

Luzerner Beiträge zur Rechtswissenschaft (LBR)

Herausgegeben von Jörg Schmid im Auftrag der
Rechtswissenschaftlichen Fakultät der Universität Luzern

Band 49

Rachel Benevenuto

Recognition and Enforcement of Foreign Arbitral Awards in Brazil

A Comparative Study with Switzerland

Schulthess § 2010

Table of contents

Summary of contents	IX
Table of contents	XI
List of abbreviations	XIX
Bibliography	XXIII
List of legal sources	XLV
List of materials	XLIX
List of cases	LI
I. Brazilian case law	LI
1. Brazilian Supreme Court	LI
2. Superior Court of Justice	LIII
3. Court of Appeal of the State of São Paulo	LV
II. Swiss case law	LV
1. Swiss Federal Tribunal	LV
2. Court of Cassation of the Canton of Zurich	LVII
3. Court of Appeal of the Canton of Zurich	LVII
4. Court of Appeal of the Canton of Geneva	LVIII
5. Court of Appeal of the Canton of Basel	LVIII
6. District Court of Zurich	LVIII
7. District Court of Affoltern am Albis	LIX
III. Other countries	LIX
1. Spain	LIX
2. United States	LX
3. Venezuela	LX
Introduction	1
Chapter 1: General features	5
I. International commercial arbitration	5
1. A brief history of arbitration	5
2. Definition of arbitration	6
3. Essential characteristics	7
A) The meaning of “international”	7

B)	The meaning of “commercial”	8
II.	Recognition and enforcement of foreign arbitral awards	10
1.	Notion of recognition	10
2.	Notion of enforcement	11
Chapter 2: Legal framework for the recognition and enforcement		13
I.	Brazil	13
1.	Brazilian Arbitration Act	13
A)	Evolution	15
a)	Essential legislative development	15
aa)	Submission agreement versus arbitration clause	17
bb)	Recognition of domestic arbitral awards	20
cc)	Double <i>exequatur</i>	20
b)	Legislative process	23
aa)	Parliament’s procrastination	23
bb)	The judiciary’s exclusive entitlement to render justice	24
c)	Appreciation of the constitutionality	26
B)	Chapter VI of the Brazilian Arbitration Act	28
2.	International commercial arbitration treaties	29
A)	International commercial arbitration treaties and their relationship with the New York Convention	30
a)	The Geneva Protocol	30
b)	The Panama Convention	31
c)	The Montevideo Convention	37
d)	The Mercosur framework	38
aa)	Las Leñas Protocol	39
bb)	The Buenos Aires Agreement	41
e)	Bilateral treaties	44
f)	The New York Convention	45
B)	Relationship between international treaties dealing with the same subject matter	47
a)	Brazilian approach	48
aa)	International treaties and the Brazilian Federal Constitution	48
bb)	International treaties and national law	50
aaa)	<i>Lex posterior derogat priori as a general principle of conflict of laws</i>	51
bbb)	<i>Exceptions to lex posterior derogat priori</i>	53
b)	International approach	55
aa)	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties	55

bb)	Explicit provisions on the relationship between treaties	57
cc)	Principle of maximum efficacy	58
c)	Evaluation	60
3.	Relationship between the New York Convention and the Brazilian Arbitration Act	63
A)	Primacy of the New York Convention	65
a)	Article 34 of the Brazilian Arbitration Act	65
b)	The residual role of the Brazilian Arbitration Act provisions	66
B)	Practical application of the Brazilian Arbitration Act by the state courts	66
a)	Violation of the Brazilian Arbitration Act	68
b)	Violation of the New York Convention	69
aa)	Limited conditions imposed by article III of the New York Convention	69
bb)	Application of further conditions	70
cc)	Mandatory refusal	73
C)	Evaluation	74
II.	Switzerland	75
1.	Chapter 12 of the Swiss Private International Law Act	75
2.	International commercial arbitration treaties	76
A)	International commercial arbitration treaties and their relationship with the New York Convention	76
a)	Bilateral Treaties	76
b)	The Geneva Protocol and the Geneva Convention	77
c)	The New York Convention	78
d)	The Washington Convention	78
B.	Relationship between international treaties dealing with the same subject matter	79
3.	Relationship between the New York Convention and Chapter 12 of the Swiss Private International Law Act	80
III.	Conclusion	81
	Chapter 3: Recognition and enforcement procedure	85
I.	Brazil	85
1.	Separate recognition and enforcement procedures	85
2.	Recognition procedure	86
A)	Introduction	86
a)	Legal framework for the recognition procedure	86
b)	Object of recognition and its legal consequences	87

