

Health Impact Assessment

Principles and Practice

Martin Birley



publishing for a sustainable future

London • New York

Contents

<i>List of figures, tables and boxes</i>	<i>xv</i>
<i>Foreword by Sir Michael Marmot</i>	<i>xxi</i>
<i>Foreword by Robert Goodland</i>	<i>xxiii</i>
<i>Preface</i>	<i>xxv</i>
<i>About the author</i>	<i>xxvii</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>xxix</i>
Chapter 1 Introduction	1
1.1 What is health impact assessment?	1
1.1.1 Policies, plans, programmes and projects	3
1.1.2 Timing of impact assessment	3
1.2 Who is this book for?	4
1.3 Why is HIA needed?	5
1.3.1 Healthy public policy	7
1.4 The wider literature	8
1.5 Drivers: internal and external	9
1.5.1 Internal drivers	9
1.5.2 External drivers	10
1.6 Contexts for HIA	15
1.6.1 Public versus private	15
1.6.2 Project and policy	16
1.6.3 Sectors and sub-sectors	16
1.7 Impact assessment and social investment	17
1.7.1 Strategic health management	18
1.8 Three kinds of health assessment	18
1.8.1 Health risk assessment	19
1.8.2 Health needs assessment	20
1.9 Quantification	21
1.10 Ethics	23
1.11 Integration and fragmentation	24
1.12 When things go wrong: Bhopal	25
1.13 Exercises	26
1.14 References	26

Chapter 2 Health and its determinants	33
2.1 What is health?	33
2.1.1 Biomedical model of health	34
2.1.2 Socio-environmental model of health	34
2.2 Health determinants and outcomes	34
2.3 Health outcomes	36
2.3.1 Communicable diseases	37
2.3.2 Non-communicable diseases	40
2.3.3 Nutritional disorders	41
2.3.4 Injuries	43
2.3.5 Mental illness and psychosocial disorders	44
2.3.6 Well-being	44
2.4 Determinants of health	45
2.4.1 Individual/family determinants	47
2.4.2 Physical and social environment determinants	47
2.4.3 Institutional determinants	48
2.5 Other categories	48
2.5.1 Hazards and risks	49
2.6 Health inequality	49
2.7 Direct and cumulative impacts	54
2.8 Examples of health impacts	54
2.8.1 Transport	54
2.8.2 Water	56
2.8.3 Resettlement	57
2.8.4 Agriculture	58
2.8.5 Air pollution	59
2.8.6 Construction and tourism	61
2.9 Disability adjusted life years (DALYs)	62
2.10 Epidemiological transition	64
2.11 Health care	67
2.11.1 Low-income economies	68
2.11.2 Developed economies	68
2.12 Health indicators	69
2.13 Vulnerability and resilience	69
2.14 An exercise	72
2.14.1 Mind-mapping	72
2.14.2 Organizing the health concerns	74
2.15 References	74
Chapter 3 History of HIA	79
3.1 Introduction	79
3.2 International development	80
3.3 Some other national trends	86
3.4 HIA in WHO	87
3.5 Environmental health impact assessment	88
3.5.1 Environmental health areas	88
3.6 References	90

Chapter 4 HIA management	95
4.1 Procedure	95
4.2 Screening	95
4.3 An iterative process	100
4.3.1 Screening criteria	101
4.4 Resources	101
4.5 Bias	101
4.5.1 Form a steering group	101
4.6 Scoping	103
4.6.1 Stakeholders	104
4.6.2 Geographical boundaries	104
4.6.3 Time boundaries	105
4.6.4 Data mapping	106
4.6.5 Scoping pitfalls	106
4.7 Commissioning an HIA	107
4.7.1 Example of a poor procurement process	108
4.7.2 Figureheads	108
4.7.3 Procurement and competence	108
4.7.4 Content of a knowledge-level course	110
4.7.5 Necessary and desirable skills	112
4.7.6 Specialist or generic skills?	112
4.7.7 Terms of reference	113
4.8 During the assessment	114
4.8.1 No surprises	114
4.9 Integration	115
4.10 Appraisal, review or evaluation	117
4.10.1 Method quality	119
4.10.2 Process quality	119
4.11 Budget	120
4.11.1 Budgeting for integrated assessment	121
4.12 Timing	122
4.12.1 Examples of timing	123
4.13 Management plan	124
4.14 Evaluation and monitoring	124
4.15 Case study of HIA project management	125
4.16 Accessibility of HIA Reports	126
4.17 Exercises	127
4.18 References	127
4.19 Notes	128
Chapter 5 Methods and tools	129
5.1 Introduction	129
5.2 What HIA is not	130
5.2.1 It's not meant to be perfect	130
5.2.2 Not a search for truth	130
5.2.3 Not a thesis	130
5.2.4 Not a prediction	130

