

Designing Public Policies

Principles and instruments

Michael Howlett

Contents

| | |
|----------------------------|------|
| LIST OF FIGURES AND TABLES | xv |
| PREFACE | xvii |
| ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS | xix |

PART I INTRODUCTION: POLICY DESIGN AND THE MODERN STATE **1**

| | |
|---|----------|
| 1 Understanding contemporary policy mixes | 3 |
| The contextual orientation of policy design | 4 |
| Assessing the effects of internationalization on policy design: the globalization hypothesis | 6 |
| Assessing network effects: the 'government to governance' hypothesis | 7 |
| Conclusion: moving beyond globalization and networks in the study of policy design | 11 |
| Readings | 11 |

PART II SYSTEMATICALLY STUDYING POLICY DESIGN **13**

| | |
|---|-----------|
| 2 Key definitions and concepts in the study of policy design | 15 |
| What is public policy? | 15 |

CONTENTS

| | |
|---|-----------|
| What is policy design? | 19 |
| What is a policy instrument? | 22 |
| What is an implementation tool? | 24 |
| Conclusion: policy design and policy instrument choice | 26 |
| Readings | 27 |
| 3 Policy design as policy formulation | 29 |
| Policy formulation as a stage of the policy cycle | 29 |
| Policy analysis and policy formulation | 30 |
| Who are the policy designers? | 31 |
| The role of policy advisors and policy advice systems | 32 |
| The role of policy ideas in policy formulation and policy design | 35 |
| Conclusion: policy design as constrained expert discourse | 38 |
| Readings | 39 |
| 4 Policy design and implementation tool choices | 41 |
| The origins of policy design as an academic field of study | 41 |
| The development of taxonomies and models in the study of policy design | 44 |
| The construction of empirical inventories | 45 |
| The development of taxonomies | 45 |
| Models of instrument choice | 48 |
| Contemporary conceptions of instrument choice | 50 |
| Improving on Hood's taxonomy of policy instruments: adding in procedural tools | 51 |
| Improving on Doern's model of implementation instrument choice: analyzing policy mixes | 53 |
| Developing a micro-level model of tool calibrations: Linder and Peters' clarification of the attributes of instruments choice | 55 |
| Conclusion: <i>the multilevel and nested nature of policy designs</i> | 57 |
| Readings | 57 |
| PART III THE ELEMENTS OF POLICY DESIGN | 61 |
| 5 Organizational implementation tools | 63 |
| Substantive organizational instruments | 63 |

| | |
|--|-----------|
| Direct government | 64 |
| <i>Line departments</i> | 64 |
| <i>Central support agencies</i> | 67 |
| <i>Social and health insurance and pension plans</i> | 67 |
| Quasi-governmental organizational forms | 67 |
| <i>Public enterprises and other corporate forms</i> | 68 |
| <i>Organizational hybrids (alternative service delivery)</i> | 70 |
| <i>Partnerships and contracting out</i> | 71 |
| Procedural organizational instruments | 72 |
| Network management tools | 73 |
| <i>Staff or central (executive) agencies</i> | 73 |
| <i>Tribunals and other quasi-judicial bodies</i> | 74 |
| <i>Creating or reorganizing government agencies</i> | 74 |
| <i>Establishing analytical units</i> | 75 |
| <i>Establishing clientele units</i> | 75 |
| <i>Establishing government reviews, ad hoc task forces, commissions, inquiries and public hearings</i> | 76 |
| <i>Legislative and executive oversight agencies</i> | 77 |
| Conclusion | 78 |
| Readings | 80 |
| 6 Authoritative implementation tools | 83 |
| Substantive authoritative instruments | 83 |
| Direct government regulation | 84 |
| <i>Laws</i> | 85 |
| <i>Independent regulatory commissions</i> | 86 |
| Indirect government regulation | 89 |
| <i>Delegated professional regulation</i> | 89 |
| <i>Voluntary or incentive regulation</i> | 90 |
| Market creation and maintenance | 92 |
| Procedural authoritative instruments | 93 |
| Policy network activation and mobilization tools | 93 |
| <i>Advisory councils</i> | 94 |
| <i>Public consultation, stakeholder and consensus conferences</i> | 96 |
| Conclusion | 97 |
| Readings | 98 |

