box #7.6	Lon Fuller and the “Morality” of Law (abbreviated)	561
Box #7.7	Photograph of Criminal Court in China <sup>151</sup>	596
Box #7.8	Excerpts from 1999 and 2004 Constitutional Amendments on Ideology	615
Box #7.9	Important Features of the Contemporary Chinese Legal Identity	636

## Figures

Figure #2.1	Maps Tracing the Expansion and Contraction of Rome	47
Figure #2.2	Charlemagne’s Empire and Its Later Division	70
Figure #2.3	A Gloss on the Digest	78
Figure #7.1	Prescribed Layout for Courtroom in Criminal Cases	595