5.2.5	Not a before-and-after tool	131
5.2.6	Not a positivist approach	132
5.2.7	Not for stopping proposals	132
5.3	The nature of evidence	132
5.4	Available evidence	134
5.5	Health concerns	135
5.6	Examining the health concerns	138
5.7	Engagement with informants	138
5.8	Key informants	140
5.9	Community workshops	141
5.9.1	How to do a workshop in a low-income country	141
5.10	More on ‘mind-mapping’	143
5.11	Telephone interviews – a case study	145
5.12	Analysis	148
5.13	Gap analysis	149
5.14	Policy analysis	150
5.15	Causal models	150
5.15.1	DPSEEA model	151
5.15.2	Equity models	151
5.15.3	Quantification	152
5.15.4	Economic models	155
5.15.5	Causal trees, networks and flow diagrams	156
5.15.6	Epidemiology	157
5.15.7	Designs for before-and-after comparisons	159
5.15.8	Incorrect analysis	161
5.16	Changes associated with the proposal	162
5.17	San Serriffe exercise continued	164
5.18	Notes	165
5.19	References	165
Chapter 6 Baseline report		169
6.1	Introduction	169
6.2	Components of baseline analysis	170
6.2.1	Baseline data in the UK	171
6.2.2	Baseline data in low-income countries	171
6.2.3	Literature reviews and gap analysis	173
6.2.4	Example gap analysis	173
6.2.5	International information	174
6.2.6	Inherent inaccuracies	175
6.2.7	International inaccuracies	176
6.2.8	Human rights	176
6.2.9	Corruption index	177
6.2.10	Inequality	178
6.2.11	Trends	179
6.2.12	Reporting adverse data	179
6.2.13	Standard components of a health baseline	179

6.3	National information	179
6.3.1	Example of health profiles in the UK	181
6.3.2	Examples of national data	182
6.3.3	Malaria example	182
6.3.4	Sexually transmitted infections example	182
6.3.5	Existing health services	183
6.4	Primary data collection	184
6.5	Examples of good and bad surveys in developing countries	186
6.5.1	Bad example	186
6.5.2	Good example	187
6.6	Planning a field survey of medical conditions	187
6.7	Ethical issues	188
6.8	Example of baseline field data for a desert project in a developing country	189
6.9	Scoping the baseline: A case study in an Industrialized Economy	190
6.10	Exercise	191
6.11	References	192
Chapter 7 Prioritization		195
7.1	Introduction	195
7.2	Risk assessment matrix	196
7.3	Perception of risk	201
7.3.1	An example of risk perception issues	201
7.3.2	Classifying risk perceptions	202
7.3.3	Voluntary risk takers versus involuntary risk receivers	204
7.4	The NIMBY syndrome	206
7.5	Economic analysis	209
7.6	Win-win	210
7.7	Values, standards and thresholds	210
7.7.1	Case study: Motorway in Europe	211
7.8	Residual impacts	212
7.8.1	Example of residual impact analysis	212
7.9	Exercise	212
7.10	References	214
Chapter 8 Recommendations and management plan		217
8.1	Introduction	217
8.2	Mitigation hierarchy	219
8.2.1	Mitigation examples	220
8.3	Some criteria for appraising recommendations	221
8.3.1	SMART	222
8.3.2	Other tips	223
8.3.3	Create multiple barriers	224
8.4	Inappropriate recommendations	224
8.5	Timing	225
8.6	Case study: Resettlement of a fishing village	226
8.6.1	Sophisticated mitigation option	226
8.6.2	Simple mitigation option	226