CONTENTS

| | |
|---|------------|
| 7 Financial implementation tools | 101 |
| Substantive financial instruments | 101 |
| Cash-based financial tools | 102 |
| <i>Grants, subsidies and user fees</i> | 102 |
| Tax- or royalty-based financial instruments | 103 |
| <i>Tax- and royalty-based expenditures</i> | 103 |
| <i>Excise taxes</i> | 104 |
| Cash or tax-equivalent financial tools | 104 |
| <i>Preferential procurement</i> | 105 |
| <i>Favourable insurance and loan guarantees</i> | 105 |
| <i>Vouchers for public services</i> | 106 |
| <i>Sales of state assets at below market prices</i> | 106 |
| Procedural financial instruments | 107 |
| Policy network creation tools | 108 |
| <i>Interest group creation</i> | 109 |
| Network mobilization tools | 110 |
| <i>Interest group alteration/manipulation/co-optation</i> | 110 |
| Conclusion | 112 |
| Readings | 112 |
| | |
| 8 Information-based implementation tools | 115 |
| Substantive informational instruments | 116 |
| Information dissemination tools | 116 |
| <i>Exhortation and moral suasion</i> | 117 |
| <i>Information campaigns</i> | 117 |
| Information and knowledge collection tools | 118 |
| <i>Judicial inquiries and executive commissions</i> | 118 |
| <i>National statistical agencies</i> | 119 |
| <i>Surveys and polling</i> | 119 |
| Procedural informational instruments | 119 |
| Information release tools | 120 |
| <i>Freedom of information legislation</i> | 120 |
| Information release prevention tools | 121 |
| <i>Censorship</i> | 121 |
| <i>Official secrets acts</i> | 121 |
| <i>Privacy acts</i> | 121 |
| Conclusion | 122 |
| Readings | 123 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| PART IV POLICY DESIGNS AND GOVERNANCE MODES REVISITED | 125 |
| 9 Understanding contemporary policy designs | 127 |
| Modes of governance and implementation tool propensities | 128 |
| Patterns of contemporary tool use | 130 |
| Patterns of organizational tool use: direct and indirect instrument designs | 130 |
| Patterns of authoritative tool use: indirect regulation and increased public participation | 131 |
| Patterns of financial tool use: from visible to invisible instruments | 132 |
| Patterns of informational tool use: the growth of exhortation and public information campaigns | 133 |
| Overall patterns in contemporary policy designs | 134 |
| Readings | 136 |
| 10 Conclusion: towards a new generation of policy design studies | 139 |
| Revisiting the contextual orientation in design studies | 140 |
| Lessons for students of policy design | 141 |
| Understanding the design space | 141 |
| Understanding the temporality of design choices | 144 |
| Dealing with complexity: the task of policy design in contemporary government | 145 |
| Readings | 146 |
| NOTES | 149 |
| BIBLIOGRAPHY | 161 |
| INDEX | 229 |

Figures and tables

Figures

| | | |
|------|--|-----|
| 2.1 | The five stages of the policy cycle and their relationship to applied problem-solving | 19 |
| 2.2 | An example of the range of policy instruments by governance mode and stage of the policy cycle | 23 |
| 4.1 | Analytical steps in social science model-building | 44 |
| 4.2 | Cushman's three types of policy tools | 46 |
| 4.3 | The Doern continuum | 49 |
| 4.4 | State and societal components of 'governing resource' effectiveness | 55 |
| 4.5 | Final model of implementation tool selection process involved in policy design | 56 |
| 7.1 | Spectrum of interest articulation systems | 107 |
| 10.1 | Policy design spaces and modes of governance | 143 |

Tables

| | | |
|-----|--|----|
| 1.1 | Modes of governance (empirical content) | 9 |
| 1.2 | Multiple modes of governance (logic) | 10 |
| 2.1 | Components of public policies involved in policy design | 17 |
| 3.1 | The four communities of policy advisors | 34 |
| 3.2 | Advisory system actors by policy level | 34 |
| 3.3 | Ideational components of policy contents | 35 |
| 3.4 | The relationship between policy ideas and policy design elements | 37 |
| 3.5 | Ideas, actors and instruments: the general model | 37 |
| 4.1 | Lowi's matrix of policy implementation activities | 46 |
| 4.2 | Hood's 1986 taxonomy of substantive policy instruments | 47 |

ILLUSTRATIONS

| | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| 4.3 | A resource-based taxonomy of procedural policy instruments | 52 |
| 4.4 | A simplified taxonomy of substantive and procedural implementation tools | 53 |
| 5.1 | Tasks typically undertaken by government agencies | 65 |
| 5.2 | Examples of tasks undertaken by public enterprises | 69 |
| 5.3 | Analytical agency network managerial tasks | 76 |
| 6.1 | Six types of legal instruments | 85 |
| 6.2 | Requisites for regulatory agency independence | 87 |
| 6.3 | Types of voluntary regulation | 91 |
| 6.4 | Actions undertaken by procedural authoritative instruments | 94 |
| 6.5 | Types of advisory committees | 95 |
| 6.6 | Purposes of advisory boards | 95 |
| 6.7 | US Advisory Committee Act (1972) criteria | 96 |
| 6.8 | Types of public consultation – design criteria | 97 |
| 7.1 | Average percentage of “Seed Money” obtained by groups from each source by group type | 109 |
| 7.2 | Source of funding for women’s groups (Canada) | 111 |
| 9.1 | Propensity for tool use by governance mode and resource category | 129 |