c)	Equivalence between foreign arbitral awards and foreign judgments	88
aa)	Overview	88
bb)	Practical Application of articles 483 and 484 of the Brazilian Code of Civil Procedure	89
B)	Procedural and formal requirements	90
a)	General requirements	91
aa)	Jurisdiction	91
aaa)	<i>Competence, function and features of the Brazilian Superior Court of Justice</i>	91
bbb)	<i>Current Trend</i>	92
ccc)	<i>Evaluation</i>	93
bb)	Legitimate interest in the proceedings	94
cc)	Formal requirements contained in article 282 of the Brazilian Code of Civil Procedure	95
b)	Specific requirements provided by the New York Convention	96
aa)	Indispensable documents	96
bb)	Translation of documents	97
c)	Further requirements provided by the Brazilian Law	98
C)	Sequence of the recognition proceedings	99
a)	Undisputed recognition	99
b)	Disputed recognition	101
c)	Mandatory intervention of the “Procurador-Geral da República”	102
aa)	Competence, function and features	102
bb)	Evaluation	104
D)	Binding effects of the decision	105
a)	Positive decisions	105
b)	Negative decisions	106
aa)	Procedural flaw	106
bb)	Flaw on the merits	108
cc)	Evaluation	109
c)	Annulment of the decision rendered in the recognition procedure	109
E)	Further Issues	110
a)	Means of appeal	110
b)	Confidentiality	112
c)	Overall Expenses	114
d)	Duration of the procedure	116
e)	Statute of limitations	116
3.	Mandatory recognition despite parties’ acceptance of the award	118

A)	Parties' voluntary compliance with the foreign arbitral award	118
a)	Motivation for parties' voluntary compliance	118
b)	The practice of the administering organizations to foster compliance	120
B)	Legal provision and the grounds for recognizing awards accepted by the parties	121
a)	Efficacy within the Brazilian territory	122
b)	Examination of arbitrability and public policy	124
c)	Compliance may mask serious misconduct	125
C)	Adverse consequences	125
a)	Disappearance of confidentiality	125
b)	Delay in the proceedings	126
D)	Evaluation	127
4.	Enforcement procedure	129
A)	Introduction	129
a)	Commencement of a new procedure	130
b)	Legal framework	130
c)	Object of enforcement	130
d)	Jurisdiction	131
aa)	Overview	131
bb)	Evaluation	131
B)	Sequence of the enforcement proceedings	133
a)	Pecuniary claims	133
aa)	Institution of the procedure	133
bb)	Sequence of the procedure	134
b)	Non-pecuniary claims	136
c)	Duration of the procedure	137
II.	Switzerland	137
1.	Hybrid recognition and enforcement procedures	137
2.	Recognition and enforcement procedure	138
A)	Introduction	138
a)	Legislative competence of the Confederation and Cantons	138
b)	Legal framework for the recognition and enforcement procedures	139
c)	Object of recognition and enforcement	140
B)	Procedural and formal requirements	141
a)	General requirements	142
aa)	Jurisdiction	142
b)	Legitimate interest in the proceedings	143
b)	Specific requirements provided by the New York Convention	144

