

CONTOURS IN THE TEXT

Textual Variation in the Writings of Paul,
Josephus and the Yahad

J.D.H. NORTON



CONTENTS

List of Tables	ix
Acknowledgements	x
Abbreviations	xi
1. PAUL AND JEWISH SCRIPTURE	1
1.1 The question	1
1.1.1 Some terms	2
1.1.2 Emil Kautzsch and Hans Vollmer	5
1.2 Dietrich-Alex Koch	8
1.2.1 Koch's reconstruction of Paul's written sources	9
1.2.2 Koch's conclusions	11
1.2.2.1 (a) Paul generally cited directly from written sources	12
1.2.2.2 (b) Paul only ever cited from one copy of each work	12
1.2.2.3 (c) Paul cited without awareness of variant versions	14
1.2.3 Paul's limited command of the literary content of scripture	14
1.3 Others of the stream represented by Koch	16
1.3.1 Adolf Deissmann and Otto Michel	16
1.3.2 Christopher Stanley	18
1.4 The stream represented by Koch and Paul's awareness of textual plurality	20
1.5 E. Earle Ellis	22
1.6 The stream represented by Ellis	23
1.7 Citation from memory	25
1.7.1 Suppression of memory	28
1.7.2 Awareness of textual plurality	30
1.8 Approaches to evidence	30
1.8.1 Pharisees and Scribes	31
1.8.2 Access to copies	33
1.8.2.1 <i>Excerpta</i>	34
1.8.3 Linguistic milieu	36
1.8.4 Ambient literary modes	36
1.9 Conclusions	37
2. PAUL AND TEXTUAL CRITICISM	39
2.1 Textual criticism and textual plurality in ancient Jewish scripture	39
2.1.1 A multivalent encounter	43

2.2	Modern text-critical perspectives and Paul's awareness of textual plurality	45
2.2.1	Copies and text-forms	45
2.2.2	Paul's awareness of variant readings	47
2.2.3	Expertise and plausibility	48
2.3	Sense contours	52
2.4	Passages	53
2.5	Polyvalent texts	54
2.5.1	'Passages' and 'semantic units'	55
2.6	Conclusions	56
3.	JOSEPHUS AND TEXTUAL PLURALITY	57
3.1	Textual traditions	57
3.2	Assessing Josephus' awareness of textual variation	57
3.3	Josephus' project	58
3.4	Languages	63
3.4.1	Greek	63
3.4.2	Hebrew	63
3.4.3	Aramaic	66
3.5	Debates on the Textual Character of Josephus' Sources	67
3.5.1	Greek Pentateuch sources	67
3.5.2	Hebrew Pentateuch sources	69
3.5.2.1	Manipulations of a Hebrew semantic unit	70
3.6	Josephus' appeal to sense contours in Pentateuch passages	71
3.6.1	Weights and measures	71
3.6.2	Sacrifices	73
3.6.3	Josephus follows the OG for some priestly terms, translating others himself	74
3.7	Conclusions	80
4.	DEAD SEA SECTARIANS AND TEXTUAL PLURALITY	82
4.1	Textual plurality in sectarian exegetical compositions	82
4.1.1	'Passages' and 'semantic units'	82
4.2	Habakkuk 2 ¹⁶ in 1QHabakkuk Peshar (1QpHab.) 11 ⁹	82
4.2.1	Excursus: The Greek Minor Prophets Scroll (8HevXIIgr)	84
4.2.2	1QHabakkuk Peshar	86
4.3	Amos 5 ²⁶⁻²⁷ in the Damascus Document: CD ^A 7 ¹⁴⁻¹⁵ and 4QD ^A (4Q266)	88
4.3.1	Textual evidence	89
4.4	4QCommentary on Genesis A (4Q252)	92
4.4.1	Sense contours arising from שילה	94
4.4.2	Sense contours arising from רגלים and מחקק	99
4.5	A continuum of awareness of textual plurality	103