8.7	Case study: HIA of Commonwealth Games in Glasgow	227
8.8	More examples of mitigation in large-scale overseas proposals	227
8.9	Mitigating perception of risk	228
8.10	Enhancing positive impacts	228
8.11	Off-the-shelf recommendations	229
8.12	Effectiveness of recommendations	230
8.13	Monitoring	230
	8.13.1 Examples of indicators	231
8.14	Integration	231
8.15	Decision-making	231
	8.15.1 Example	232
8.16	Management plan	233
8.17	Exercises	234
	8.17.1 San Serriffe exercise continued	234
	8.17.2 An appraisal exercise	234
8.18	References	235
Chapter 9 Water resource development		237
9.1	Introduction	237
9.2	Communicable diseases associated with water	239
	9.2.1 Vector-borne diseases	239
	9.2.2 Malaria and mosquitoes	240
	9.2.3 Schistosomiasis and snails	241
	9.2.4 Summary of the PEEM method for assessing the vector-borne disease impacts of water resource development	244
	9.2.5 Diarrhoea and malnutrition	248
9.3	Drinking water	248
	9.3.1 Case study of Sakhalin integrated impact assessment	251
	9.3.2 Case study of arsenic poisoning in Bangladesh	251
9.4	Dams	251
9.5	Resettlement	253
	9.5.1 Phases of resettlement	255
	9.5.2 Risk and resettlement	256
	9.5.3 Resettler participation	257
	9.5.4 Resettlement funding	258
	9.5.5 Managing resettlement	258
9.6	Migrants	259
9.7	Wastewater	259
	9.7.1 Case study: Health impacts of a wastewater treatment plant	262
9.8	Wetlands	263
9.9	Exercise	264
9.10	References	265
Chapter 10 Extractive industries		269
10.1	Introduction	269
10.2	Oil and gas	270

10.2.1	Social investment	271
10.2.2	Joint ventures	271
10.3	Building understanding and capacity	272
10.4	Screening	273
10.5	Potential health impacts of oil and gas sector proposals	273
10.5.1	Exploration	274
10.5.2	Construction	275
10.5.3	Operation	276
10.5.4	Decommissioning	278
10.6	Informal settlements	278
10.7	Case study from the United Arab Emirates	279
10.8	Mining	283
10.8.1	Case study from Wales, UK	284
10.8.2	Case study of a mining HIA from the Democratic Republic of the Congo	285
10.9	Some characteristics of mining proposals	286
10.10	References	288
Chapter 11 Housing and spatial planning		291
11.1	Introduction	291
11.1.1	WHO Healthy Cities	291
11.1.2	Healthy development measurement tool	292
11.1.3	England	293
11.2	Spatial planning in England	293
11.2.1	Local development frameworks and HIA	295
11.3	Case study: Mixed residential development	296
11.3.1	Active travel example	300
11.4	Case study: Social housing refurbishment	301
11.4.1	Summary of the proposal	302
11.4.2	The association between housing regeneration and health	303
11.4.3	Profile of the community	304
11.4.4	Analysis of refurbishment	304
11.4.5	Recommendations	305
11.5	Note	306
11.6	References	306
Chapter 12 Current and future challenges		311
12.1	Introduction	311
12.2	Ethics	311
12.2.1	Involuntary resettlement	313
12.2.2	Land clearance	313
12.2.3	Community engagement	313
12.3	Spiritual well-being	314
12.4	Effectiveness of HIA	316
12.4.1	EC effectiveness study	317
12.4.2	Chad–Cameroon pipeline case study	319

12.5	Analysis of potential catastrophes	320
12.6	Cumulative impacts	320
12.6.1	Local cumulative impacts	320
12.6.2	National cumulative impacts	321
12.6.3	Global cumulative impacts	322
12.7	Climate change	322
12.7.1	Co-benefits	325
12.8	Energy scarcity	326
12.8.1	Energy return on energy invested	327
12.8.2	Hubbert's Peak	327
12.8.3	The vicious spiral	329
12.8.4	Alternative sources of energy	329
12.8.5	The energy gap and its implications	329
12.8.6	Models of change	330
12.8.7	Associated issues	332
12.9	Conclusions	332
12.10	References	334
	<i>Sources of further information</i>	339
	<i>Glossary and acronyms</i>	343
	<i>Index</i>	355