aa)	Indispensable documents	144
bb)	Translation of documents	148
c)	Formal requirements - missing or incomplete documents?	149
C)	Sequence of the enforcement proceedings	151
a)	Pecuniary claims	151
aa)	Institution of the procedure	151
bb)	Sequence of the procedure	152
cc)	Summary proceedings before a sole judge	152
b)	Non-pecuniary claims	155
D)	Possible procedures in connection with the New York Convention	156
a)	Recognition	157
b)	Declaration of enforceability	157
c)	Declaration of enforceability and enforcement, especially definitive setting aside of the objection	159
d)	Enforcement, especially definitive setting aside of the objection (with the declaration of enforceability being incidentally examined by the judge as a subsidiary question)	160
E)	Binding effect of the decisions	161
a)	Decision on the setting aside of the objection	162
b)	Decision on the recognition, declaration of enforceability and enforcement	163
aa)	Positive decisions	164
bb)	Negative decisions	164
cc)	Evaluation	170
c)	Annulment of the decision rendered in the recognition and enforcement procedure	170
F)	Further issues	171
a)	Means of appeal	171
b)	Confidentiality	173
c)	Overall expenses	175
d)	Duration of the procedure	178
e)	Statute of limitations	178
III.	Conclusion	179
Chapter 4: Limited grounds for a recognition and enforcement refusal		189
I.	Brazil	189
1.	Grounds examined under the condition of a party's demand	190

A)	Incapacity of the parties or invalidity of the arbitration agreement	190
a)	Incapacity of the parties	190
b)	Invalidity of the arbitration agreement	192
aa)	Substantive invalidity	193
bb)	Formal invalidity	194
cc)	Case law	196
dd)	Evaluation	200
B)	Breach of due process	201
a)	Overview	201
b)	Case law	203
c)	Evaluation	205
C)	Award rendered outside of the scope of the arbitration agreement	206
a)	Overview	206
b)	Case law	207
D)	Improper composition of the arbitral tribunal or irregularity in the arbitral proceedings	207
E)	Arbitral award not yet binding, set aside or suspended	209
a)	The binding characteristic of the award	209
b)	Award set aside or suspended in the country of origin	211
2.	Grounds examined by the court on its own motion	212
A)	Inarbitrability of the subject matter of the dispute	213
B)	Public policy	216
a)	Overview	216
b)	Case law	219
aa)	Unreasoned foreign arbitral awards	219
bb)	Service of summons of the parties	220
cc)	Lack of evidence of parties' agreement to arbitrate	222
dd)	Evaluation	223
II.	Switzerland	223
1.	Grounds examined under the condition of a party's demand	224
A)	Incapacity of the parties or invalidity of the arbitration agreement	224
a)	Incapacity of the parties	224
b)	Invalidity of the arbitration agreement	225
aa)	Substantive invalidity	226
bb)	Formal invalidity	226
cc)	Case law	228
dd)	Evaluation	230
B)	Breach of due process	230
a)	Overview	230
b)	Case law	233

C) Award rendered outside of the scope of the arbitration agreement	234
D) Improper composition of the arbitral tribunal or irregularity of the arbitral proceedings	235
a) Overview	235
b) Case law	237
E) Arbitral Award not yet binding, set aside or suspended	238
a) The binding characteristic of the award	238
b) Award set aside or suspended in the country of origin	241
c) Case law	242
2. Grounds examined by the court on its own motion	245
A) Inarbitrability of the subject matter of the dispute	245
B) Public policy	248
a) Overview	248
b) Case law	252
aa) Unreasoned foreign arbitral award	252
bb) Arbitrators' partiality and dependence	253
cc) Waiver of setting aside proceedings	259
III. Conclusion	261
Final conclusions	273
Annex I: NY Convention	279
Annex II: Brazilian Arbitration Act	285
Annex III: Swiss Code of Civil Procedure	297
Index	303