5. SCRIBES AND TEXTUAL PLURALITY	104
5.1 Scribes and other text users	104
5.2 'Scribal exegesis'	104
5.3 A common exegetical heritage	108
5.4 Scribal awareness of textual plurality	110
5.5 Oral performance of traditional literature	112
5.5.1 Chirographic practices in an oral world	112
5.5.2 Copying by dictation	113
5.6 Orality, chirography and authority	115
5.6.1 Orality, chirography and authority in the <i>Yahad</i>	115
5.7 Conclusions	119
6. APPROACHES TO PAUL'S RHETORIC	121
6.1 Text and interpretation	121
6.2 Orality, chirography and authority in Paul's letters	121
6.3 Reader-centred and author-centred perspectives	124
6.4 Conclusions	131
7. PAUL AND TEXTUAL PLURALITY	132
7.1 Varieties of Citation	132
7.1.1 The role of citations	132
7.2 The rhetorical impact of citations	135
7.2.1 Distinction between supportive and logically structural roles	135
7.2.2 Verbal congruence	136
7.2.3 Changing wording	137
7.3 Structurally indispensable citations	138
7.3.1 The structural substance of Genesis 15.6 and 17.10-14 in Romans	138
7.3.2 The structural substance of Genesis 21.12; 18.10, 14; and 25.23 in Romans 9	139
7.3.2.1 Implications of structural citations	141
7.3.3 The structural substance of Isaiah 8.14 ^{PM} in Romans 9.33	142
7.3.4 The structural substance of Isaiah 25.8 ^{PM} in 1 Corinthians 15	145
7.3.4.1 Isaiah 25.8 ^{PM} in 1 Corinthians 15.54	148
7.4 The suitability argument	153
7.4.1 Isaiah 25.8 (1 Corinthians 15.54)	154
7.4.2 Isaiah 28.11 ^{PM} (1 Corinthians 14.21)	155
7.4.3 Isaiah 59.20-21 (Romans 11.26)	158
7.4.4 Job 5.13 ^{PM} (1 Corinthians 3.19)	160
7.4.5 Hosea 2.1 ^{LXX} (Romans 9.25)	160
7.4.6 Jeremiah 9.22-23 ^{LXX} /1 Kingdoms 2.10 (1 Corinthians 1.31)	160
7.4.7 Concluding remarks	161
7.5 Two semantic forms of Isaiah 40.13 in 1 Corinthians 2.16	161

7.5.1 Problems relating to 1 Corinthians 2.6-16	162
7.5.2 Opposition of 'spirit' and 'conventional intellect' (1 Corinthians 1-4)	164
7.5.3 The function of Isaiah 40 in 1 Corinthians 2	166
7.5.3.1 The unfathomability of creation and the divine intellect in Isaiah 40	166
7.5.3.2 Verbal replication Isaiah 40.13 ^{OG} in 1 Corinthians 2.16	169
7.5.3.3 Ideological parallels of Isaiah 40 in 1 Corinthians 2	171
7.5.3.4 A shared exegetical tradition: Wisdom 9 and 1 Corinthians	174
7.5.3.5 Concluding remarks	176
7.6 Chapter conclusion	177
8. CONCLUSIONS	178
Bibliography	182
Index of Ancient Literature	196
Index of Modern Authors	204
Index of Subjects	207

LIST OF TABLES

2.1 A sense contour in Genesis 2.24	52
2.2 Two sense contours in Habakkuk 2.16	54
3.1 Words used by אר, LXX and Josephus for priestly garments	75
3.2 Order of appearance of priestly garments (<i>AJ</i> 3; Exodus 28; 39)	77
4.1 Textual evidence for Habakkuk 2.16	83
4.2 Textual restoration of 8HevXIIgr column 18, lines 21-24	84
4.3 Amos 5.26	89
4.4 Damascus Document ^A 7	90
4.5 Genesis 49.10	92
4.6 Genesis 49.10 LXX and אר	93
4.7 4Q252 fragment 6	93
4.8 Targums of Genesis 49.10	100
6.1 Embedded verbal replications listed as ‘quotations’ in Ellis 1957	126
6.2 ‘Völlig ungekennzeichnete Zitate’, included by Koch (1986)	127
7.1 Genesis 18 and Romans 9	140
7.2 Isaiah 8.13-14 (Romans 9.33)	142
7.3 Isaiah 25.8	145
7.4 Isaiah 25.8 א' θ' σ'	147
7.5 Isaiah 40.12-14	167
7.6 Isaiah 40.13 and 1 Corinthians 2.16	169
7.7 Isaiah 40.13a	171
7.8 Isaiah 40.28	171
7.9 Parallelism of 1 Corinthians 2.10-11 and 15-16	173