



EuropaInstitut

AN DER UNIVERSITÄT ZÜRICH

Herausgeber:
Rolf H. Weber

Jacqueline Jakob-Gallmann

Regulatory Issues in the Carbon Market

The Linkage of the Emission Trading Scheme of Switzerland
with the Emission Trading Scheme of the European Union

Schulthess § 2011

Table of Contents

Foreword	V
Table of Contents	VII
List of Figures	XII
Abbreviations	XIII
Bibliography	XV
Materials	XXVII
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Emission Trading to Combat Climate Change	1
1.2 Thesis Objectives and Outline	3
1.3 Literature and Research	4
2 The International Climate Policy Framework	7
2.1 Introduction	7
2.2 United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC)	8
2.3 The Kyoto Protocol	10
2.3.1 The Article 3.1-Commitment	10
2.3.2 Annex B-Parties	11
2.4 The Kyoto Carbon Market	12
2.4.1 “ <i>The Currency</i> ”	13
2.4.2 Cap-and-Trade: Assigned Amount Trading (AAT)	15
2.4.3 Baseline-and-Credit: Joint Implementation (JI) and Clean Development Mechanism (CDM)	17
2.4.4 Supplementarity and Additionality	21
2.4.5 Governance Issues of the Kyoto Carbon Market	23
2.4.5.1 Temporal Flexibility	24
2.4.5.2 National Registries, CDM Registry and the International Transaction Log (ITL)	24
	VII

2.4.5.3	Issues of Non-Compliance	26
2.5	Compliance with International Law	28
2.5.1	The Principle of Non-Discrimination	29
2.5.2	Emission Units as a Subsidy?	30
2.5.3	Border Tax Adjustments (BTA) to Compensate for Additional Costs?	31
2.5.4	Legitimate Non-Trade Policy Goals?	32
2.6	Other Existing Carbon Markets	34
2.7	Outlook on the Future of the International Climate Framework	35
3	The Emission Trading Scheme of the European Union	39
3.1	Introduction	39
3.2	Current EU-Legislation	39
3.2.1	Approval of Kyoto Protocol	41
3.2.2	Original ETS-Directive	43
3.2.3	Linking-Directive	45
3.2.4	Aviation-Directive	45
3.2.5	Revised ETS-Directive	46
3.2.6	Incorporation of ETS-Directive into the EEA Agreement	47
3.3	Coverage of the Scheme	48
3.3.1	The Cap	48
3.3.1.1	EU-Commitment under Kyoto	48
3.3.1.2	EU-ETS Coverage	49
3.3.1.3	“ <i>Cap within a cap</i> ”	50
3.3.2	Periods	51
3.3.3	Sectors and Gases covered	52
3.4	Stationary Installations	53
3.4.1	Permits, Opting-in and Opting-out	53
3.4.2	Cap-Setting	55
3.4.3	New Entrants Reserve (NER)	57
3.4.4	The Allocation Process	58
3.4.5	Windfall Profits, Over-Allocation and Carbon Leakage	61
3.5	Aviation	63

3.5.1	Cap-Setting in the Aviation Sector	65
3.5.2	The Allocation Process in the Aviation Sector	66
3.5.3	Questioned Legality under International Law	67
3.6	Definition and Recognition of Trading Units	69
3.6.1	Measurement of a Trading Unit	69
3.6.2	Legal Nature of a Trading Unit	70
3.6.3	Offsetting from Abroad - Linking with “Kyoto”	72
3.6.3.1	The Issue of Double-Counting	72
3.6.3.2	The Issue of Supremacy	74
3.6.3.3	The Issue of Additionality	75
3.6.3.4	Offsetting from Abroad - Outlook	76
3.6.4	Linking with Aviation	78
3.7	Compliance Issues	79
3.7.1	Monitoring, Reporting and Verification (MRV)	80
3.7.2	Registration in the EU-ETS	84
3.7.3	Temporal Flexibility	86
3.7.3.1	Banking	87
3.7.3.2	Borrowing	88
3.7.4	Non-Compliance with Reduction Target	90
3.7.5	Enforcement	91
3.8	Performance of the EU-ETS	92
3.8.1	Carbon Price	92
3.8.2	Effectuated Emission Reductions	93
3.9	Outlook on the Future of the EU-ETS	94
4	The Emission Trading Scheme of Switzerland	97
4.1	Introduction	97
4.2	Current Legislation in Switzerland	97
4.2.1	CO ₂ -Act of 8 October 1999	98
4.2.2	CO ₂ -Crediting-Ordinance of 22 June 2005	100
4.2.3	CO ₂ -Fee-Ordinance of 8 June 2007	101
4.2.4	Post 2012-National Legislation	103
4.3	Coverage of the Swiss Emission Trading Scheme (CH-ETS)	105
4.3.1	Periods	106
4.3.2	Gases covered	107
4.3.3	Sectors and Allocation	109

4.3.3.1	Sectors and Allocation through Target Agreements	109
4.3.3.2	Post 2012-Sectors	111
4.3.3.3	Post 2012-Allocation	112
4.4	Definition and Recognition of Trading Units	113
4.4.1	Measurement of a Trading Unit	113
4.4.2	Certificates - Offsetting from Abroad	114
4.4.3	Reduction Units bought by the Swiss " <i>Climate Cent Foundation</i> "	116
4.5	Compliance Issues	117
4.5.1	Monitoring, Reporting and Verification (MRV)	117
4.5.2	Registration	119
4.5.3	Temporal Flexibility	122
4.5.4	The CO ₂ -Fee as an Instrument for Compliance	122
4.5.5	Non-Compliance with CO ₂ -Fee-Provision	124
4.6	Performance of the CH-ETS	124
4.7	Outlook on the Future of the CH-ETS	125
5	Linking Emission Trading Schemes	129
5.1	Introduction	129
5.2	Linking in Theory	130
5.2.1	Form of Linking	130
5.2.1.1	Direct Linking	130
5.2.1.2	Indirect Linking	131
5.2.1.3	Institutional Considerations	132
5.2.2	Linking the Coverage of Sectors and Gases	135
5.2.3	Cap-Setting in a Linked ETS	136
5.2.3.1	Absolute versus Relative Targets	136
5.2.3.2	Incentives to Cap-Setting Altered	137
5.2.4	Allocation in a Linked ETS	139
5.2.5	Definition and Recognition of Trading Units in a Linked ETS	139
5.2.5.1	Differences in Offsetting Rules	140
5.2.5.2	Quantitative Limits of Offsetting	141
5.2.6	Temporal Flexibility in a Linked ETS	142
5.2.6.1	Periods	142
5.2.6.2	Banking	143

5.2.6.3	Borrowing	143
5.2.6.4	Ex-Post Adjustments	143
5.2.7	Governance Issues and Intervention Mechanisms in a Linked ETS	144
5.2.7.1	Monitoring, Reporting and Verification	144
5.2.7.2	Non-Compliance Penalty	145
5.2.7.3	Cost-Containment Measures	145
5.3	Economic Consequences of a Linkage	146
5.3.1	Cost Effectiveness and Efficiency	147
5.3.2	Increasing Liquidity - Decreasing Volatility	149
5.3.3	Prevention against Competitive Distortions	150
5.3.4	Distributional Implications	151
5.3.5	National Concerns	153
5.3.6	Impact on Total Global Emissions	155
5.4	Issues in the Case of a CH-EU-ETS Linkage	155
5.4.1	Linking in Practice	156
5.4.1.1	Mandate for Negotiation	156
5.4.1.2	Conclusion of an International Treaty	156
5.4.1.3	Next Steps	157
5.4.2	Sectors and Entities Covered	158
5.4.3	The Particular Issue of Aviation	159
5.4.4	Market Volume and Price of Emission Units	160
5.4.5	Quantitative Limits of Offsetting	163
5.4.6	Governance Issues in a Linked CH-EU-ETS	165
5.5	Expected Performance of a Linked CH-EU-ETS	166
5.5.1	Carbon Price	166
5.5.2	Effectuated Emission Reductions	166
5.5.3	National Welfare	167
6	Conclusion	169
6.1	The International Climate Policy Framework	169
6.2	The Emission Trading Scheme of the European Union	171
6.3	The Emission Trading Scheme of Switzerland	173
6.4	Linking Emission Trading Schemes	175